



2200 IDS Center
80 South 8th Street,
Minneapolis, MN 55402
OFC 612-977-8400
FAX 612-977-8650
URL Briggs.com

May 10, 2019

Marc J Manderscheid
(612) 977-8280
mmanderscheid@briggs.com

VIA E-MAIL

Amy Brendmoen
Council President
ward5@ci.stpaul.mn.us

Dai Thao
Councilmember
ward1@ci.stpaul.mn.us

Rebecca Noecker
Councilmember
ward2@ci.stpaul.mn.us

Chris Tolbert
Councilmember
ward3@ci.stpaul.mn.us

Mitra Jalali Nelson
Councilmember
ward4@ci.stpaul.mn.us

Kassim Busuri
Councilmember
ward6@ci.stpaul.mn.us

Jane L. Prince
Councilmember
ward7@ci.stpaul.mn.us

**Re: Submission by Twin Cities German Immersion School and
Twin Cities German Immersion School Building Company Opposing
Proposed Ordinance 19-1, designating the former St. Andrew Church
Building as a Saint Paul Heritage Preservation Site**

Dear City Councilmembers:

On May 15, 2019, the City Council will hold a public hearing on a proposed ordinance which would designate the former St. Andrew Church building as a heritage preservation site. The former St. Andrew campus is currently the home of the Twin Cities German Immersion School (“TCGIS”). The fee owner of the property is the Twin Cities German Immersion School Building Company (“Building Company”). Both TCGIS and Building Company ask that the City Council **not** designate the former St. Andrew Church building as a heritage preservation site. TCGIS understands that there is already substantial documentation in the record of what occurred before the Heritage Preservation Commission (“HPC”) and Planning Commission, which we will not repeat. The purpose of this letter is to summarize some of the relevant factual information and to identify some of the public policy and possible legal implications of the decision before you.



May 10, 2019

Page 2

TCGIS Provides a Unique, High Quality K-8 Public Education Program in Saint Paul

Twin Cities German Immersion School is a Minnesota nonprofit, qualified 501(c)(3) entity, incorporated on March 4, 2004. In November 2004, TCGIS entered into a contract with St. Paul's Germanic-American Institute to open a public charter school that uses the study of the German language and heritage to educate children for bilingual, informed and active world citizenship. TCGIS is the only German language immersion school in Minnesota.

TCGIS began operations in a rented building in the St. Anthony Park neighborhood in the Fall of 2005 with 43 students in Kindergarten and Grade 1. As is true of all beginning language immersion schools, additional class sections have been added each year, building upon the language skills learned by students in the prior years. Within a few years, TCGIS outgrew its initial St. Anthony Park home and moved to the Midway neighborhood, renting space in the building at 1745 University Avenue. This space suffered from significant deferred maintenance and because it had been originally constructed as a factory, there were numerous challenges. Due to changes along University Avenue, it appeared that TCGIS could be losing both its outdoor playground area and its access to gym space provided in the Midway YMCA. By 2012, it became apparent that TCGIS needed to move to a larger, more appropriate educational facility, if it was going to offer quality educational programs in accordance with its Mission Statement:

TCGIS is a K-8 Charter School that values high academic achievement and engages each individual child through an enriched, foreign-language curriculum. With the strong support of parents and community members, our school creates an environment that nurtures a child's curiosity and fosters international awareness.

Under Minnesota law, TCGIS is a public school. TCGIS cannot require an entrance exam or limit the admission of pupils on the basis of German language ability, prior measures of academic achievement, or aptitude for success. When there are more students applying to TCGIS than available slots, the school must conduct a lottery and accept all students up to capacity. As the school has enjoyed continued success in attracting and retaining students, it is nearing its intended full capacity of three sections of each grade from Kindergarten through Grade 8. TCGIS and the St. Paul Public Schools have a written partnership agreement, which the parties described as "an unprecedented opportunity for a strong partnership to form between a charter school (German Immersion) and a public school district (SPPS)." The Memorandum of Agreement provides that the St. Paul Public Schools will guarantee to twenty-five of the graduating TCGIS 8th Grade students, admission to the advanced program of German language instruction at Central High School, while TCGIS will provide learning opportunities to Central's German language teachers and "will promote Central as a strong articulation program for German studies for the 7th and 8th Grade students of German Immersion."

As of October 2018, there were 580 students enrolled in TCGIS. Approximately one-half of the student body comes from families residing in Saint Paul. TCGIS provides appropriate special educational opportunities to special education students; approximately 12% of the TCGIS student body have individual education plans. TCGIS is similarly-sized when compared to the other dual language/immersion programs in St. Paul: the Adams Spanish program has 616 students in grades K through 5 and the L'Etoile du Nord French program has 534 students in Pre-K through grade 5.

In July 2017, the University of St. Thomas replaced the Germanic American Institute as the authorizer and sponsor for the TCGIS program. On January 31, 2019, the University of St. Thomas reviewed TCGIS' enrollment planning, financial management, admissions policy, and overall school quality. St. Thomas found that "TCGIS has a high quality education program that has yielded great results for *all* students" and "emphasized that TCGIS has remained an academically rigorous school while also staying true to its focus on being a German immersion program and practicing innovative education of the whole child."

A Short History of the Development of St. Andrew Church Campus

The story of the St. Andrew Catholic congregation began in 1895, when it purchased an existing building at the intersection of Hatch and Churchill Streets. In 1907, the Church of St. Andrew of Saint Paul was incorporated under Minnesota law as an independent parish. In 1919, a new combination church and school building was constructed by St. Andrew at the intersection of Argyle, Chatsworth, and Van Slyke Streets. When the St. Andrew School opened in the fall of 1920, there were six classrooms.

In the mid-1920s, St. Andrew purchased Lots 12 through 15, Block 4, of the Warrendale subdivision, which had been platted in 1885. The homes that had previously been constructed on these lots were demolished. The first building constructed for St. Andrew's third location was completed in 1926; it was a new, brick convent structure to house the nuns who taught in the St. Andrew school. The next structure to be erected was the St. Andrew Church building, which consisted primarily of a main level sanctuary and a basement social hall. In 1950, a new brick rectory was constructed to the west of the Church building. In 1957, a new, purpose-built, 3-level school fronting on Van Slyke Avenue was constructed on additional land that had been purchased by the Church. St. Andrew Church demolished the 1920 church and school building in the late 1950s and sold the land for construction of new houses. In the late 1960s, the St. Andrew sanctuary was extensively remodeled to reflect some of the changes in the worship experience resulting from the directives of the Second Vatican Council.

In the Spring of 1989, a decision was made by St. Andrew Church to merge the St. Andrew School into the Maternity of Mary School. The legacy of the St. Andrew School continues through the Maternity of Mary-St. Andrew School, which opened for the 1989-1990 school year and continues today as a Catholic educational institution offering programs for pre-K through 8th

Grade. The existing Maternity of Mary-St. Andrew School buildings were extensively remodeled and in 2009 “[t]here was also an expansion which included a new secure main entry and a new gymnasium. The gym is equipped with retractable bleachers, [and] high grade wood flooring which can accommodate both full- and half-court basketball games.” The enrollment in the Maternity of Mary-St. Andrew School for the 2017-2018 school year was 171 students in pre-K through 8th grade, with two sections of preschool.

Subsequent to the merger of the two schools, the St. Andrew congregation was faced with the question of what to do with the largely vacant, approximately 29,400 square foot former St. Andrew School building on Van Slyke Avenue. The St. Andrew congregation considered multiple possible uses. Ultimately, the school building was leased to the St. Paul Public Schools for some of its programs. The St. Paul School District extensively remodeled the school building in 2004, including the construction of an elevator addition and life-safety improvements, thereafter relocating its L’Etoile du Nord French immersion school program to this site. After a number of years, the School District determined that the former St. Andrew School building no longer met its needs, and relocated the program to St. Paul’s East Side. Faced once again with a school building for which it had no particular use, St. Andrew Church retained the NorthMarq real estate brokerage firm to try and identify a new rental tenant.

The Archdiocese Requires that St. Andrew Church Merge with the Maternity of the Blessed Virgin Church

On October 17, 2010, the Archdiocese of Minneapolis and St. Paul announced its new Strategic Plan, which called for the merger of St. Andrew and its 250+ families with The Church of the Blessed Virgin (“Blessed Virgin”) and its 950 families. The two Churches thus came full circle: St. Andrew had helped establish Blessed Virgin in 1950. Archbishop Nienstedt noted in his introduction to the Strategic Plan: “The Church is not primarily about buildings; it is about people and relationships in and through Christ.” By the time of the Church merger in 2010, the two congregations had already shared the Maternity of St. Mary-St. Andrew School for over 20 years. The St. Andrew’s parishioners chose not to appeal the Archdiocese’s merger decision. Father Peter Williams acknowledged that moving forward together on the Blessed Virgin campus was the “natural choice” in terms of parking and seating capacity.

Effective December 30, 2010, the “Articles and Plan of Merger of the Church of St. Andrew of St. Paul and The Church of the Blessed Virgin, Saint Paul, Minnesota” became effective. The purpose of the Articles was “to combine, merge, unite and consolidate each such religious parish corporation into a single surviving corporation as set forth herein.” The Articles provide, in part, as follows:

On the effective date of the merger, the separate corporate identity of The Church of St. Andrew of St. Paul, a Minnesota religious parish corporation shall be merged into, consolidated with

and continue in The Church of the Maternity of the Blessed Virgin, Saint Paul, Minnesota, the surviving corporation and all of the legal title to assets held or owned by The Church of St. Andrew of St. Paul shall vest in the surviving corporation, and all of its property, rights, privileges, of whatsoever nature and description ... shall be transferred, to vest in, and devolve upon the surviving corporation, without further act or deed.

The final mass in the former St. Andrew sanctuary was celebrated on June 12, 2011. Thereafter, ecclesiastical items such as the alter, tabernacle, the St. Andrew statue, all the stained glass windows, sacred vessels, and the Stations of the Cross were removed from the St. Andrew building and transferred to Blessed Virgin.

The Blessed Virgin Church Sells the Former St. Andrew Campus

NorthMarq was retained by the Blessed Virgin Church to market and sell the former St. Andrew campus. NorthMarq advertised the properties at 1031 Como Avenue/1030 Van Slyke Avenue as being “available for sale or lease.” The Van Slyke Avenue property, the brokers stated, was “Move in ready for schools because of over \$1 million spent on 2 remodelings by the former tenant, the St. Paul Public Schools.” The 1926 Convent Building had already been demolished by St. Andrew without objection and was replaced by a parking lot. The rectory was separately being offered for sale.

At the same time that the former St. Andrew campus was being marketed by the Blessed Virgin Church, the leadership of the Twin Cities German Immersion School was looking for a new, larger home to house its growing educational program. It investigated more than a dozen possible sites in the Twin Cities. On February 28, 2013, the Blessed Virgin Church and Ten Square, LLC, acting on behalf of TCGIS, entered into a Purchase and Sale Agreement for the entire St. Andrew campus, inclusive of the former Church building, school, and rectory.

The terms of the Purchase and Sale Agreement prohibited the purchaser from using the name “St. Andrew Catholic School” or “St. Andrew Church” in the name of its development, school or other business operation” and from using the property for any religious congregation or assemblage which was promoted as Catholic “but not possessing the ecclesiastical approval of the Roman Catholic Church.” The Agreement mandated that all “Roman Catholic religious tangible personal property identified by Seller, and the stained glass windows currently installed in the Buildings (“Religious Items”) and located on the Property shall remain property of Seller.” The Seller was given the right to remove such Religious Items within ten days after closing. The use of the former St. Andrew campus was also restricted to prohibit any health services or counseling contrary to the Ethical Religious Directives for Catholic Health Care Services; from sale or rental of any pornographic materials; or for use as a “tavern, bar, night club, or dance club.” It was further required that the Property be used as a public charter school, and that this representation



May 10, 2019

Page 6

would survive the delivery of the deed. The purchase price to be paid to the Blessed Virgin Church was later increased to \$2,125,875. There were no statements that any part of the St. Andrew property was historic or was to be preserved.

On May 21, 2013, the legal title to the former St. Andrew campus was transferred from the Blessed Virgin Church to Educational Properties TCGIS, LLC, a Saint Paul, Minnesota corporation. The money for the purchase and the subsequent remodeling and construction for use as a school was raised through the sale of \$8,200,000 of Conduit Revenue Bonds offered through the City of Saint Paul Housing and Redevelopment Authority (“HRA”), which found and concluded that a public purpose was served by locating the public charter school in Saint Paul.

The Property was subsequently altered by some minor remodeling of the former Church sanctuary into a multi-purpose room and the social hall into a cafeteria. The rectory, which was immediately west of the Church building, was demolished without objection to create more off-street parking. A new three story education building was constructed at a cost of approximately \$4 million. It included nine classrooms, media center, science lab, music classroom, art classroom, breakout areas, and staff support rooms. Classes at the campus began in Fall, 2013. On December 30, 2015, the fee simple legal title to the recently improved property was acquired by Twin Cities German Immersion School Building Company, a private Minnesota non-profit corporation, which continues to own the real estate and leases the property to TCGIS. The lease is for a term of thirty years with an option for up to fifty more years. TCGIS has made a long-term commitment to the Como neighborhood.

The St. Andrew Church Building Has Not Previously Been Found Eligible for Historical Designation

In May 1983, the St. Paul Heritage Preservation Commission issued the Final Report of a Historic Sites Survey, determining those properties deemed worthy of nomination to the National Register of Historic Places. In the Survey Form for the St. Andrew Church building, in response to the question whether the Church had “National Register potential?” the Commission answered “No.” In response to the question whether the property had “Local designation potential?” the Commission answered “No.” In response to the question whether the building had “Historic district potential?” the Commission answered “No.” In the Commission’s Final Report, it did not list the St. Andrew building as one of the “Sites Eligible for Designation.”

In 2001, the St. Paul Heritage Preservation Commission authorized the “St. Paul Historic Context Study [for] Churches, Synagogues, and Religious Buildings: 1849-1950.” The Church of St. Andrew was noted as one of many St. Paul church buildings constructed in the early 20th Century (see p. 16). The Church of St. Andrew was not included in the list of “Buildings Recommended for Further Designation Study.”

In the Report to the Commissioners of the HRA dated March 27, 2013, the HRA staff considered whether the HRA should issue Conduit Revenue Bonds for TCGIS' redevelopment of the former St. Andrew Church property. The Staff Report reviewed the issue of compliance with City of St. Paul/HRA requirements. In the section entitled "Historic Preservation" the HRA staff reported that this topic was "N/A", *i.e.*, that the entire topic of historic preservation was not applicable to the property.

The Designation of Special Purpose Properties as "Historic" Can Create Problems of Vacancy, Expense, and Liability

In real estate parlance, the former St. Andrew Church building is a "special purpose property," which is defined as "A property with a unique physical design, special construction materials, or a layout that particularly adapts its utility to the use for which it was built." The Dictionary of Real Estate Appraisal at 184 (Appraisal Institute, 5th ed.). There are often numerous challenges to reusing or redeveloping older special-purpose buildings: "Although most buildings can be converted to other uses, the conversion of special-purpose buildings generally involves extra expense and design expertise. Such conversion may not be economically feasible or practical in many situations depending on a building's design and special construction features. Special-purpose structures include houses of worship" The Appraisal of Real Estate at 269 (Appraisal Institute, 14th ed. 2013). The legal treatise *Real Estate Valuation in Litigation*, 2nd ed., J.D. Eaton (Appraisal Institute, 1995) devotes an entire chapter to dealing with the unique problems inherent in special-purpose properties, and notes as follows:

The identifying features of a special-purpose property are:

1. The property has physical design features peculiar to a specific use.
2. The property has no apparent market other than to an owner-user.
3. The property has no feasible economic alternate use.

The former St. Andrew Church building exhibits each of these characteristics, since it was built in the 1920s solely to be a Catholic church. It was the former St. Andrew School building that attracted TCGIS and not the empty sanctuary. The potential long term vacancy of the former Church building was often expressed as a concern of neighborhood residents. In addition, the former Church building sits on a site which is very limited in size, has limited parking, and is in the middle of a residential neighborhood. The Minnesota Supreme Court has recognized the unique issues inherent in special-purpose properties. "Special-purpose property is property that is treated in the market as adapted to or designed and built for a special purpose. This definition combines both functional and structural aspects: a special-purpose property becomes such either by its use or its unique functions or its by distinctive, specially-designed structural details." *Federal Reserve Bank of Minneapolis v. State*, 313 N.W.2d 619, 621-622 (Minn. 1981).

The cited definitions from both the appraisal and legal communities help to frame and identify the specific problem faced here by the Saint Paul City Council. The City of Saint Paul has been blessed with remarkable ecclesiastical architecture. The St. Paul Cathedral, Church of the Assumption, and Church of St. Agnes come immediately to mind as extraordinary examples of Catholic Church architecture. Approximately ten Catholic religious buildings in Saint Paul are on the National Register of Historic Places. At least one-half dozen Protestant religious buildings in Saint Paul are on the National Register. It is significant to keep in mind in this context, however, that as a prerequisite to placement of a structure on the National Register, the owner of the property must consent to its inclusion on the listing maintained by the Secretary of the Interior. No private property, regardless of its significance, can be entered onto the National Register of Historic Places without its owner's consent. Here, the current owner of the former St. Andrew Church building does not consent to it being placed upon the National Register.

There is a significant public policy question: how far the City of Saint Paul should go in placing ecclesiastical structures into a status by which the City can prevent any alteration or change in the structure? Within the City of Saint Paul, there are dozens and dozens of religious buildings in various states of preservation or in need of substantial repair and renovation. Saint Paul is changing. The religious beliefs, styles, and preferences of its citizens are broad and diverse. Change in religious worship is happening all around us. "The design and materials used in houses of worship are simpler today to keep maintenance and utility costs down." Appraisal at 269. How many ecclesiastical properties in St. Paul are needed and must be preserved in their original historical condition, in order to remind the citizens of the City's religious history? Many recent news articles report a declining attendance at worship services offered by the traditional Christian denominations. Just recently, it was announced that St. Mark's Catholic School on Marshall Avenue will be closing.

The 1927 former St. Andrew Church building was built for a special purpose that no longer exists. The owner of the Church building in 2013, the Blessed Virgin Church, knowingly sold the property to a non-church organization for a different use. The City of Saint Paul HRA knowingly approved bonds to be used to purchase and use the campus buildings for that different purpose. The new owner, TCGIS, should not be retroactively constrained in perpetuity by the purpose of its predecessor, which decided to sell the building because it could no longer successfully carry out its religious purpose in that space.

Historic Designation Could Possibly Give Rise to Municipal Liability.

There are significant legal questions for the City Council to consider. Would Heritage Preservation Designation be considered a "taking," which could subject the City to a claim for inverse condemnation? In *Powderly v. Erickson*, 285 N.W.2d 84, 90 (Minn. 1979), the Minnesota Supreme Court held that a private owner of a historical resource "cannot be forced to renovate the property" nor could an owner's demolition of the building be "enjoined indefinitely" in pursuing its plans for the structure.

The problems inherent in dealing with older religious properties is immediately apparent upon reviewing the cost estimates for repairing and renovating the former St. Andrew Church building. Roofing experts have noted how clay tile roofs are not in themselves “waterproof”, but rather the underlayment is what provides the moisture waterproofing. To eliminate the current leaking and water infiltration from the St. Andrew’s roof, it will be necessary to remove all of the clay tiles and to install a new waterproof membrane at a cost estimated to be more than \$1 million. In several places, there is extensive distress to the masonry curtain wall of the former St. Andrew sanctuary. At many of the masonry mullions, extensive spalling has occurred. These are all items which relate solely to preserving the waterproof integrity of the existing structure; such expenditures would do nothing to add additional or improved spaces for student use. Moreover, the building is difficult to heat and is cold much of the school year. The Minnesota Supreme Court has held: “To permanently deny an owner the beneficial use of his property except by requiring him to make a substantial investment in repairs and renovations, over his objection, would constitute a ‘taking’ for which the owner has a right to compensation. *Powderly v. Erickson*, 301 N.W.2d 324, 326 (Minn. 1981).

The former St. Andrew Church building was constructed in 1927 to serve a specific purpose. Its upper floor consists mainly of an open space with very high, arched ceilings. For several years, TCGIS has attempted to “make do” and use this space as a multi-purpose room, including as a gymnasium. It is too small and its shape too irregular, however, even to accommodate a junior high basketball or volleyball court. The noise levels in this space are very high and are distracting. The floor surfacing in the former St. Andrew sanctuary acts like concrete and negatively impacts both on student health and on the enjoyment of physical activity. The larger space is not easily divisible. In order to provide a complete physical education program for its students, TCGIS has identified that it needs a purpose-built gymnasium capable of holding a full-sized basketball court, and which is divisible into two half-court spaces. This identical desire for modern physical education facilities confronted Maternity of Mary-St. Andrew School, which determined that it needed to build an entirely new gym facility. If Maternity of Mary-St. Andrew School found that it required a new, convertible gym space for its enrollment of under 200 students, then it is logical to conclude that there is a much greater need for such a facility for TCGIS, which has over 500 students.

The cafeteria facilities in the basement social hall of the former St. Andrew Church building are clearly second rate. There is no natural lighting. The small size of the cafeteria requires an extended period for school lunch which negatively impacts classroom instruction and student performance. The corner stairwells in the former St. Andrew Church building are unusable and create hidden spaces which cannot be easily observed by the school staff. There is no practical alternative to new construction in order to meet TCGIS’ need for six classrooms, a safe and modern gym, and an inviting cafeteria.

The Use of the Former St. Andrew Campus for a Public Charter School Has Been Found to Comply with the City's Comprehensive Plan

In the report to the Commissioners of the St. Paul HRA, recommending approval for the issuance of the revenue bonds to be used for the acquisition of the former St. Andrew campus, the March 27, 2013 staff report considered whether the proposed educational use of the property complied with the City's Comprehensive Plan. The staff report provided as follows:

Public Purpose/Comprehensive Plan Conformance

The North End-South Como District 6 Plan vision calls for residents to have "improved access to services and to parks, schools, jobs, and institutions they value" (pg3). Maintaining this site as an educational facility will help assure that residents have good access to schools.

Saint Paul Comprehensive Plan Strategy LU 1.55: Collaborate with public and private elementary and secondary schools in conjunction with construction or major remodeling.

Saint Paul Comprehensive Plan Strategy LU 1.58: Collaborate with school organizations to promote neighborhood improvement in conjunction with school construction or major remodeling.

Furthermore, this project will create construction jobs and provide opportunities for an additional 25 new full-time jobs due to increasing student enrollment (added to the existing 30 jobs resulting in total full-time employment of 55).

When the question of whether the St. Andrew Church building should receive Heritage Preservation Designation was recently before the Planning Commission, it found that such designation would be contrary to the current City Comprehensive Plan.

The City has conducted an objective assessment of this property's historic value on three separate occasions, and on each has determined that historic preservation was not warranted or applicable. That alone should be sufficient to foreclose further consideration of the matter. This is especially true given that, when the City recently took up this question for a fourth time, nothing about the building itself had changed. The only thing that had changed was that TCGIS proposed to replace the building with a new structure more suited to its needs. But the threat of replacement/demolition cannot imbue a building with historic value that it was not previously determined to have. Viewed against the prior assessments, it is clear that this latest determination is driven more by fear of loss and change than by an impartial evaluation of the merits.



May 10, 2019
Page 11

It is Simply Unfair for the City to Impose New and Changed Rules for the Property

There is also a question of simple fairness. The former St. Andrew Church has never previously been considered worthy of historic designation or forced preservation.

In the Merger Agreement between St. Andrew and Blessed Virgin, the two congregations agreed that St. Andrew “shall be merged into, consolidated with and continue in the Church of the Maternity of the Blessed Virgin, Saint Paul, Minnesota.” The historical and spiritual home of the St. Andrew congregation is still in the City of Saint Paul: it may be found on North Dale Street, within the Blessed Virgin Church. There were multiple options available to the two congregations. The option they chose was to sell the former St. Andrew campus for over \$2 million for use as a public school, with numerous restrictions, but none requiring preservation of any part of the property not removed to Blessed Virgin Church.

TCGIS has proceeded at all times in good-faith. It has brought education, life, and vitality to what might otherwise be an empty and vacated school and church. TCGIS did not remove any property from the tax rolls; it was tax exempt as a church and remains so as a public school. TCGIS has spent over \$8 million in acquisition costs, remodeling, and construction of a new school building, additional off-street parking, and improved children’s play areas. TCGIS is prepared to make further investment into its Como neighborhood home. Fairness demands that the City of Saint Paul not change the rules governing development at this late date! The negative consequences of designating a former church building for heritage preservation, against the owner’s wishes, may chill the willingness of other buyers from investing in such structures, for fear that their properties, too, might later be designated against their will. This could lead to an increase in vacant buildings, which will negatively impact city residents and their property values.

The Best Decision for Heritage Preservation is to Deny Designation to the Former St. Andrew Church Building, and Allow TCGIS to Create a Modern School Campus

Historical preservation is about more than bricks and mortar. From the Germania National Bank to the Jacob Schmidt Brewing Company, a substantial portion of Saint Paul’s history was made by German-speaking immigrants from Central and Eastern Europe. Our Germanic ancestors constructed much of the City’s built environment, developed many of its civic institutions, and brewed its beer. The Catholic Archbishops in Saint Paul created separate parishes so that the German-speaking immigrants from different ethnic and cultural backgrounds could each find a Church representative of the traditions and worship styles from their native lands. But, times have changed. Saint Paul’s population has changed and religious practices have changed.

The 1927 former St. Andrew Church building was built for a special purpose which no longer exists. Since 2013, the City of Saint Paul has encouraged and aided TCGIS in improving and expanding on the former St. Andrew campus. To now require TCGIS to preserve a property which was sold by the Blessed Virgin Church without any historical restriction, would severely



May 10, 2019

Page 12

disrupt and prevent TCGIS from fulfilling its goals of providing a truly world class education for Kindergarten through Grade 8 students in Saint Paul. There are far better ways to provide for the preservation of Saint Paul's cultural heritage and the important role of the Catholic Church in that history, than in designating the former St. Andrew Church building as an untouchable heritage building.

TCGIS suggests that the best way to preserve an appreciation of Saint Paul's Germanic heritage is for the City to fully support what is happening today inside the walls of TCGIS, where children are preparing for engaged world citizenship by speaking fluent German. Today, Germany is the economic powerhouse in the European Union. German-developed technology leads the world in such fields as computing, business, and industry. The Twin Cities German Immersion School provides instruction and context for young people to succeed in preparing for careers in science, business, and international development. TCGIS asks the Saint Paul City Council to follow the example of the City's Planning Commission, and **not** designate the former St. Andrew Church building for heritage preservation.

Very truly yours,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Marc J Manderscheid".

Marc J Manderscheid

On Behalf of the Twin Cities German
Immersion School and the Twin Cities
German Immersion School Building
Company

MJM/npw

cc: Peter Warner, Assistant City Attorney