CITY OF SAINT PAUL

HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION RESOLUTION

FILE NUMBER: 15-805 Hudson Road - Remove or Repair Order

DATE: November 19, 2015

WHEREAS, the City of Saint Paul has declared as a matter of public policy, in Chapter 73 of the Saint Paul Legislative Code, "that the preservation, protection, perpetuation and use of areas, places, building, structures and other objects having special historical, community or aesthetic interest or value is a public necessity and is required in the interest of the health, prosperity, safety and welfare of the people;" and

WHEREAS, Chapter 73 also establishes the purposes of heritage preservation to be to: "safeguard the heritage of the City of Saint Paul by preserving sites and structures which reflect elements of the city's cultural, social, economic, political or architectural history; protect and enhance the City of Saint Paul's attraction to residents, tourists and visitors, and serve as a support and stimulus to business and industry; enhance the visual and aesthetic character, diversity and interest of the City of Saint Paul; foster civic pride in the beauty and notable accomplishments of the past; and promote the use and preservation of historic sites and structures for the education and general welfare of the people of the City of Saint Paul;" and

WHEREAS, Chapter 73 also establishes the Saint Paul Heritage Preservation Commission (HPC) and states that it "shall serve as an advisory body to the mayor and city council on municipal heritage preservation matters" and the HPC "shall review and approve or disapprove the issuance of city permits" for all demolitions within designated heritage preservation sites, except when structures "are the subject of a resolution adopted by the city council requiring the demolition...in accordance with Chapter 45" of the City Legislative Code (73.06 (a)(4)); and

WHEREAS, on July 23, 1992, the Dayton's Bluff Heritage Preservation District was established under Ordinance No. 17942 (Council File #92-900) and the property at 805 Hudson Road was classified as non-contributing; and

WHEREAS, 805 Hudson Road is located within the boundaries of the Dayton's Bluff Heritage Preservation District and is now threatened with demolition as the City has issued an Order to Abate; and

WHEREAS, 805 Hudson Road is a one-story, frame, rectangular stucco and wood sided structure constructed in 1929 as a Texaco filling station. Asphalt shingles protect the mansard roof. All but one of the rectangular window openings are boarded up with plywood. The intact window is to the right of the off-center front entrance which has a wide simple stucco column to the left of it with matching columns at the corners of the west elevation. The original canopy for the filling station that was on the southern elevation has been enclosed, but the original columns remain. The structure is sited at the rear of the corner lot, facing the intersection of Hudson Road and Wilson Avenue; and

WHEREAS, the Department of Safety and Inspections issued a Remove or Repair Order on November 6, 2015 and the public hearing before the Legislative Hearing Officer is scheduled for December 8, 2015 with the Legislative Hearing Officer making a recommendation for action to the City Council on January 6, 2016; and

HPC Resolution 15-805 Hudson Road 11-19-15

Page 2 of 3

WHEREAS, the HPC reviewed the proposal and allowed for public comment at their meeting held on November 19, 2015. No one appeared to provid testimony and there were no written testimony letters submitted either; and

WHEREAS, the Saint Paul Heritage Preservation Commission, based upon information gathered by staff and presented at the November 19, 2015 meeting, made and adopted the following findings:

- 1. Leg. Code § 74.90.(j) The adopted Preservation Program for the Dayton's Bluff Historic District states that consideration of demolitions will be determined by the category of building (pivotal, contributing and noncontributing), its importance to the district, the structural condition of the building and the economic viability of the structure.
- The category of the building. The property is categorized as non-contributing to the architectural and historical integrity of the Dayton's Bluff Heritage Preservation District, even though it was constructed during the period of significance for the District (1857-1930). There have been too many alterations for the structure to convey its historical significance.
- 3. The importance of the building to the district. The structure was constructed within the period of significance of 1857-1930, but has lost its architectural integrity. Additional historical associations with the property such as persons that have contributed in some way to Saint Paul's history and development or an architect or an association with an important event have not been fully researched.
- 4. Structural condition of the building. There is no Code Compliance Report on file and the interior was not inspected by HPC staff.
- 5. The economic viability of the structure. Costs for rehabilitation are not available. The Department of Safety and Inspections estimated the cost of wrecking to be \$12,000. Ramsey County for 2015 estimates the land value at \$28,300 and the building value at \$700.
- 6. In general, the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation recommend against removing buildings that are important in defining the overall historic character and destroying historic relationships between buildings and open space. The building is non-contributing to the overall historic character or rhythm of the District; now

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, the HPC finds that the proposed demolition of the building at 805 Hudson Road will have no adverse effect on the Program for the Preservation and architectural control of the Dayton's Bluff Heritage Preservation District (Leg. Code §73.06 (e)) for reasons outlined in the findings. If demolished, any future work at the site shall comply with the new construction guidelines for the Dayton's Bluff Heritage Preservation District, specifically Legislative Code § 74.90; and

FINALLY, BE IT RESOLVED, that a copy of this resolution will be forwarded to the Legislative Hearing Officer and City Council for the December 8 and January 6 Public Hearings.

MOVED BY

D. Trout-Oertel

SECONDED BY

M. Justin

IN FAVOR

5

AGAINST

0.

HPC Resolution 15-805 Hudson Road 11-19-15 Page 3 of 3 ABSTAIN 1 (S. Trimble)