

**SUMMARY MINUTES OF THE HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION**  
CITY OF SAINT PAUL, MINNESOTA  
Lower Level – Room 41, City Hall/Court House, 15 West Kellogg Boulevard  
**June 24, 2010**

---

---

**Present:** Robert Ferguson, Rich Laffin, Jennifer Haskamp, Pat Igo, John Manning, Lee Meyer, Mark Thomas, David Riehle, Steve Trimble, Diane Trout-Oertel

**Absent:** Matt Mazanec (excused)

**Staff Present:** Christine Boulware, Amy Spong

---

---

**PUBLIC HEARING**

**CALL TO ORDER:** 5:07 PM by Pat Igo (Vice Chair)

**I. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA – Riehle, Laffin 9-0**

**II. CONFLICTS OF INTEREST – none stated**

**III. CHAIR’S ANNOUNCEMENTS**

- A. Suggested that commissioners visit Ramsey County Historical Society to check out their new archival collection room/research center.
- B. Discuss HPC education focus or have a subcommittee discussion at the next business meeting (July 8)

**IV. STAFF ANNOUNCEMENTS**

- A. May Design Review Statistics (see attached)
- B. State Historic Tax Credit presentation last week by Britta Bloomberg (SHPO) and Bonnie MacDonald (PAM) to PED and Port Authority staff.
- C. CLG Scholarship application to attend State Historic Preservation Conference in Winona – September 16 & 17. Gauge commissioner interest.

**V. PERMIT REVIEW/PUBLIC HEARING**

- A. **1695 Summit Avenue**, Summit West Historic District, by Shelter Architecture, for a building permit to remove the two-stall, detached garage and construct a two-stall, detached garage. **File#10-027**

Kurt Gough, architect, was present to discuss the proposal. There was discussion about the roof shape, the scale of the proposed garage and the expense of constructing a taller gabled roof versus a hipped roof. There were questions about how visible the garage would be, the use of brick and the placement of the window.

**Ferguson motioned to approve the application striking staff recommendations 1 and 3. Meyer seconded the motion.** Ferguson stated the hipped roof is more appropriate and the street-facing elevation of the garage does not need a window. He altered finding number 4 to read that the shallow hipped roof does not match the main house, but does match other secondary structures on the alley. **The motion was approved 5-3 (Laffin, Riehle & Trimble)**

- B. **1009 Summit Avenue**, Hill Historic District, by Jet Construction and Remodeling, Inc, for a building permit to construct a new four-stall, detached garage. **File #10-028**

Richard Dana, Jet Construction and Michael Kloti, architect, were present to discuss the project. Thomas had questions about the early brick garage. Dana explained they worked with staff on the design and materials. Kloti stated they wanted to match details of the house. Laffin asked that they simplify the design to all brick at the base. There was clarification that the Hardishingle would have a straight edge and discussion about the window materials, locations and surrounds.

**Laffin motioned to approve the application with staff recommendations 1-4 with the addition that the mock-up panel show only brick at the base. Meyer seconded the motion. The motion was approved 9-0.**

## **VI. PRE-APPLICATION REVIEW**

**A. North Side of East Sixth Street between Sibley and Wacouta Streets,** Lowertown Historic District, by City of Saint Paul – Public Works, for a pre-application review to reconstruct and widen the existing sidewalk for patio seating.

Mike Michaud, Real Estate, and Joe Spencer, Mayor's Office, were present to discuss the preliminary plans. Commissioner Igo asked about the Meritage example, ADA, and if private or city money would be used. Michaud replied the full cost would be accessed to the building owners on the block. Spencer stated the idea came from how the bus shelter interacts on the sidewalk and the need to extend the energy and momentum out toward the park. The suggestion came from the city. Commissioner Meyer asked about the community response to the plans. Spencer replied there is concern about the impacts to traffic and the impact to the quality of life for the area residents. The Capitol River Council is supportive, but wants to look at temporary/seasonal installation. Commissioner Laffin asked about the loss of parking and looking for ways for people to get into and enjoy the city. He asked for a better tree plan so the trees aren't planted and left there to die. Michaud stated they don't want to install large grates. Commissioner Manning reminded the final plan would come back to the HPC for review and right now the commission needs to give general direction to the applicants. He suggested they look for examples of something comparable in other historic districts. There was discussion about the flexibility and interpretation of the grid plan. Manning asked for more information about fencing the areas. Staff reminded it will need to be of an appropriate material and design and visually open. Trout-Oertel asked that the objections that have been heard by residents and business owners be ranked. Spencer listed: 1. quality of life, 2. traffic flow and parking, 3. loss of business parking. Spencer also cited a Lowertown parking study that was completed by Smart Trips a few years back.

Manning asked the commissioners to summarize their comments for the applicant: Meyer stated it was a great plan. Igo added he did not have a problem with three lanes and the historic configuration. Thomas stated it would encourage bringing people into the historic landscape. Manning clarified that the widening of the sidewalks would affect the historic gridplan, the permanent installation would have an impact on the historic district and tree planting was an issue. The HPC had some comfort level with the widening of the sidewalk. There was discussion about the bus stop need and location.

## **VII.COMMITTEE REPORTS**

- A.** 3M Committee update (Trimble, Mazanec) – The HPC will write a letter to the Port Authority requesting that a National Register Nomination be written for the historic core. A letter should be written to SHPO as well asking that Building 21 be included in the consideration. Building 21 was left out of the historic district boundaries and would not be eligible for tax credits. At the design group workshop there was discussion about the view from Phalen and public art. The history group’s discussion about interpretive panels is ongoing.
- B.** Public Safety Building update (Manning, Igo) – Four proposals were received. The 106 Group was contracted for the documentation. Things will move ahead with City Council approval. The building will not be demolished until the project begins to move forward, most likely in 2011.
- C.** Public Art St. Paul Stewardship Committee (Laffin) – none

## **VIII. ADJOURN : 7:00pm**

Submitted by: C. Boulware