

#285923 658 Edmund Ave - Q3 2023 Assessment Inquiry (Republic)- LH Hearing

Submitted	Received via	Requester
November 15, 2023 at 14:49	Voicemail	Hattie Ward <hattiebward53@gmail.com>

Status category	Ticket status	Priority	Group	Assignee
Open	Re-opened	Normal	PW - Garbage	Lydia Campbell

Assessment No.	Property ID Number	Do you need an interpreter?
230115	352923140103	No

Hauler Response Over 24 hours	Date Hauler Replied to City's Message	Latitude/Longitude
Yes	December 4, 2023	-93.12801,44.95828

Location	Other Name	Garbage Hauler	Rescheduled LH Date:
658 Edmund Ave, St. Paul, Minnesota, 55104	Hattie Ward	Republic Services	01/18/2024

Have you contacted your hauler about this garbage bill before?

No

Staff Comments

This overdue bill is from Q3 2024. The PO agrees that the garbage bill was not paid. The baseline overdue garbage bill for service alone is \$267.66, which covers 2 - 96 gal containers (duplex), plus late fees. The contested charge is for extra bags that PO allegedly set out next to, and overflowing from, their trash carts the quarter prior (Q2). It is acceptable for the hauler to add charges for extras from the previous quarter onto the bill. The disagreement is about the number of bags.

PO is stating that no extra bags were set out for collection in Q2. PO rents the property and agrees that there was a litter issue at the property. They rented a dumpster to clean it up. PO is stating that all extra garbage bags and litter were put in the dumpster.

Republic Services provided a week by week list with a count of bags that they recorded the each week. The total is 70. However, in the photos they provided, only 54 bags are visible during Q2.

Billing year for Delinquent Garbage Bill Assessment	Date City Staff Sent Message to Hauler
2023	November 29, 2023

Date of CP (MM/DD/YYYY)	Total amount due for Delinquent Garbage Bill Assessment
03/13/2024	589.59

Legislative Hearing Required	Other Telephone	Date of LH (MM/DD/YYYY)
Yes	15623268649	01/11/2024

Other Email	Stated Reason for Appeal (if given)
hattiebward53@gmail.com	Paid in August

Did you receive a Saint Paul City Council Public Hearing Notice Ratification of Assessment?

Yes

Garbage Invoice Dates (i.e. January 1- March 31)

July 1 - September 30

Billing period for Delinquent Garbage Bill Assessment	Time of LH
Quarter 3 (July - September)	11:00AM

Hattie Ward November 15, 2023 at 14:49

Voicemail from +1 (562) 326-8649

Call Details

Call from: +1 (562) 326-8649

Call to: +1 (651) 413-6624

Internal note

Time of call: 2023-11-15 20:47:59 UTC
Location: Santa fe springs, California, United States
Length of phone call: 1 minute, 48 seconds

Transcription

Emma, do you have any problem? 658. Edmond avenue by 5, minnesota, 551045623268649.

Elizabeth Walsh November 15, 2023 at 16:47

Internal note

Outbound call to +1 (562) 326-8649

Call Details

Call from: +1 (651) 413-6624
Call to: +1 (562) 326-8649
Time of call: 2023-11-15 22:42:35 UTC
Called by: Elizabeth Walsh
Length of phone call: 5 minutes, 6 seconds

Elizabeth Walsh November 15, 2023 at 16:49

Internal note

PO believes they paid the bill in August. Staff told PO to send proof of payment so that the assessment staff can review.

Elizabeth Walsh November 15, 2023 at 16:50

Dear Hattie,

Thank you for contacting the city regarding your pending assessment for 658 Edmund Ave, St. Paul, Minnesota, 55104. You stated that you have already made the payment to the hauler and would like to have the assessment removed.

Please reply to this email with proof of payment for your garbage bill for billing period quarter 3 2023. You can submit a bank statement, receipt, or account ledger with Republic. Make sure that the date, amount, and Republic Services are all visible in the image. You can send a picture, screenshot, or file and attach it to your email reply.

Account and credit card information should be removed or blacked out on statement before submitting.

Elizabeth

City of Saint Paul
Public Works - Solid Waste
651-266-6101

Hattie Ward November 16, 2023 at 08:21

Good Morning,

I attached screenshots from my bank account showing proof of payment.

5:02



Sign off

EVERYDAY CHECKING ...0311

\$27,680.83

Available balance ⓘ



Search by keyword



08/18/2023

\$100.00

**ATM WITHDRAWAL AUTHORIZED ON
08/18 1625 S ALAMEDA ST
COMPTON CA 0001988 ATM ID 1164K
CARD 2364**



08/18/2023

\$15.90

**PURCHASE AUTHORIZED ON 08/17
CITY OF ST PAUL AS 678-7315516 TN
S383229603124535 CARD 2364**



08/18/2023

\$638.72



**PURCHASE AUTHORIZED ON 08/17
CITY OF SAINT PAUL 651-2668858
MN S303229603118578 CARD 2364**



08/18/2023

\$2.99

**RECURRING PAYMENT AUTHORIZED ON
08/17 APPLE.COM/BILL 866-712-7753
CA S383229403757773 CARD 2364**



08/18/2023

+\$52.75

CARD FINAL CREDIT 10817232633



8:18



Sign off

Transaction details

\$638.73

Transaction: 08/18/2023

Posted: 08/18/2023

Merchant info

6512668858, MN 551021634

Additional info

Method

Card # Entered by Customer/Merchant

Category

Federal Tax

Transaction description

PURCHASE AUTHORIZED ON 08/17 CITY OF SAINT PAUL 651-2668858 MN S303229603118578 CARD 2364



Lydia Campbell November 17, 2023 at 15:29

Hattie,

Thank you for the reply with follow-up information. Unfortunately, what you sent isn't showing me the details that I need for recommending removal of this assessment charge. These screenshots show details for payments that you made to the City of Saint Paul in August. Perhaps these were for the delinquent garbage bill that you owed from April - June 2023?

For proof of payment, the recipient of the payment needs to be clearly shown as Republic Services.

Thank you,

City of Saint Paul
Public Works - Solid Waste
651-266-6101

Hattie Ward November 21, 2023 at 17:30

I have not heard anything yet.

Hattie Ward November 21, 2023 at 17:32

Ok look that is for the the city of St. Paul trash y'all phone is on there so I don't know what else y'all want to do about this matter but it has to be taking care of ASAP!!!!

Hattie Ward November 21, 2023 at 17:35

So Lydia I need you to tell me what you need from me your number is on there you know what call me 562-326-8549 Hattie Thanks will be waiting on your call Thanks

Lydia Campbell November 22, 2023 at 10:52

Hattie,

I likely won't have time for a call today, so I have outlined the details as clearly as possible below.

In the City of Saint Paul, garbage services are in paid in advance to the hauler on a quarterly basis. They are due on the 25th day of the first month of the quarter. If they are not paid by the last day of the last month of the quarter-- the City pays the bill on your behalf. Your garbage bills have not been paid to the hauler for all of 2023. The City paid all of them on your behalf, so now you owe the City. When the City asks for payment, it is called an assessment.

Jan-Mar: Due Jan 25 -- UNPAID -- Sent to City for payment Mar 31 -- TOTAL: \$404.65 -- You paid the City.
Apr-Jun: Due Apr 25 -- UNPAID -- Sent to City for payment Jun 30 -- TOTAL: \$446.05 -- You paid the City.
Jul-Sep: Due Jul 25 -- UNPAID -- Sent to City for payment Sep 30 -- TOTAL: \$589.59 -- City has NOT been paid.
Oct-Dec: Due Oct 25 -- ASK HAULER ABOUT PAYMENT.

The screenshots you sent me clearly showed that you paid THE CITY in August. Those payments were applied toward the assessments you owed for Jan-Mar and/or Apr-Jun. The current, pending, unpaid assessment that you owe THE CITY is for JUL-SEP.

Unless you can show me proof that you paid REPUBLIC SERVICES sometime between JUL-SEP, you are responsible for paying the assessment to the City.

Let me know if you have additional questions and someone will call you after the holiday break.

Thank you,

Lydia

City of Saint Paul
Public Works - Solid Waste
651-266-6101

Emily Torralba November 27, 2023 at 13:35

Internal note

PO called back on 11/27/2023 and stated that they did pay for Jul-Sept back on 08/18/2023 for 638.73 and is requesting a called back because they stated this was paid already.

Sarah Haas November 28, 2023 at 18:43

Internal note

Outbound call to +1 (562) 326-8649

Call Details

Call from: +1 (651) 413-6624

Call to: +1 (562) 326-8649

Time of call: 2023-11-29 00:31:30 UTC

Called by: Sarah Haas

Length of phone call: 12 minutes, 5 seconds

Sarah Haas December 4, 2023 at 15:25

Internal note

Outbound call to +1 (562) 326-8649

Call Details

Call from: +1 (651) 413-6624

Call to: +1 (562) 326-8649

Time of call: 2023-12-04 21:20:16 UTC

Called by: Sarah Haas

Length of phone call: 4 minutes, 55 seconds

Lydia Campbell January 3, 2024 at 10:15

Internal note

Outbound call to +1 (562) 326-8649

Call Details

Call from: +1 (651) 413-6624

Call to: +1 (562) 326-8649

Time of call: 2024-01-03 15:59:13 UTC

Called by: Lydia Campbell

Length of phone call: 16 minutes, 6 seconds

Lydia Campbell January 3, 2024 at 10:15

Internal note

PO called back wanting to know the status of this issue. I emailed Greg again letting him know that we haven't received the photos. PO is stating that ALL of the bags of trash/illegal dumping were disposed of in a dumpster that she rented. She states that they hauler is not the one that disposed of them.

Lydia Campbell January 3, 2024 at 10:32

Good Morning Hattie,

Here is a summary of what we discussed on the phone.

We are still waiting on photos from the hauler, Republic Services, that they claim to have showing proof that they picked up 70 extra bags for you. This is the cost that they applied to your Quarter 3 (July - September) bill. We have asked them to provide these photos to us by 5pm today.

If they do not provide this proof, I will be recommending removal of the extra charges. This would leave you with a balance of \$239.78 owed to the city. That is a reduction of \$349.81 from the original assessment.

If the hauler provides proof, I will be in touch with next steps. If I am unable to recommend the reduction for the assessment, you may attend the hearing to speak for yourself. You can do so by phone.

Either way, his pending assessment for Jul-Sep 2023 will go to a legislative hearing next week, January 11, 2024. At that time, a hearing officer will decide whether or not to approve the request, then make the same recommendation to City Council.

In the meantime, there is no need to pay the assessment. Let me know if you have any questions.

Thank you,

Lydia

City of Saint Paul
Public Works - Solid Waste
651-266-6101

Lydia Campbell January 3, 2024 at 16:26

Hattie,

Here are the photos from Republic Services. I am seeing 54 total bags between April-June. At this time I am planning to recommend a reduction in the bill for the cost of 16 bags. I will update you tomorrow with more details.

Let me know if you have any questions or comments in the meantime.

Lydia

Lydia Campbell January 9, 2024 at 20:39

Hattie,

I'm emailing to remind you that this Thursday, you will receive a phone call from the City in regards to your pending assessments at 658 Edmund Ave for an overdue garbage bill for Quarter 3 (July-September). **You will be called between around 11AM.** Please have your phone near and be ready to explain your situation and why you believe you should not owe the charge.

When I counted the bags in the photos that Republic Services shared, I counted 54. However, they wrote out a week by week summary stating how many bags they are claiming were collected as extra garbage throughout April-June and the total is 70.

Because this issue is divided and the evidence does not match, I am going to leave the decision of removing, reducing, or not changing the assessment up to the legislative hearing officer.

Thank you,

Lydia

Lydia Campbell January 9, 2024 at 21:13

Internal note

This overdue bill is from Q3 2024. The PO agrees that the garbage bill was not paid. The baseline overdue garbage bill for service alone is \$267.66, which covers 2 - 96 gal containers (duplex), plus late fees. The contested charge is for extra bags that PO allegedly set out next to, and overflowing from, their trash carts the quarter prior (Q2). It is acceptable for the hauler to add charges for extras from the previous quarter onto the bill. The disagreement is about the number of bags.

PO is stating that no extra bags were set out for collection in Q2. PO rents the property and agrees that there was a litter issue at the property. They rented a dumpster to clean it up. PO is stating that all extra garbage bags and litter were put in the dumpster.

Republic Services provided a week by week list with a count of bags that they recorded the each week. The total is 70. However, in the photos they provided, only 54 bags are visible during Q2.

Support Software by **Zendesk**