



Legislation Details (With Text)

File #: Ord 13-38 **Version:** 1

Type: Ordinance **Status:** Archived

In control: City Council

Final action: 7/17/2013

Title: Amending Legislative Code Chapter 74 by enacting a new section designating the St. Paul Gas Light Company Island Station at 380 Randolph Avenue as a Saint Paul Heritage Preservation Site.

Sponsors: Dave Thune

Indexes: Great River Passage, Heritage Preservation Commission, Historic Preservation

Code sections: Sec. 73.05. - Designation of heritage preservation sites., Sec. 73.09. - Recording of heritage preservation sites.

Attachments: 1. Designation Process Checklist, 2. Island Station Nomination Form and Preservation Program, 3. HPC Resolution for Island Station, 4. HPC Staff Report, 5. Planning Commission Resolution, 6. SHPO Comment/Review Letter, 7. HPC Minutes 5-23-13-partial, 8. Written owner testimony submitted prior to 5-23-13 hearing, 9. Written owner testimony from 5-23-13 hearing, 10. Written owner testimony 2 from 5-23-13 hearing, 11. Property Map, 12. Written owner testimony 3 from 5-23-13 hearing, 13. Written owner testimony 4 from 5-23-13 hearing, 14. Written owner testimony 5 from 5-23-13 hearing, 15. Preservation Alliance of Minnesota letter, 16. FOM Island Station letter to City Council, 17. Island Station PH materials

Date	Ver.	Action By	Action	Result
7/17/2013	1	City Council	Failed	Fail
7/10/2013	1	City Council	Public Hearing Closed; Laid Over to Fourth Reading/Final Adoption	Pass
6/26/2013	1	City Council	Laid Over to Third Reading/Public Hearing	
6/19/2013	1	City Council	Laid Over to Second Reading	

Amending Legislative Code Chapter 74 by enacting a new section designating the St. Paul Gas Light Company Island Station at 380 Randolph Avenue as a Saint Paul Heritage Preservation Site.

THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF SAINT PAUL DOES HEREBY ORDAIN

Section 1.

That Legislative Code Chapter 74, entitled Heritage Preservation Districts and Programs, is hereby amended by the addition of the following new section to be numbered Section 74.09 and entitled St. Paul Gas Light Company Island Station preservation program which shall read as follows:

Sec. 74.09. St. Paul Gas Light Company Island Station preservation program.

(a) Designation for Heritage Preservation. Pursuant to the authority contained in Legislative Code Chapter 73, and upon the recommendation of the Heritage Preservation Commission of the City of Saint Paul, and after having duly considered the matter at a public hearing held in accordance with Leg. Code § 73.05, the St. Paul Gas Light Company Island Station (Island Station), located at 380 Randolph Avenue and legally described as Section 12 Town 28 Range 23 Part Of Ne 1/4 Of Sw 1/4 & Se 1/4 Of Nw 1/4 & Part Of Sw 1/4 Of Ne 1/4 Of Sec 12 Tn 28 Tn 23 Lying Sly Of Shepard Rd, Nly Of Mississippi River, Ely Of Ely Line Of Tract A Of Rls 441

Ext Nly & Sly & Wly Of A Line Desc As Beg At to Saint Paul [PIN No. 122823420020], is hereby designated for heritage preservation.

(b) *Outline of preservation program.*

1. General Intent

The City of Saint Paul, a Certified Local Government in the National Historic Preservation Program, has agreed to conduct its design review of locally designated heritage preservation sites and districts according to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation (1995). The Standards are applied to projects in a reasonable manner, taking into consideration economic and technical feasibility. The ten Standards are:

1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.
2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.
4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.
5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.
6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.
7. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.
8. Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.
9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

2. Description

2.1 Boundaries and Site. The St. Paul Gas Light Company Island Station Plant at 380 Randolph Avenue (437 Shepard Road, formerly 1 Ross Road; RA-SPC-3323) is located in Section 12 of Township 28N R23W, about two miles upstream from downtown St. Paul. It is in Planning District 9 (known as the West 7th/Fort Federation Community Council). The electric-steam plant occupies the foot of a peninsula on the west side of the Mississippi River about 100 feet from the shoreline. This peninsula was originally the 6-acre Ross Island and was reached by a wood bridge (razed). The west half of the island is now infilled in part by ashes sluiced out of the plant furnaces.

3. General Character [*description still needed to add*]

4. Existing structures and buildings

4.1 Exterior Surfaces.

4.1.1 Masonry. Repair: Original masonry and mortar shall be retained whenever possible without the application of any surface treatment. Deteriorated or damaged masonry or mortar, when necessary, shall be repaired or replaced with the material used in original construction or a material that closely resembles the original in size, shape, color, texture and profile. New masonry added to a building, structure or site,

such as new foundations or retaining walls, should be compatible with the size, shape, color, texture, profile and bonding of the original or existing masonry.

Cleaning: Masonry should be cleaned only when necessary to halt deterioration or to remove graffiti and stains and always with the gentlest method possible such as low pressure water (under 300 psi) and soft, natural bristle brushes. Brick and stone surfaces shall not be sandblasted with dry or wet grit or other abrasives. Abrasive cleaning methods can erode the hard surface of the material and accelerate deterioration. Chemical cleaning products which could have an adverse chemical reaction with the masonry material shall not be used. Chemical solvents should not be used except for removing iron and oil stains. It is preferable to use water with a non-ionic biodegradable detergent. Waterproof or water repellent coatings or surface consolidation treatments should not be applied unless required to solve a specific technical problem that has been studied and identified and determined to comply with applicable design guidelines. In general, coatings are frequently unnecessary, expensive, and can accelerate deterioration of the masonry.

Repointing: Repointing should be done on those mortar joints where there is evidence of moisture problems or where mortar is missing or damaged. The removal of mortar shall be done with methods and tools that will not damage the surrounding masonry or alter the joint size. Original mortar joint size and profile shall be retained, and replacement mortar shall match the original mortar in color, composition, strength and texture. Materials and ingredient proportions similar to the original mortar shall be used when repointing, with the replacement mortar softer than the masonry units and not harder than the historic mortar. A professional mortar analysis can determine the cement-lime-sand ratio. This will create a bond similar to the original and is necessary to prevent damage to the masonry units. Repointing with mortar of high Portland cement content can create a bond stronger than is appropriate for the original building materials, possibly resulting in cracking or other damage. Mortar joints should be carefully washed after set-up to retain the neatness of the joint lines and keep extraneous mortar off of masonry surfaces.

Painting: The original color and texture of masonry surfaces shall be retained, including early signage wherever possible. Unpainted masonry surfaces shall not be painted. Brick or stone surfaces may have been painted or whitewashed for practical and aesthetic reasons early on and paint should not be indiscriminately removed from masonry surfaces as this may subject the building to damage and change its appearance. The removal of paint from masonry surfaces should only be attempted if unpainted surfaces are historically appropriate and if removal can be accomplished without damage to the masonry. An appropriate paint removal product, especially for the removal of graffiti, shall be applied in test areas to determine its effect on the masonry and its effectiveness in removing the paint. In rare cases where a consolidant or paint coating is determined to be historically and structurally appropriate, the color and finish is subject to review.

4.1.2 Siding. Repair: Original wood and metal siding should be retained whenever possible without the application of any surface treatment. A similar material should be used to repair or replace, where necessary. New siding added to the structure or site should be compatible with the material, color, texture, size, design, and arrangement of the original materials.

Painting: Paint should not be indiscriminately removed from wooden surfaces as this may subject the building to damage and change its appearance. Exterior wooden surfaces shall be maintained with appropriate paint or stain. Color is a significant design element and exterior paint colors should be appropriate to the period and style of the historic building. Building permits are not required for painting, and although the Heritage Preservation Commission may review and comment on paint color, paint color is not subject to Heritage Preservation Commission approval.

4.1.3 Stucco and Concrete. Resurfacing: Repairs to existing stucco and concrete surfaces should duplicate the original in color, pattern and texture, if evidence exists. Smooth or heavy dashed surfaces should be avoided unless they were used on the original surface. Re-dashing stucco shall not alter the set back or profile of trim and architectural details.

4.2 Roofs, Chimneys, Cornices and Parapets.

Roof Shape: The original roof type, slope, overhangs and architectural details shall be preserved. The

size, shape and original roof features such as dormers, cupolas and parapets shall also be preserved. New roof features may be acceptable if compatible with the original design and not conspicuously located.

Materials: When the roof is visible from street level, the original material should be retained if possible, otherwise it should be replaced with new material that matches the old in composition, size, shape, color, and texture. When partially re-roofing, deteriorated roof coverings should be replaced with new materials that match the original in composition, profile, size, shape, color and texture. When entirely re-roofing, new materials which differ to such an extent from the original in composition, size, shape, color or texture that the appearance of the building is altered shall not be used. The predominant roof materials on the residential buildings in the Jacob Schmidt Brewery Historic District are asphalt shingles. When asphalt shingles began to be used in the 1890s and early twentieth century, the most common colors were solid, uniform, deep red and solid, uniform, dark green. Dark brown, dark gray and weathered-wood colors may also be acceptable for new asphalt shingles.

Alterations: The roof shape on principal elevations shall not be altered except to restore it to the original documented appearance. The additions of architecturally compatible elements like light monitors may be considered by the HPC on a case-by-case basis. Documentation includes pictorial or physical evidence of the former appearance of the building. Alterations to the roof shape at the sides or rear shall be compatible with the architectural character of the building.

Skylights: New skylights and vents should be behind and below parapet level for flat roofs. Skylights and vents shall not be installed on principal elevations for sloped roofs. Modern skylights are a simple way to alter a roof to admit light and air without disrupting its plane surface. Skylights should be flat and as close to the roof plane as possible. They should not be placed on the front or highly visible roof planes. "Bubble"-type skylights shall not be installed.

Chimneys, Stovepipes and Smokestacks: Chimneys and smokestacks should be preserved or restored to their original condition. In the absence of historical documentation on the original design, chimney design should be in keeping with the period and style of the building. New chimneys and stovepipes should not be installed on front roof planes.

Cornices, Parapets and Other Details: All architectural features that give the roof its essential character should be preserved or replaced in kind. Similar material should be used to repair/replace deteriorating or missing architectural elements such as cornices, brackets, railings and chimneys, whenever possible. The same massing, proportions, scale and design theme as the original should be retained.

4.3 Windows and Doors. Windows and doors are a character defining architectural feature and establish the visual rhythm, balance and general character of the facades. Any alteration, including removal of moldings or changes in window and door size or type, can have a significant and often detrimental effect on the appearance of the building as well as on the surrounding streetscape.

Openings: Existing window and door openings should be retained. New window and door openings should not be introduced into principal elevations. Infilling of window openings or installing new openings may be permissible on secondary facades if standard sizes approximate the size and proportions of the opening. The National Park Service Bulletin on New Openings in Secondary Elevations or Introducing New Windows in Blank Walls (Sept. 2000) should be referenced and used as a guide. Enlarging or reducing window or door openings to fit stock window sash or new stock door sizes shall not be done.

Solid to Void Ratio: New window and door openings should not be introduced into principal or highly visible elevations. New openings may be acceptable on secondary or minimally visible elevations so long as they do not destroy or alter any architectural features and the size and placement is in keeping with the solid-to-void (wall-to-openings) ratio of the elevation.

Panes, Sashes and Hardware: Historic windows should be preserved and if replacement is warranted, windows should be replaced in-kind. Window panes should be two-way glass. No reflective or spandrel glass is permitted. The stylistic period or periods a building represents should be respected. Missing or irreparable windows should be replaced with new windows that match the original in material, size, general muntin and mullion proportion and configuration and reflective qualities of the glass. Replacement sash should not alter the setback relationship between window and wall. Heating and air conditioning units should not be installed in the window frames when the sash and frames may be damaged. Window installations should be considered only when all other viable heating and cooling systems would result in

significant damage to historic materials. Window installations may be acceptable in secondary facades.

Trim: Historic window casings should be retained wherever possible. If replacement is necessary, the original profile shall be replicated.

Lintels, Arches and Sills: Lintels, sills, architraves, pediments and hoods should be retained or repaired if possible. Historic colors, if determined, and textures should be matched when repairing these elements.

Storms and Screens: Storm windows and doors should be compatible with the character of the building and should not damage window and door frames, or require removal of original windows and doors. Exterior storms should be appropriate in size and color. Combination storm windows should have wood frames or be painted to match trim colors. If combination metal storms are installed, they shall have a baked-enamel finish. Storm windows should resemble the inner window and should not have vertical or horizontal divisions which conflict with the divisions of the inner sash. Storms and screens should not pan or wrap the opening or casing.

Security Measures: Historic trim or other architectural features shall not be removed for the installation of security bars or grills.

Awnings and Canopies: Awnings and canopies should not be used when they conceal richly detailed entries and windows. Plastic and fabric awnings shall not be used given the utilitarian character of the building. Surface design elements should not detract from or conflict with the related structure's age and design. Awnings should have a traditional shape such as a tent shape or be rounded when the opening is arched. Awnings should be used in a traditional application for shading window or door openings.

4.4 Entrances and Steps. Entrances and steps which are appropriate to the building and its development should be retained. Additions reflecting later styles of architecture are often important to the building's historical integrity and, whenever possible, should be retained. Entrances removed from the building should be reconstructed, using photographic documentation and historical research, to be compatible in design and detail with the period and style of the building.

Decorative Features: Decorative architectural features such as cornices, brackets, railings, and those around front doors and windows should be preserved. New material used to repair or replace, where necessary, deteriorated architectural features of wood, iron, cast iron, terra-cotta, tile and brick should match the original as closely as possible.

Decks and Fire stairs: Deck and fire stair additions and new balconies may be acceptable in some cases, but should be kept to the rear of buildings where they will be the most inconspicuous and detract the least from the historical context. The detailing of decks and exterior stairs should be compatible with the period and style of the building.

4.6 Fencing, Enclosures and Retaining Walls. Existing fencing and retaining walls that are contributing elements to the Site should be appropriately maintained and preserved.

4.8 Mechanical.

Location and Siting. Mechanical related equipment should be sited in such a way that they do not block or disrupt principal elevations and prominent views, especially on roof tops. Mechanical related equipment that is sited on grade should be inconspicuously sited. In some cases appropriate screening, may be necessary.

Grills, Exhaust Fans, etc. Grills, vents, exhaust outlets for air conditioners, bath and kitchen exhaust fans should be incorporated into filler panels, if possible. They may be painted the same color as the filler panel.

5. Signage, Awnings and Accessories.

5.1 General. Any existing historic signs that reflect the development of the Site should be preserved. These signs may be in the form of surface mounted or projecting signs. Signs should be compatible with the character of the Site and blend with the character of the structures on or near which they are placed. Signs should not conceal architectural detail, clutter the building's image, or distract from the unity of the facade but, rather, should complement the overall design. Signs, graphics and lighting should be designed

as part of the facade. Signs on large structures that house several businesses should be planned and designed in a way that unifies the facade, while providing identity for individual businesses. A master plan for signage is encouraged.

5.2 Materials. Sign materials should complement the materials of the related building and/or the adjacent buildings. Surface design elements should not detract from or conflict with the related structure's age and design in terms of identification symbol (logo), lettering, and related patterns or pictures. Materials used should be the same as those used for signs during the period of the building's construction, such as wood, wrought iron, steel, and metal grill work. Newer materials such as extruded aluminum and plastics may not be appropriate.

5.3 Types. The sign type should enhance the building's design and materials. There are a number of types of signs which may be used: (1) single-faced; (2) projecting, double-faced; (3) three-dimensional; (4) painted wall signs; and (5) temporary signs.

5.4 Location and Method of Attachment. Signs should be appropriately sized and complement the building exterior; roof-top signs are inappropriate except in cases where physical or pictorial documentation shows they were present and reconstruction is considered appropriate. There should be no sign above the cornice line or uppermost portion of a facade wall.

Signs should not disfigure or conceal architectural details. Painted signs may be permissible on glass windows and doors. The facade should not be damaged in sign application, except for mere attachment. The method of attachment should respect the structure's architectural integrity and should become an extension of the architecture. Projecting signs should have a space separating them from the building. (Protection of architecture in method of attachment shall be regarded as a basis for granting variance of the normal zoning code prohibition against guy wire supports for projecting signs.)

5.5 Illumination. Signs should generally be lit from on the site. There should be no flashing, blinking, moving, or varying intensity lighting. Subdued lighting is preferred. Backlit fluorescent or exposed neon are generally inappropriate.

6. New Construction.

6.1 General. New construction refers to totally new structures, moved-in structures and new additions to existing structures. Any new construction should possess height, massing, setback, materials and rhythms compatible with surrounding structures. The reproduction of historic design and details is recommended only for limited cases of infill or small scale construction. Guidelines for new construction focus on general rather than specific design elements in order to encourage architectural innovation.

Site evaluation. Existing historic buildings and landscape features should be retained and rehabilitated in plans for redevelopment.

General character. New construction should reinforce the historic architectural and visual character of the area.

Views and Vistas: Exceptional views of the Site from the River and both directions along Shepard Road should not be obstructed by new buildings or structures.

Built Form. Design new buildings to frame all public spaces, including streets and/or any other open spaces. Design new buildings to respect the historic antecedents, where appropriate, while creating a living and working environment for the 21st century. Design new buildings to fit in well with the historic buildings and context of the area by reflecting the scale, massing, quality of materials, and window openings of the surrounding structures.

Pedestrian circulation and parking. New construction should be oriented toward streets which are inviting environments for pedestrians. Parking areas should be placed at the rear of buildings wherever possible or screened with landscaping, low walls or appropriately detailed fences. Walls or plantings should not block prominent views or impact the historic character in a way that the character is lost.

6.2 Setback. New setbacks should respect the siting and prominence of Island Station.

6.3 Massing, Volume, Height. New construction should be compatible with the massing, volume, and height, of the Site. Any new construction shall not diminish or obscure the main Island Station building.

6.4 Rhythm. The rhythm in the Island Station Site (or lack of) can be found both in the relation of additions onto buildings, and in the relation of elements on a single building facade. Rhythm between buildings is usually distinguished by slight variations in height, windows and doors, and details, including vertical and horizontal elements. Rhythm may be accentuated by slight projections and recessions of the facade, causing the scale of the building to match that of its neighbors. The rhythm of new construction should be compatible with that of existing structures.

6.5 Roofs and Cornices. New roof, and cornice designs should be compatible with existing adjacent structures. Generally, roofs in the Site for commercial buildings are flat and roofs for residential buildings are sloped and varied. It is more important for roof edges to relate in size and proportion, than in detailing.

6.6 Materials and Details. Encourage the use of high-quality exterior materials. The materials and details of new construction should relate to the materials and details of existing adjacent buildings. New construction at the Site should possess more detailing than typical modern commercial buildings, to respond to the surrounding buildings.

6.7 Windows and Doors. Windows should relate to those of existing buildings in on the Site in the ratio of solid to void, distribution of window openings, and window setback. The proportion, size, style, function and detailing of windows and doors in new construction should relate to that of existing adjacent buildings. Window and door frames should be wood, steel or bronze-finished aluminum depending on the relationship of existing historic fabric.

7. Guidelines for Non-Contributing, Contemporary Buildings or Additions

7.1 Change to Contributing Status. A non-contributing building or structure built within the period of significance but substantially altered may be reclassified as a contributing building, but it must be brought into compliance with its original historic facade by means of restoration or reconstruction.

7.2 Non-Contributing and Contemporary Building Additions and Alterations. Additions and alterations to non-contributing and contemporary buildings must be sympathetic and subordinate to historic structures. These changes must not impair intact historic context. Guidelines for new construction shall apply to non-contributing and contemporary buildings.

8. Site Considerations.

8.1 General. The traditional pattern of streets, curbs, boulevards and sidewalks in the area should be maintained. Distinctive features of spaces in the area such as train tracks, retaining walls, outbuildings and steps that are important in defining the Site's context should be preserved. New street furniture and landscape improvements such as benches, bus shelters, kiosks, sign standards, trash containers, planters and fences should be compatible with the character of the Site.

8.2 Fences and Retaining Walls. Fences which allow some visual penetration of the space are preferable to complete enclosure. Cyclone fences, if used, should not be installed around or near principal elevations of the site and should visually unobtrusive. Stone, brick and split face concrete block are preferable to landscape timber for the construction of retaining walls. Masonry retaining walls should be finished with caps or appropriate details.

8.3 Lighting. The location and style of exterior lights should be appropriate to the structure's age and original design intent.

8.4 Landscaping. New landscaping should respect the historical and architectural character of the Site. Trees should not block prominent views of the structures.

9. Demolition.

When reviewing proposals for demolition of structures, the Heritage Preservation Commission will consider the following:

9.1 The architectural and historical merit of the building. This includes consideration of the integrity of

the structure and whether it was constructed during the Period of Significance.

9.2 The effect of the demolition on surrounding buildings and site, the effect of any proposed new construction on the remainder of the building (in case of partial demolition) and on surrounding buildings and the site.

9.3 The economic value or usefulness of the building as it now exists in comparison with the value or usefulness of rehabilitating the building or structure for a new use.

(c) Record of legal description. The city clerk shall record the legal description of the Island Station Heritage Preservation Site with the Ramsey County recorder and the Ramsey County registrar of titles as required under Section 73.09 of this Legislative Code.

Section 2.

This ordinance shall become effective thirty (30) days after its passage, approval, and publication once in the official newspaper of the City.