



**CITY OF SAINT PAUL**

651-266-6655  
*Christopher B. Coleman, Mayor*  
651-228-3261

25 West Fourth Street

Saint Paul, MN 55102

Telephone:

Facsimile:

October 22, 2015

Richard Dana  
Chair, Saint Paul Heritage Preservation Commission (HPC)  
C/O Christine Boulware  
Saint Paul Department of Planning and Economic Development  
25 West 4<sup>th</sup> Street, Suite 1400  
Saint Paul, MN 55102

Re: Appeal of HPC decision  
**275 Bates Avenue**

Dear Chair Dana,

On October 8, 2015, the HPC denied the Housing and Redevelopment Authority's (HRA) application for a demolition permit to raze the building at 275 Bates Avenue (HPC File #16-002). I wish to appeal the HPC's decision and ask that the City Council consider the matter per HRA's rights as the applicant under Chapter 73 of the Saint Paul Legislative Code.

I set forth the following grounds for appeal in accordance with §73.06(i)(2) and §74.90(j):

- According to the HPC staff report, the building's integrity has been compromised and HPC staff considers its architectural integrity to be fair-to-poor. There is no indication in the HPC staff report that exterior changes to the building made outside the period of significance have acquired significance in their own right (§74.87(2)). In addition, the staff report indicates that much of the interior decorative features have been removed.
- Although the building is classified as pivotal, the historical associations found by HPC staff were limited to Hansen and the bakery, which was gone within 10 years of the building's construction.
- The current structural condition of the building is poor. A Structural Condition Review, prepared by a third party structural engineering firm, was submitted with the application, and was discussed via verbal testimony at the public hearing. The Structural Condition Review concluded that the building is in poor structural condition and repairs would likely be costly. Significant items noted in the report included foundation walls out of plumb, shoring columns in the basement are rusted and bent, and poor condition of the building's framing.
- As was testified to in the public hearing, HRA staff has worked diligently to find an economically viable rehabilitation proposal for the building. HRA staff has

offered the property via Requests For Proposals 3 times; in 2009, 2013 and 2014.

- HRA staff received 1 proposal in 2013 to demolish the building in conjunction with renovation of the adjacent property. This proposer requested a subsidy of \$381,813, which HRA staff decided was not economically viable.
- In the spring of 2015, HRA staff requested assistance from HPC staff and the Preservation Alliance of Minnesota to identify interested developers. Three new developers were contacted, but no proposals emerged.
- The HRA acquired the property in December of 2007 in an effort to control the use of the property and to ensure it was consistent with the neighborhood. After offering the property, along with a reasonable amount of subsidy, and not receiving an economically viable proposal, the HRA has concluded that the rehabilitation of this property is cost-prohibitive.

While the building is classified as pivotal and the historic contribution to the district is considered good, the HRA submits that those factors are outweighed by the lack of economic viability and poor structural condition of the building. In consideration of these factors, the HRA respectfully requests approval of this appeal under Saint Paul Legislative Code Sections 73.06(i)(2) and 74.90(j).

Respectfully,



for Jonathan Sage-Martinson  
HRA Executive Director

Cc: Patty Lilledahl, Director of Housing, PED  
Joe Musolf, Principal Project Manager, PED  
File