



Legislation Details (With Text)

File #: Ord 19-1 **Version:** 2

Type: Ordinance **Status:** Failed

In control: City Council

Final action: 6/5/2019

Title: Amending Chapter 74 of the Legislative Code by enacting a new section designating St. Andrew's Church as a Saint Paul Heritage Preservation Site.

Sponsors: Amy Brendmoen

Indexes: Historic Preservation

Code sections: Sec. 73.04. - Powers and duties of the commission., Sec. 73.05. - Designation of heritage preservation sites., Sec. 73.09. - Recording of heritage preservation sites.

Attachments: 1. St. Andrew's Church Designation Form, 2. St. Andrew's Church HPC Designation Staff Report 11-5-18, 3. St. Andrew's HPC packet 11-5-18, 4. St. Andrew's HPC written testimony received between 10-26 and 11-5-18, 5. St. Andrew's HPC minutes 11-5-18, 6. St. Andrew's SHPO Review 2019-0487 12-11-18, 7. St. Andrew's communication to CNPC-PC-staff kevin anderson, 8. St. Andrew's communications to CNPC-PC-staff TCGIS, 9. St. Andrew's SHSA - Planning Commission Concerns 12_18_18, 10. St Andrews Church Planning Commission Resolution 12-14-18, 11. St. Andrew's Preservation Program CC Draft 1-16-19, 12. St. Andrew's proposed Local Heritage Preservation Site Boundaries, 13. St. Andrew's NRHP Eligibility SHPO letter - 3.21.19, 14. St. Andrew's Eligible for NRHP SHSA Press Release, 15. Friends of Warrendale-SHSA letters of support 1, 16. Friends of Warrendale-SHSA letters of support 2, 17. Friends of Warrendale-SHSA letters of support 3, 18. Friends of Warrendale-SHSA letters of support 4, 19. Friends of Warrendale-SHSA letters of support 5, 20. Friends of Warrendale-SHSA letters of support 6, 21. Friends of Warrendale-SHSA letters of support 7, 22. Briggs Letter obo TCGIS 05-10-19, 23. SHSA to City Council, 24. Comment rec'd by Council re HPC St. Andrew's Designation, 25. Comment 2 rec'd by Council re HPC St. Andrew's Designation, 26. St. Andrew's CC testimony from PED 5-15-19, 27. Comment 3 rec'd by Council re HPC St. Andrew's Designation, 28. Briggs and Morgan 2019 05 20 Letter to City Councilmembers, 29. CP Brendmoen email 05-22-19, 30. Comment 4 rec'd by Council re HPC St. Andrew's Designation, 31. Comment 5 rec'd by Council re HPC St. Andrew's Designation

Date	Ver.	Action By	Action	Result
6/5/2019	2	City Council	Adopted	Fail
5/22/2019	2	City Council	Laid Over to Final Adoption	Pass
5/15/2019	2	City Council	Public Hearing Closed; Laid Over to Fourth Reading/Final Adoption	Pass
5/8/2019	2	City Council	Laid Over to Third Reading/Public Hearing	
5/1/2019	2	City Council	Laid Over to Second Reading	

Amending Chapter 74 of the Legislative Code by enacting a new section designating St. Andrew's Church as a Saint Paul Heritage Preservation Site.

WHEREAS, on October 1, 2018, HPC staff received a nomination form from Save Historic Saint Andrews, LLC that was prepared by local architectural historians for the designation of St. Andrew's Church as a Saint Paul Heritage Preservation Site; and

WHEREAS, Heritage Preservation staff reviewed the nomination form and determined it was complete and scheduled the nomination for a public hearing before the Heritage Preservation Commission ("HPC")

to determine whether St. Andrew's Church met the criteria for designation under Leg. Code § 73.05(a); and

WHEREAS, pursuant to Minnesota Statutes § 471.193 and Legislative Code § 73.04(3), the HPC initiated the process to designate St. Andrew's Church, at 1031-1051 Como Avenue, as a Saint Paul Heritage Preservation Site; and

WHEREAS, on November 5, 2018, the HPC, having provided notice to affected property owners within 100 feet of the subject address, published notice in a newspaper of general circulation, and posted the agenda to the city website and the City's Early Notification System, duly conducted a public hearing on the St. Andrew's Church nomination where all interested parties were given an opportunity to be heard and based upon all the testimony and the records received, the HPC found that St. Andrew's Church met the criteria for designation under Leg. Code § 73.05(a)(1, 4, 5, and 7) as set forth in HPC Resolution No. 19-01 which are incorporated herein by reference; and

WHEREAS, the HPC pursuant to Leg. Code § 73.05(b) advised the Planning Commission of the proposed designation along with proposed boundaries, and program for preservation; and

WHEREAS, on December 14, 2018, the HPC pursuant to Leg. Code § 73.05(b), secured a recommendation from the Planning Commission with respect to the relationship of the proposed heritage preservation site designation to the City's comprehensive plan, the Commission's opinion as to the effect of the proposed designation upon the surrounding neighborhood, and the Commission's opinion and recommendation as to any other planning consideration which may be relevant to the proposed designation; and

WHEREAS, the Planning Commission found the proposed designation to be consistent with comprehensive plan policies contained in the plan's Heritage Preservation Chapter at HP 3.11, 3.12, and 4.3 as well as and policies HLU 4.1 and 4.1.8 of the Como Community Council Plan but not consistent with policy LU 1.55 of the plan's Land Use Chapter and, accordingly, voted against recommending the designation of St. Andrew's Church, as set forth in Planning Commission Resolution No. 19-01, which is based upon the report of the Commission's staff under Zoning File #18-132-440 dated December 27, 2018, both of which are incorporated herein by reference; and

WHEREAS, the HPC, pursuant to Minnesota Statutes § 471.193, Subd. 6 and Leg. Code § 73.05(c), provided copies of the proposed designation, boundaries, and program for preservation to the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) for review and comment; and

WHEREAS, on December 11, 2018 the SHPO commented that "We concur that St. Andrew's Church is an ideal candidate for local designation" and, regarding the program for preservation, "The proposed preservation program for St. Andrew's Church will help establish a desired and consistent level of quality and aesthetics for the character-defining features of the historic building"; and

WHEREAS, on January 14, 2019, having provided notice to affected property owners within 100 feet of the subject address, published notice in a newspaper of general circulation, and posted the agenda to the city website and the City's Early Notification System, the HPC, pursuant to Leg. Code § 73.05(e), conducted a second public hearing to consider the proposed boundaries and program for preservation of St. Andrew's Church where all interested parties, including the applicant and owner, were given an opportunity to be heard, and upon the close of the public hearing and following discussion of the matter, the HPC, based upon the testimony received and the report of staff, determined pursuant to Leg. Code § 73.05(e) that St. Andrew's Church is eligible for designation as a Saint Paul Heritage Preservation site based upon the eligibility criteria set forth under Leg. Code § 73.05(a) and, accordingly, proposed

boundaries for a St. Andrew's Church Heritage Preservation Site, proposed a program for preservation for the Site and duly moved to recommend to the City Council for all the reasons set forth in HPC Resolution No. 19-01 that a new section entitled St. Andrew's Church Heritage Preservation Site and Program for Preservation be added to the Legislative Code at § 74.10 which is presently reserved; and

WHEREAS, on March 20, 2019, pursuant to Leg. Code § 73.05(f), the Council of the City of Saint Paul duly conducted a public hearing, having provided notice to affected property owners within 100 feet of the subject address, published notice in a newspaper of general circulation, and posted the agenda to the city website and the City's Early Notification System, pursuant to Leg. Code § 73.05(e), at which time all interested parties were given an opportunity to be heard; and

WHEREAS, the City Council, having considered all the facts and testimony, including the recommendations of the planning commission and the HPC report, hereby finds that creating and designating a St. Andrew's Church Heritage Preservation Site and Program for Preservation is a public necessity required in the interests of the health, prosperity, safety and welfare of the citizens of Saint Paul by fulfilling the public policies set forth under Leg. Code § 73.01(1-5) and in so designating the St. Andrew's Church Heritage Preservation Site and Program for Preservation the Council hereby adopts as its formal statement of legislative reasons for creating and designating the St. Andrew's Church Heritage Preservation Site and Program for Preservation, the reasoning set forth in HPC Resolution No.19-01; now, therefore

THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF SAINT PAUL DOES ORDAIN:

That Legislative Code Chapter 74, entitled "Heritage Preservation Districts and Programs," is hereby amended by the addition of the following new section to be numbered "Article VII, Section 74.113" and entitled "St. Andrew's Church Heritage Preservation District" which shall read as follows:

SECTION 1

Sec. 74.113. Statement of Legislative Findings. The Council of the City of Saint Paul hereby finds that the former St. Andrew's Church, located at 1031-1051 Como Avenue, based upon the all the records, reports and testimony received and the recommendation of the Heritage Preservation Commission, meets the following criteria for designation as a Saint Paul Heritage Preservation District under Legislative Code § 73.05(a):

(a) Sec. 73.05(a)(1). St. Andrew's Church contributes to and is part of the character, interest and value as part of the development and heritage of the City of Saint Paul. The architectural style of the church along with its architectural, cultural and social value to the to the Warrendale neighborhood, former parishioners, as well as its location and presence in the development of the neighborhood between the two world wars supports its value and importance to the City of Saint Paul.

(b) Sec. 73.05(a)(4). St. Andrew's Church retains the distinguishing characteristics of a Romanesque Revival Style Church in a northern Italy/southern France vocabulary with colorful Byzantine ornament and complex design. It retains architectural integrity.

(c) Sec. 73.05(a)(5). St. Andrew's Church was designed by architect, Charles A. Hausler who was the first city architect for Saint Paul. Hauslers architectural designs, include the Minnesota Building, the Minnesota Milk Company building, the St. Anthony Park, Riverview and Arlington Hills Carnegie Libraries, Riverview Commercial Club (razed), among dozens of other building in the city. His work has influenced the development of and in the City of Saint Paul.

(d) **Sec. 73.05(a)(7).** The Warrendale neighborhood has a unique layout designed by H.W.S. Cleveland, as it is not a grid, but a curvilinear plan and St. Andrew's Church is sited in a unique location within the plat. St. Andrew's Church is a singular physical characteristic and an established and familiar visual feature of the Warrendale neighborhood.

Saint Andrew's Church is significant under criteria (1), (4), (5) and (7) of Section 73.05 (a) of the Legislative Code.

Sec. 74.113.1. Preservation Program. The preservation program for this heritage preservation district shall be as follows:

St. Andrew's Church Heritage Preservation District Preservation Program

A. Introduction. The City's Legislative Code, Chapter 73 creates the Saint Paul Heritage Preservation Commission and grants powers and duties that include the review of city permits for work at designated sites and districts. Specifically, §73.04(4) states the commission shall protect the architectural character of heritage preservation sites through review and approval or denial of applications for city permits. The following guidelines for design review will serve as the basis for the Heritage Preservation Commission's design review decisions for St. Andrew's Church. The guidelines define the most important elements of the Site's unique physical appearance and state the best means of preserving and enhancing these elements in rehabilitation. Their purpose is to assure that design review will be based on clear standards rather than the tastes or opinions of individual commission members. When applying the guidelines, the Commission, in clearly defined cases of economic hardship, will also consider deprivation of the owner's reasonable use of property. Decisions of the Heritage Preservation Commission are subject to appeal to the City Council (§73.06(h)).

B. General Intent. The City of Saint Paul, a Certified Local Government in the National Historic Preservation Program, has agreed to conduct its design review of locally designated heritage preservation sites and districts according to the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties (2017) (The Standards)*. The Standards are codified in 36 CFR Part 68 and are applied to projects in a reasonable manner, taking into consideration economic and technical feasibility. *The Standards* provide general information to determine appropriate treatments for historic properties. They are intentionally broad in scope in order to apply to a wide range of circumstances. The Standards have been designed to enhance the understanding of basic preservation principals and may be applied to one historic resource or a variety of historic resource types such as Districts, Sites, Buildings, Structures, and Objects. The Standards identifies four primary treatments: preservation, rehabilitation, restoration, and reconstruction.

Preservation is defined as the act or process of applying measures necessary to sustain the existing form, integrity, and materials of an historic property. Work, including preliminary measures to protect and stabilize the property, generally focuses upon the ongoing maintenance and repair of historic materials and features rather than extensive replacement and new construction. The limited and sensitive upgrading of mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems and other code-required work to make properties functional is appropriate within a preservation project. However, new exterior additions are not within the scope of this treatment. The Standards for Preservation require retention of the greatest amount of historic fabric along with the building's historic form.

Rehabilitation is defined as the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features which convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values. The Rehabilitation Standards acknowledge the need to alter or add to a historic building to meet continuing or new uses while retaining the building's historic character.

Restoration is defined as the act or process of accurately depicting the form, features, and character of a property as it appeared at a particular period of time by means of the removal of features from other

periods in its history and reconstruction of missing features from the restoration period. The limited and sensitive upgrading of mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems and other code-required work to make properties functional is appropriate within a restoration project. The Restoration Standards allow for the depiction of a building at a particular time in its history by preserving materials, features, finishes, and spaces from its period of significance and removing those from other periods.

Reconstruction is defined as the act or process of depicting, by means of new construction, the form, features, and detailing of a non-surviving site, landscape, building, structure, or object for the purpose of replicating its appearance at a specific period of time and in its historic location. The Reconstruction Standards establish a limited framework for recreating a vanished or non-surviving building with new materials, primarily for interpretive purposes.

Although there are components that may include restoration and preservation treatments, it is the Standards for Rehabilitation that is emphasized when reviewing proposals. The ten Standards for Rehabilitation are:

1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.
2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.
4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.
5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.
6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.
7. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.
8. Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.
9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

C. Description

1. **Boundaries and Sites:** *St. Andrew's Church*: 1031-1051 Como Avenue West, Inventory # RA-SPC-0709 All of Lots 12 thru 14 Block 4 of Warrendale

D. Guidelines for Repair and Rehabilitation of Sites

Although the ways we use buildings have changed over the years, we can still appreciate the historical and visual values that historic buildings present. To ensure that subsequent generations can also appreciate them, the goals of rehabilitation and repair of historic buildings are twofold. The first is to maintain the appearance of age (patina). The second is to maintain the authenticity of the historic building and its materials and design.

1. **Limestone and Brick Masonry.** Limestone is a product of natural forces and varies in its physical properties. All limestones contain calcium carbonate but vary in the amount of calcium magnesium carbonate (dolomitic limestones), clay minerals (argillaceous limestones), or other minerals they contain. Natural variation can lead to stones that appear similar but differ significantly in actual composition. Traditionally, the term brick refers to a unit composed of clay. The durability of a brick depends on its composition and the manufacturing process used. Fired bricks are a long-lasting and durable building material.

Even if aggressive treatments have been successful on other masonry surfaces, for limestone they should be used only in cases of extreme need. Also, water will slowly dissolve limestone. Treatments which seal the surface can trap water inside the limestone and lead to its dissolution and should not be used.

- (a) **Cleaning:** Limestone and other masonry should be cleaned only when necessary to halt deterioration or to remove graffiti. Cleaning should never be undertaken if freezing temperatures are expected within two (2) weeks of the cleaning. Cleaning should always start with the gentlest method possible; unpressured water and soft, natural or plastic bristle brushes.

Only if more gentle methods do not work, low pressure water can be considered to remove problem stains. This type of cleaning should be used sparingly and very carefully. The pressure should be low (under 300 psi), and wide-angle (35- and 45-degree) nozzle tips should be used. The nozzle should be kept a minimum of 36 inches from the surface of the masonry.

If detergents are necessary, water soluble, non-ionic cleaners are preferred because they rarely have chemical interactions with masonry. Chemical cleaners should be a method of last resort, and they should not be used except for removing oil or solvent stains. Corrosion stains (rust, verdigris, etc.) should be removed with a product specifically designed for the stain. Acid-based cleaners should never be used because they dissolve limestone. Muriatic (hydrochloric) acid, other mortar removers, and many "restoration" masonry cleaners contain acid and must not be used on or near limestone. Brick and stone surfaces shall not be sandblasted with dry or wet grit, ice, soda, slag or other abrasives. Abrasive cleaning methods generally erode the surface of the material, which will

alter the appearance and can increase the speed of decomposition.

- (b) Paint and Whitewash:** Limestone masonry is usually a durable exterior material, but there are cases where masons historically covered soft stones and bricks with sacrificial coatings to improve their durability. Masonry that has not been painted or whitewashed should not be painted. If the masonry coating existed historically, this coating should be maintained or re-applied.

Whitewash, limewash, color wash and mineral paints are a class of materials that are designed to be used on masonry. They also do not inhibit the evaporation of water vapor from the masonry. If masonry was historically painted with one of these materials, then it should be maintained with the coating. Whitewashes, limewashes, and color washes are inexpensive and easily removed if necessary. However, they require frequent (every 1-5 years) reapplication. Mineral paints are expensive and difficult to remove, but durable.

Paints, historically, were made of oils that dried through oxidation. They limited the evaporation of water from the masonry and altered its color even after the paint was gone. The vast majority of current paints are made from latex polymers that trap water inside masonry. Because they can cause problems with moisture, paint should not be applied to masonry unless it is required to solve a specific technical problem that has been studied and identified and determined to comply with applicable design guidelines.

The removal of paint or other coatings from masonry surfaces should only be attempted if unpainted surfaces are historically appropriate and if removal can be accomplished without damage to the masonry. An appropriate paint removal product, specifically for the removal of graffiti, shall be applied on inconspicuously sited test areas to determine its effect on the masonry and its effectiveness in removing the paint.

- (c) Stucco:** Stucco, also known as parging or rendering, is basically a thin coat of mortar applied to the exterior of masonry. Historically, it was used as a sacrificial coating or for improving the exterior appearance of rubble masonry. Stonework that was historically visible should not be stuccoed. Existing stucco should be maintained by periodic re-application or covering with a thinner sacrificial coating (see whitewash above). If necessary, new stuccos should not contain latex or other non-mineral ingredients and should be as vapor permeable as possible (type O or softer) to encourage water vapor to evaporate from the masonry. New stucco shall match historic applications in color and texture and should not alter the profile of openings and details. Skim coats should not alter openings or other details, such as architraves, belt courses, quoins etc. The addition or repair of stucco should be performed by experienced professionals using craftsmanship similar to the levels described in the guides described in repointing (below).
- (d) Other Coatings:** Chemical coatings can accelerate deterioration of the masonry and are frequently expensive and / or unnecessary. Waterproof or water repellent coatings or surface consolidation treatments should not be applied unless required to solve a specific technical problem that has been studied and identified and determined to comply with applicable design guidelines. In rare cases where a consolidant or paint coating is determined to be historically and structurally appropriate, the color and finish is subject to review.
- (e) Repair:** Limestone and brick are usually durable materials, but all masonry systems need periodic maintenance. Unpredictable events can lead to damage to the masonry systems. These situations will require some repair. For any repair, original masonry and mortar shall be retained whenever possible without the application of any surface treatment.

Repointing (tuckpointing) is periodic maintenance for exterior masonry that is usually performed on a 50-year cycle for exposed joints and much less frequently for protected joints. Repointing should only be done on areas that need repair. Usually, this is on those mortar joints where mortar is missing to a depth that is at least equal to the width of the joint, or the mortar has completely detached from the masonry units. Any repointing work should be done by experienced professionals and should conform to standards of craftsmanship laid out in guides to repointing.

Deteriorated or damaged mortar, when necessary, shall be repaired or replaced with a flexible mortar that maintains a good bond with the masonry but allow the exit of water vapor from the core of the wall. This is usually a type O or softer, but a type N can be used in cases of durable masonry. New mortar joints should resemble the original in size, shape, color, texture and profile, if known. New mortar joints should be flat and minimally recessed if the original joint profile is not known.

Deteriorated masonry should be maintained unless it has lost more than two inches of its exterior face or can no longer bear weight. The deteriorated masonry and all surrounding mortar should be carefully removed so that the new stone or brick fits in the same area and the new mortar bonds to the surrounding masonry. Replacement stone and brick should match that removed stone in size, color, texture, profile and veining.

- (f) Insulating Historic Masonry Walls:** Current standards for comfort and energy efficiency often require improving the thermal performance of the exterior envelope of a building. However, contemporary insulation can damage a solid masonry wall because of the potential of interstitial condensation. Usually, it is simpler to find efficiency gains in other parts of the building envelope, such as the addition of storm windows or attic insulation (see Energy Efficiency below). The addition of insulation to solid masonry should be used only as a last resort. Plaster and lath interior walls have effective insulation in the form of an air gap behind, and they should be maintained. Any new insulation system should be vapor-permeable in both directions and should not use steel studs. No vapor barriers should be added, and the insulation should allow the movement of moisture. Because they are vapor barriers, spray foam insulations, polystyrene boards (Styrofoam), foil-backed bats or boards, asphalt-paper-backed bats or boards, and polyethylene sheets should not be used.
- (g) Resources:** The following National Park Service publications contain more detailed information about masonry.

Preservation Brief #1: The Cleaning and Waterproof Coating of Masonry Buildings.

Preservation Brief #2: Repointing Mortar Joints in Historic Brick Buildings.

Preservation Brief #6: Dangers of Abrasive Cleaning to Historic Buildings.

Preservation Brief #22: The Preservation and Repair of Historic Stucco.

Preservation Brief #39: Holding the Line: Controlling Unwanted Moisture in Historic Buildings.

- 2. Siding, Shingles and Tiles.** Historic brick and stone buildings may have areas of siding or shingles, decorative tiles or there may be additions on the building that are historically significant. Historic wood, metal and fired-clay materials are of equal importance as masonry and should be treated accordingly.

- (a) **Repair:** Original wood and metal siding, shingles and tiles should be retained whenever possible without the application of any surface treatment. A similar material should be used to repair or replace, where necessary. New siding, shingles and tiles added to the structure or site should be compatible with the material, color, texture, size, design, and arrangement of the original materials.

- (b) **Vinyl, Aluminum and Composite Materials:** Avoid covering architectural features with new materials that are inappropriate to the historic nature of the building, including vinyl, aluminum, hard-board siding or panels, stucco, artificial stone or brick veneer, and/or vinyl or aluminum siding.

- (c) **Decorative Siding Treatments:** Wooden shingles used for cladding material or decoration, such as in the gable ends, shall be conserved and retained. If replacement is necessary, shingles should replicate the original in material, width, pattern, thickness, profile, texture and weather (lap). Decorative siding treatments, such as paneled patterns used in the gable ends, on bays or around openings shall be retained and repaired. If replacement is necessary, the new shall match in material, size, pattern, profile and texture.

- (d) **Painting:** Wood shingles or siding may have been painted or whitewashed for practical and aesthetic reasons. Paint should not be indiscriminately removed from wooden surfaces as this may subject the building to damage and change its appearance. Exterior wooden surfaces shall be maintained with appropriate paint or stain. Color is a significant design element and exterior paint colors should be appropriate to the period and style of the historic building. Building permits are not required for painting, and although the Heritage Preservation Commission may review and comment on paint color, paint color is not subject to Heritage Preservation Commission approval.

- (e) **Resources:** The following National Park Service publications contain more detailed information about wood.

Preservation Brief #9: The Repair of Historic Wood Windows.

Preservation Brief #10: Exterior Paint and Problems on Historic Woodwork.

Preservation Brief #17: Identifying the Visual Aspects of Historic Buildings as an Aid to Preserving Their Character.

Preservation Brief #32: Making Historic Properties Accessible.

Preservation Brief #37: Appropriate Methods for Reducing Lead-Paint Hazards in Historic Housing.

Preservation Brief #39: Holding the Line: Controlling Unwanted Moisture in Historic Buildings.

- 3. **Roofs, Chimneys, Cornices and Parapets.** The roof of any building is a critical part of keeping water out of the walls. The roof, detailing, and water conveyance systems (gutters, downspouts, etc.) should be checked annually and repaired immediately if any problems occur.

- (a) **Roof Structure:** The historic structure of a roof for masonry buildings must be maintained. Truss roofs must not be replaced with rafter roofs, and any horizontal roof members, including tension rods, must not be removed. Masonry walls are weak in tension, and the horizontal thrust of rafters

can distort and collapse walls unless the walls are designed to counter the forces.

- (b) Roof Shape:** The original roof type, slope, overhangs and architectural details shall be preserved. The size, shape and original roof features such as towers, dormers, cupolas and parapets shall also be preserved. New roof features may be acceptable if compatible with the original design and not conspicuously located.
- (c) Materials:** Original roofing material should be retained if possible, otherwise it should be replaced with new material that matches the old in composition, size, shape, color, and texture. When partially re-roofing, deteriorated roof coverings should be replaced with new materials that match the original in composition, profile, size, shape, color and texture. When entirely re-roofing, new materials which differ to such an extent from the original in composition, size, shape, color or texture that the appearance of the building is altered shall not be used. The predominant roofing material on the church are multi-colored tiles.
- (d) Alterations:** The roof shape shall not be altered except to restore it to the original documented appearance. The addition of architecturally compatible elements like dormers may be considered by the HPC on a case-by-case basis. Documentation includes pictorial or physical evidence of the former appearance of the building.
- (e) Skylights:** New skylights and vents should be behind and below parapet level for flat roofs. Skylights and vents shall not be installed on principal elevations for sloped roofs. Modern skylights are a simple way to alter a roof to admit light and air without disrupting its plane surface. Skylights should be flat and as close to the roof plane as possible. They should not be placed on the front or highly visible roof planes.
- (f) Chimneys, Stovepipes and Smokestacks:** Chimneys and smokestacks should be preserved or restored to their original condition. In the absence of historical documentation on the original design, chimney design should be in keeping with the period and style of the building. New chimneys and stovepipes should not be installed on front roof planes.
- (g) Cornices, Parapets and Other Details:** All architectural features that give the roof its essential character should be preserved or replaced in kind. Similar material should be used to repair/replace deteriorating or missing architectural elements such as cornices, brackets, railings and chimneys, whenever possible. The same massing, proportions, scale and design theme as the original should be retained.
- (h) Resources:** The following National Park Service publications contain more detailed information about roofs.

Preservation Brief #4: Roofing for Historic Buildings.

Preservation Brief #19: The Repair and Replacement of Historic Wooden Shingle Roofs

Preservation Brief #29: The Repair, Replacement, and Maintenance of Historic Slate Roofs.

Preservation Brief #35: Understanding Old Buildings: The Process of Architectural Investigation.

4. Windows and Doors. Windows and doors are character defining architectural features of any building, and they establish the visual rhythm, balance and general character of the facades. Any alteration, including removal of moldings or changes in window and door size, style or type, can have a significant and often detrimental effect on the appearance of the building. It is important to note that in most cases, historic windows can be affordably repaired and made to perform as well as modern windows. Historic windows that are easily repairable are often replaced at greater cost because owners only contact companies that replace windows.

(a) Openings: Existing window and door openings should be retained. New window and door openings should not be introduced into principal or highly visible elevations. New openings may be acceptable on secondary or minimally visible elevations so long as they do not destroy or alter any architectural features and the size and placement is in keeping with the solid-to-void (wall-to-openings) ratio of the elevation. Enlarging or reducing window or door openings to fit stock window sash or new stock door sizes shall not be done.

(b) Panes, Sashes and Hardware: Historic windows should be preserved, and repair of historic windows shall be considered before replacement. If replacement is warranted, windows should be replaced in-kind. Window panes should be clear glass. Reflective, tinted, spandrel, or opaque glass is not permitted. The stylistic period or periods a building represents should be respected. Missing or irreparable windows should be replaced with new windows that match the original in material, size, general muntin and mullion proportion and configuration and reflective qualities of the glass. Replacement sash should not alter the setback relationship between window and wall. Heating and air conditioning units should not be installed in the window frames when the sash and frames may be damaged. Window installations should be considered only when all other viable heating and cooling systems would result in significant damage to historic materials. Window installations may be acceptable in secondary facades.

(c) Trim: Historic window casings and exterior trim should be retained wherever possible. If replacement is necessary, the original material and profile shall be replicated. Historic trim should not be covered with metal or synthetic coverings (wrapping or panning).

(d) Lintels, Arches, Pediments, Tympanums, Sculptural Panels, Surrounds and Sills: Lintels, sills, architraves, pediments and hoods are an important part of the design, structure and water protection of the window. They should be retained or repaired if possible. If repair is not feasible, then replacement elements should be crafted with the same materials, profiles, scales, details, and craftsmanship. Historic colors, if determined, and textures should be matched when repairing these elements.

(e) Storms and Screens: Storm windows and doors are an important first line in making a building energy efficient. They should be compatible with the character of the building and should not damage window and door frames, nor require removal of original windows and doors. Exterior storms should be appropriate in size and color and resemble historic wood storms. Combination storm windows should have wood frames or be painted to match trim colors. If combination metal storms are installed, they shall have a baked-enamel finish, be attached to the exterior (blind) stops, and have an exterior surface flush with the adjacent brick molds. Storm windows should resemble the inner window and should not have vertical or horizontal divisions which conflict with the divisions of the inner sash. Storms and screens should not pan or wrap the opening or casing.

(f) Shutters: Shutters were a feature of some historic buildings, and they functioned as climate control, security, and sometimes as windows. Exterior shutters should not be added to a building unless

there is evidence that they existed historically. Where appropriate, shutters should be, or appear to be, functional and should be mounted to the window casing. Shutters should be constructed of wood and should be simple (paneled wood) unless evidence proves otherwise.

(g) Security Measures: There are situations where visible security features for window and door openings are useful, but they should be installed so that they can be removed later with minimal damage to the historic building. Historic trim or other architectural features shall not be removed for the installation of security bars or grills. Interior shutters are a traditional option that sensitively add security and insulation to existing windows.

(h) Awnings and Canopies: Some historic buildings employed awnings for climate control, as a form of decoration and for signage. Awnings and canopies should not be used when they conceal richly detailed entries and windows. Aluminum or plastic awnings shall not be used. Surface design elements should not detract from or conflict with the related structure's age and design. Awnings should have a traditional shape such as a tent shape or be rounded when the opening is arched. Awnings should be used in a traditional application for shading window or door openings.

(i) Resources: The following National Park Service publications contain more detailed information about windows and doors.

Preservation Brief #3: Conserving Energy in Historic Buildings.

Preservation Brief #9: The Repair of Historic Wood Windows.

Preservation Brief #10: Exterior Paint and Problems on Historic Woodwork.

Preservation Brief #17: Identifying the Visual Aspects of Historic Buildings as an Aid to Preserving Their Character.

Preservation Brief #37: Appropriate Methods for Reducing Lead-Paint Hazards in Historic Housing.

5. Stairs, Railings and Landings. A broad set of stairs ascend to the main entrance of the building and extend across the full-width of the façade. Stairways to the basement level flank the front stairway. The stairs, railings and landings should be considered significant architectural features of the building and treated as such.

(a) Preservation: Stairs, railings and landings which are historic or appropriate to the building and its development should be retained. Stairs and approaches reflecting later styles of architecture are often important to the building's historical evolution and should be retained. Removing or altering the stairs, railings, and landings should be avoided. The treatment of historic materials should follow the guidelines for masonry.

(b) Reconstruction: If stairs and railings removed from the building are to be reconstructed, the new work must be based upon photographic documentation, physical evidence, and historical research. Simple designs should be used if evidence is lacking to avoid speculation. A professional can help create a design that is compatible in design and detail with the period and style of the building. In replacing railings, it is important to maintain the original spacing, design, section and profile of the balustrades.

(c) Decorative Features: Decorative architectural features such as cornices, brackets, and railings should be preserved. New material used to repair or replace, where necessary, deteriorated architectural features of masonry, iron, cast iron, terra-cotta and tile should match the original as closely as possible.

(d) Additions and Infill: If new materials must be added for necessity or compliance, the old materials should be preserved in place. Taller railings should be slim in profile and mounted behind existing balustrades. Infilling should be avoided, but infill panels should not displace or obscure porch

columns, knee walls, and balustrades. Deck and fire stair additions and new balconies may be acceptable in some cases but should be kept to the rear of buildings where they will be the most inconspicuous and detract the least from the historical context. The detailing of decks and exterior stairs should be compatible with the period and style of the building.

- (e) **Resources:** The following National Park Service publications contain more detailed information about porches.

Preservation Brief #17: Identifying the Visual Aspects of Historic Buildings as an Aid to Preserving Their Character.

Preservation Brief #32: Making Historic Properties Accessible.

6. **Fencing, Enclosures and Walls.** Many properties have small walls and other enclosures that are part of the historic fabric of the building site. Historic fencing and walls that are identified as contributing elements to the Site should be appropriately maintained and preserved and elements of walls should be treated as elements of historic buildings.

7. **Mechanical Systems.** Modern standards of comfort can require the installation of systems that could disrupt the visual and material integrity of a building. The installation of climate control systems should be carefully considered and designed by professionals.

- (a) **Location and Siting:** Mechanical related equipment should be sited in such a way that they do not obscure, alter or disrupt principal elevations and prominent views, especially on roof tops and primary facades. Mechanical related equipment that is sited on grade should be inconspicuously sited. In some cases, appropriate screening such as low hedges, may be necessary. Any equipment that must be attached to the exterior of a wall should be done in an unobtrusive location and into mortar joints only. If mechanical attachments, such as water or cooling line sets must cut through a historic masonry wall, the installation should damage as few stones or bricks as possible. It is preferable to extensively damage one stone than to moderately damage four stones. The installation of modern equipment should be carefully planned to avoid damage and removal of historic materials from the interior.

- (b) **Grills, Exhaust Fans, etc.:** Grills, vents, exhaust outlets for air conditioners, bath and kitchen exhaust fans should be incorporated into filler panels or exhausted through the roof, if possible. They may be painted the same color as the filler panel and should be as low in profile as possible.

- (c) **Resources:** The following National Park Service publications contain more detailed information about mechanical systems.

Preservation Brief #24: Heating, Ventilating, and Cooling Historic Buildings-Problems and Recommended Approaches.

8. **Sustainability.** The introduction of modern conveniences and comforts has required the addition of many electrical and fuel-burning mechanicals into historic properties. Historic construction will never function in the same way as contemporary construction, and some energy-efficiencies designed for contemporary construction will damage historic properties. Improving efficiency in historic properties should be performed with an overall plan; not piecemeal improvements without consideration for unintended consequences.

- (a) **Energy Audit and Planning:** Both the property owner and the property will be best served if an audit is performed to try and identify where inefficiencies exist in the building. The audit will identify which parts of the building are causing the most energy loss. It is the research that will give the owner the most return for a given investment, and it will also minimize the loss of historic fabric. A plan for step-by-step improvement is obtained by using preservation guidelines and the energy audit.

- (b) **Upgrading Building Performance:** Before altering historic materials, there are steps that can be taken to greatly increase system efficiency; from closing off rooms that are not in use to upgrading heating and cooling systems and other appliances. Upgrades that minimally alter the materials and

appearance of the building should be considered only if system improvements do not achieve significant savings. The following steps are minimally-invasive to the authenticity of the building and are less likely to damage historic fabric:

- (1) Reduce air leakage.
- (2) Add attic insulation.
- (3) Install storm windows.
- (4) Insulate basements and crawlspaces.
- (5) Seal and insulate ducts and pipes.
- (6) Weather strip doors and add storm doors.

Other, more invasive alterations should be avoided because they can alter or destroy the historic integrity of the building through removal of materials or long-term moisture problems.

(c) Solar: Consider on-site, solar technology only after implementing all appropriate treatments to improve energy efficiency of the building. Analyze whether solar technology can be used successfully and will benefit the historic building without compromising its character or the character of the site. Install solar in a compatible location on the site or on a non-historic building or addition where it will have minimal impact on the historic building and the site. Install low-profile solar equipment so that it is not visible or only minimally visible and so that it does not damage historic material or details and it easily reversible.

(d) Resources: The following National Park Service publications contain more detailed information about energy.

Preservation Brief #3: Conserving Energy in Historic Buildings.

Preservation Brief #24: Heating, Ventilating, and Cooling Historic Buildings-Problems and Recommended Approaches.

E. Guidelines for Signage, Awnings and Accessories

- 1. General.** Signs should blend with the character of the buildings on or near which they are placed. Signs should not conceal architectural detail, clutter the building's image, or distract from the unity of the facade but, rather, should complement the overall design. Signs, graphics and lighting should be designed as part of the facade. A master plan for signage is encouraged.
- 2. Materials.** Sign materials should complement the materials of the related building. Surface design elements should not detract from or conflict with the related structure's age and design in terms of identification symbol (logo), lettering, and related patterns or pictures. Materials used should be the same as those used for signs during the period of the building's construction, such as wood, wrought iron, masonry and metal grill work. Newer materials such as extruded aluminum and plastics may not be appropriate.
- 3. Types.** The sign type should enhance the building's design and materials. There are a number of types of signs which may be used: (1) single-faced; (2) projecting, double-faced; (3) three-dimensional; (4) monument; and (5) temporary signs.
- 4. Location and Method of Attachment.** Signs should be appropriately sized and complement the building exterior; roof-top signs are inappropriate except in cases where physical or pictorial documentation shows they were present and reconstruction is considered appropriate. There should be no sign above the cornice line or in the uppermost portion of a facade wall. Signs should not alter or conceal architectural details. Painted signs may be permissible on glass windows and doors. The facade should not be damaged or altered in sign application, except for necessary attachment points. Any attachment points on masonry surfaces should be in mortar joints only. The method of attachment should respect the structure's architectural integrity and should become an extension of the architecture. Projecting signs should have a space separating them from the building. (Protection of

architecture in method of attachment shall be regarded as a basis for granting variance of the normal zoning code prohibition against guy wire supports for projecting signs.)

5. **5. Illumination.** If illumination is necessary, signs should be lit from on the site (not internal illumination). Because they are historically inappropriate, there should be no flashing, blinking, moving, or varying intensity lighting. Subdued lighting is preferred. Backlit fluorescent or exposed neon are not appropriate.
6. **6. Awnings and Canopies:** Some historic buildings employed awnings for climate control, as a form of decoration or for signage. Awnings and canopies should not be used when they conceal richly detailed entries and windows. Aluminum or plastic awnings shall not be used. Surface design elements should not detract from or conflict with the related structure's age and design. Awnings should have a traditional shape such as a tent shape or be rounded when the opening is arched. Awnings should be used in a traditional application for shading window or door openings.
7. **7. Resources:** The following National Park Service publications contain more detailed information about signs and awnings.

Preservation Brief #25: The Preservation of Historic Signs.

Preservation Brief #44: The Use of Awnings on Historic Buildings: Repair, Replacement and New Design.

F. Guidelines for New Construction, Additions and Alterations

1. **1. General.** In general, historic properties should be used as their historic intended purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment. There are cases where small additions or detached new construction will not materially impair the historic or architectural character of the building or its site. New construction can be detached structures on the same property of the historic structure or an addition that is physically attached to the historic structure. Guidelines for new construction focus on general rather than specific design elements in order to allow for architectural innovation. Existing historic buildings and landscape features should be retained and rehabilitated. New construction should reinforce the historic architectural and visual character of the site. The subject of new additions is important because a new addition to a historic building has the potential to change its historic character as well as to damage and destroy significant historic materials and features. A new addition also has the potential to confuse the public and to make it difficult or impossible to differentiate the old from the new or to recognize what part of the historic building is genuinely historic.
2. **2. Location.** New construction on the site should not detract from the primary historic building and should be subordinate in massing to the historic structure. Therefore, additions to the primary historic building should be on the rear of the building and visually set back from the side elevations. New, separate buildings generally should be set in the rear half of the property and should not obscure the views to the historic building from the public right-of-way. Proper placement of new detached buildings and even additions require an understanding of the development of the property over time and the surrounding area so that new construction is consistent with historic development patterns.

The massing, volume, and height of any new construction should be subordinate to the massing, volume, and height of the existing historic structure on the site. Additions or new buildings on the site that "dwarf" the historic buildings will not comply with these guidelines.

3. **3. Roofs and Cornices.** New roof, and cornice designs should be compatible with the primary building on the site. It is more important for roof and roof edges to relate in size and proportion, than in detailing.
4. **4. Materials and Details.** The materials and details of new construction should relate to the materials and details of the primary building on the site but should not be slavishly imitative.
5. **5. Windows and Doors.** Windows, doors, and openings should relate to those of the primary building on the site in the ratio of solid to void, distribution of window openings, and window setback from the

exterior wall plane. The proportion, size, style, function and detailing of windows and doors in new construction should relate to that of existing adjacent buildings. Window and door frames should be wood, but imitative materials can be considered on a case-by-case basis.

- 6. Resources:** The following National Park Service publications contain more detailed information about additions and new construction.

Preservation Brief #14: New Exterior Additions to Historic Buildings: Preservation Concerns.

Preservation Brief #17: Architectural Character-Identifying the Visual Aspects of Historic Buildings as an Aid to Preserving their Character

G. Guidelines Concerning Site Considerations

- 1. General.** The traditional pattern of streets, curbs, boulevards and sidewalks in the area should be maintained. Distinctive features of spaces in the area such as fences, retaining walls and steps that are important in defining the context should be preserved. The relationship of buildings to open space and setbacks of buildings is important to preserve. New street furniture and landscape improvements such as benches, bus shelters, kiosks, sign standards, trash containers, lighting, planters and fences should be compatible with the character of the Sites. The historic urban street pattern should be retained and enhanced in improvement projects.
- 2. Fences and Retaining Walls.** Fences which are low and allow visual penetration of front yard space are preferable to complete enclosure. Fences of wrought iron or aluminum which enclose the front yard area should be no taller than four (4) feet. Cyclone/chain-link fences should not be used to enclose front yards or the front half of side yards. Stone, brick and split face concrete block are preferable to landscape timber for the construction of retaining walls.
- 3. Lighting.** The location and style of exterior lights should be appropriate to the structure's age and original design intent.
- 4. Hardscaping and Landscaping.** New hardscaping and landscaping should respect the historical and architectural character of the existing property.

H. Guidelines for Demolition and Moving Buildings

Proposals for demolishing structures, partial or whole, while reviewed with special care by the Heritage Preservation Commission, are not necessarily in conflict with the guidelines. When reviewing proposals for demolition of structures, the Heritage Preservation Commission will consider the following:

- 1.** The architectural and historical merit of the building. This includes consideration of the integrity of the structure and whether it was constructed during the Period of Significance.
- 2.** The effect of the demolition on surrounding buildings, the effect of any proposed new construction on the remainder of the building (in case of partial demolition) and on surrounding buildings.
- 3.** The economic value or usefulness of the building as it now exists in comparison with the value or usefulness of rehabilitating the building or structure for a new use.
- 4.** The physical condition of the structure and the feasibility of continued use with considerations of maintenance, safety, and compliance with codes.

Proposals for moving structures off designated sites shall be reviewed as a demolition and proposals for moving structures onto the designated sites shall be reviewed as new construction.

SECTION 2

This ordinance shall become effective thirty (30) days after its passage, approval, and publication once in the official newspaper of the City.

