

Below is the email chain to HPC staff George Gause concerning the application for new construction at 542 Portland Avenue. Emails are in order of date received.

Re: 542 Portland, second triplex

 Gar Hargens <gar@closearchitects.com>
To  Graybar, Matthew (CI-StPaul);  Gause, George (CI-StPaul)
Cc  Ann Schroder And Nick Marcucci;  WENDY SURPRISE;  Simon Jette-Nantel;  Missy Thompson;  Daniel Chouinard;
 John Sularz;  Sam Isaacson;  Elena Esters;  Patty Voje;  Claire Wahmanholm;  Daniel Lupton; **+4 others**
Retention Policy Inbox and Inbox sub-folders (6 months) Expires 3/11/2021
 You replied to this message on 9/13/2020 9:50 AM.

 Reply  Reply All  Forward 

Sat 9/12/2020 7:38 PM

Think Before You Click: This email originated outside our organization.

Hi Matt (and George),

I hope you're doing well.

Our Portland Ave. block (many neighbors already in the Cc: column) is now very concerned about the thought of a second triplex at 542. I've offered to collect comments and get them to you before the 18th. It would help us understand exactly what's being proposed if we could see some plans (site and floor) and any elevations or perspectives of the project. Is that possible?

Since we are in an HPC District, I also wonder how that review is planned.

Thanks!

Gar

Gar Hargens AIA, NCARB
President/Owner
Close Associates Incorporated, Architects
612-339-0979 office and cell

RE: 542 Portland, second triplex

 Gause, George (CI-StPaul)
To  Gar Hargens;  Graybar, Matthew (CI-StPaul)
Cc  Ann Schroder And Nick Marcucci;  WENDY SURPRISE;  Simon Jette-Nantel;  Missy Thompson;  Daniel Chouinard;
 John Sularz;  Sam Isaacson;  Elena Esters;  Patty Voje;  Claire Wahmanholm;  Daniel Lupton; **+5 others**
Retention Policy Inbox and Inbox sub-folders (6 months) Expires 3/12/2021
 Sullivan - Front View.jpg
744 KB

 Reply  Reply All  Forward 

Sun 9/13/2020 9:18 AM

Gar,

This is scheduled to be heard by the HPC on Monday, September 21st at 3:30. I have attached the Summit Avenue perspective drawing that staff has received. The full set of plans and staff report will be on our website www.stpaul.gov/HPC by Tuesday of next week.

 **George Gause**
Historic Preservation Supervisor
Pronouns He/Him
Planning & Economic Development
25 4th Street West, ste 1400
Saint Paul, MN 55102
P: 651-266-6714
george.gause@ci.stpaul.mn.us
   

RE: 542 Portland, second triplex



Gause, George (CI-StPaul)

To ○ Gar Hargens

Retention Policy Inbox and Inbox sub-folders (6 months)

Expires 3/12/2021

↩ Reply ↩ Reply All → Forward ⋮

Sun 9/13/2020 9:51 AM

Gar,

Has the developer met with any of the neighbors about the project? If not, staff could sponsor a Skype meeting so this could be discussed prior to going in front of the HPC.

Re: 542 Portland, second triplex



Gar Hargens <gar@closearchitects.com>

To ● Gause, George (CI-StPaul)

Cc ● Graybar, Matthew (CI-StPaul); ○ Ann Schroder And Nick Marcucci; ○ WENDY SURPRISE; ○ Simon Jette-Nantel; ○ Missy Thompson; ○ Daniel Chouinard; ○ John Sularz; ○ Sam Isaacson; ○ Elena Esters; ○ Patty Voje; **+7 others**

Retention Policy Inbox and Inbox sub-folders (6 months)

Expires 3/12/2021

↩ Reply ↩ Reply All → Forward ⋮

Sun 9/13/2020 11:46 AM

Think Before You Click: This email originated outside our organization.

Thanks George,

The perspective is helpful but raises many questions. We'll look forward to seeing the additional drawings.

Gar

Gar Hargens AIA, NCARB
President/Owner
Close Associates Incorporated, Architects
612-339-0979 office and cell

Re: 542 Portland, second triplex



Gar Hargens <gar@closearchitects.com>

To ● Gause, George (CI-StPaul)

Cc ● Graybar, Matthew (CI-StPaul); ○ Ann Schroder And Nick Marcucci; ○ WENDY SURPRISE; ○ Simon Jette-Nantel; ○ Missy Thompson; ○ Daniel Chouinard; ○ John Sularz; ○ Sam Isaacson; ○ Elena Esters; ○ Patty Voje; **+7 others**

Retention Policy Inbox and Inbox sub-folders (6 months)

Expires 3/12/2021

↩ Reply ↩ Reply All → Forward ⋮

Sun 9/13/2020 1:41 PM

i You replied to this message on 9/14/2020 11:35 AM.

Think Before You Click: This email originated outside our organization.

We who are mostly West of 542 just heard about the project Friday. We have reached out to the Ramsey Hill Assoc. They heard on Thursday. I'll forward Jason's (Vice chairmen) message.

We would have expected to hear from the developer and would like to talk with now.

Thanks!

Fwd: 542 Portland?



Gar Hargens <gar@closearchitects.com>

To Gause, George (CI-StPaul)

Retention Policy [Inbox and Inbox sub-folders \(6 months\)](#)

missy.staples.thompson@gmail.com

Reply	Reply All	Forward
-------	-----------	---------

Sun 9/13/2020

Expires 3/12/2021

Begin forwarded message:

From: Jason Patalonis <jtpatalonis@earthlink.net>
Date: September 13, 2020 at 1:27:45 PM CDT
To: Missy Thompson <missy.staples.thompson@gmail.com>
Subject: RE: 542 Portland?

No they have only presented to SUPC which approved their plans as has the HPC. We, the board, just heard about this at our Zoom board meeting on Thursday. Our SUPC rep had not reported on it.

I am not in favor bit look forward to connecting tomorrow. Got to run.

-----Original Message-----

From: Missy Thompson [<mailto:missy.staples.thompson@gmail.com>]
Sent: Sunday, September 13, 2020 1:24 PM
To: Jason Patalonis <jtpatalonis@earthlink.net>
Subject: Re: 542 Portland?

Happy to talk tomorrow, but quickly - has the 542 developer reached out to RHA?

Missy Staples Thompson
651-769-7183
missy.staples.thompson@gmail.com

540 Portland



Gause, George (CI-StPaul)

To carlos@sketchesllc.com

Retention Policy [Inbox and Inbox sub-folders \(6 months\)](#)

Reply	Reply All	Forward	
-------	-----------	---------	--

Mon 9/14/2020 8:40 AM

Expires 3/13/2021

Carlos,

I have heard from neighbors over the weekend about the ADU proposal. They say that no one spoke to them about the proposal. Although it is not required, we always suggest that applicants speak to surrounding property owners so they know that a project is coming.

I believe that this will cause the commission meeting to be difficult and likely result in the commission deferring the application until you meet with the neighbors.

I suggest going ahead and postponing the application to October 5th now and meeting with nearby neighbors for a discussion. Staff can sponsor a Skype meeting if you would like.

I need to know quickly since we need to post plans this afternoon.

Let me know.

RE: 540 Portland



carlos@sketchesllc.com

To Gause, George (CI-StPaul); Suhan Eggers, Allison (CI-StPaul)

Cc olov@swedishcraftsman.com

Retention Policy [Inbox and Inbox sub-folders \(6 months\)](#)

Expires 3/13/2021

Reply Reply All Forward

Mon 9/14/2020 11:12 AM

Think Before You Click: This email originated outside our organization.

George, Allison;

Thank you for bringing up to our attention the neighbor's concerns. We'll be glad to meet with the neighbors and go over their concerns in regard to our project. It would be great if you could sponsor the Skype meeting so everybody can participate. HPC participation would be greatly appreciated. In the meantime, please let us know if there is anything we can do to facilitate the process.

I reached out to Matthew Graybar this morning to bring him up to speed about the neighbor's concerns noted below. We may moved the variance out as well, so we can meet with the neighbors before the meeting with the Board of Zoning Appeals. We'll keep you posted in that regard.

Please consider this email official notification to postpone the HPC application for the meeting on October 5th.

Should you have any comments or questions, please let us know.

Best regards.

Ps. + Olov Strole, the project contractor.

[Sketches LLC](#)

Carlos R. Pérez | Architect | NCARB

RE: 542 Portland, second triplex



Gause, George (CI-StPaul)

To Gar Hargens

Cc Graybar, Matthew (CI-StPaul); Ann Schroder And Nick Marcucci; WENDY SURPRISE; Simon Jette-Nantel; Missy Thompson; Daniel Chouinard; John Sularz; Sam Isaacson; Elena Esters; Patty Voje; **+7 others**

Retention Policy [Inbox and Inbox sub-folders \(6 months\)](#)

Expires 3/13/2021

Reply Reply All Forward

Mon 9/14/2020 11:36 AM

I spoke with the architect. They will postpone the HPC meeting until October 5th to give time to meet with neighbors. I believe the BZA case is also postponed.

I can sponsor a Skype meeting. What are the times that neighbors can call in and discuss?

RE: 540 Portland



Gause, George (CI-StPaul)

To carlos@sketchesllc.com; Suhan Eggers, Allison (CI-StPaul)

Cc olov@swedishcraftsman.com

Retention Policy [Inbox and Inbox sub-folders \(6 months\)](#)

Expires 3/13/2021

Reply Reply All Forward

Mon 9/14/2020 11:40 AM

Ok,

I will reschedule you to the October 5th HPC meeting.

I will reach out to the neighbors and see what times are good for a Skype meeting.

Do you have some times that are better than others to meet?

Re: 542 Portland, second triplex



Gar Hargens <gar@closearchitects.com>

To Gause, George (CI-StPaul)

Cc Graybar, Matthew (CI-StPaul); Ann Schroder And Nick Marcucci; WENDY SURPRISE; Simon Jette-Nantel; Missy Thompson; Daniel Chouinard; John Sularz; Sam Isaacson; Elena Esters; Patty Voje; **+8 others**

Mon 9/14/2020 1:52 PM

Retention Policy Inbox and Inbox sub-folders (6 months)

Expires 3/13/2021

You replied to this message on 9/14/2020 2:48 PM.

Think Before You Click: This email originated outside our organization.

That's great George. Thank you! That should give us all time to learn about and consider such an important project.

I'm glad to organize these neighbors but I wonder if the Skype discussion should be set up by the Ramsey Hill Association. They also just learned of this. We've reached out to them but haven't connected yet by phone. Feel free to notify them of your plan. We look forward to Zoning's posting of plans on Tuesday. Late afternoon is good for me for a Skype. Thursday is my only open day this week, next is better.

Thanks!

Gar

Gar Hargens AIA, NCARB
 President/Owner
 Close Associates Incorporated, Architects
 612-339-0979 office and cell

RE: 542 Portland, second triplex



Gause, George (CI-StPaul)

To Gar Hargens

Cc Ann Schroder And Nick Marcucci; WENDY SURPRISE; Simon Jette-Nantel; Missy Thompson; Daniel Chouinard; John Sularz; Sam Isaacson; Elena Esters; Patty Voje; Claire Wahmanholm; Daniel Lupton; **+4 others**

Mon 9/14/2020 2:49 PM

Retention Policy Inbox and Inbox sub-folders (6 months)

Expires 3/13/2021

I folks could respond to this email with a time from the list that works best I can set up the Skype meeting:

Best time to meet

3:00pm	4:00pm	5:00pm	6:00pm	7:00pm	Other (write in)

Best day to meet

Thursday 9/17	Tuesday 9/22	Wednesday 9/23	Thursday 9/24	Other (write in)



George Gause
Historic Preservation Supervisor

Pronouns He/Him
 Planning & Economic Development
 25 4th Street West, ste 1400
 Saint Paul, MN 55102
 P: 651-266-6714
george.gause@ci.stpaul.mn.us



Re: 542 Portland, second triplex



Gar Hargens <gar@closearchitects.com>

To ○ Ann Schroder And Nick Marcucci

Cc ● Graybar, Matthew (CI-StPaul); ● Gause, George (CI-StPaul); ○ WENDY SURPRISE; ○ Simon Jette-Nantel; ○ Missy Thompson; ○ Daniel Chouinard; ○ John Sularz; ○ Sam Isaacson; ○ Elena Esters; ○ Patty Voje; ○ Claire Wahmanholm; +7 others

Retention Policy Inbox and Inbox sub-folders (6 months)

Expires 3/14/2021

↩ Reply

↩ Reply All

➔ Forward



Tue 9/15/2020 10:04 AM

Think Before You Click: This email originated outside our organization.

Hi Nick and thanks,

Missy and I just had time to give this a once over.

I agree with all you've said. I'm also disappointed that instead of following the Secretary of the Interior's Standards/instructions to design buildings that reflect our time (but respect the fenestration, massing, and materials of surrounding structures), this design is a poor amalgamation of historic house style(s). If treated as a carriage house (as you point out) it could have following the historic neighborhood pattern of large, simple, secondary structures and been also honored the Standards as a fairly simple, contemporary building. I also have many questions about parking and the variances.

It's distressing that many of us are just now learning about this project that apparently has been in the review process pre-pandemic.

Gar

Gar Hargens AIA, NCARB
President/Owner
Close Associates Incorporated, Architects
612-339-0979 office and cell

On Sep 14, 2020, at 6:50 PM, AnnNick SchroderMarcucci <alsnjm@gmail.com> wrote:

Gar, looking at the plans this project is similar to the placement of a typical Ramsey Hill carriage house - the issue is that is much larger, not of similar scale and tries to be a Summit Avenue mansion which it is not because of placement. It also looks like the additional parking does not take into account for the parking of the existing triplex needs and how it is used for parking today. I believe the design has merit on a much larger piece of property.

Nick Marcucci AIA

Sent from my iPad

HPC Notice



Gause, George (CI-StPaul)

To ○ Gar Hargens

Retention Policy Inbox and Inbox sub-folders (6 months)

Expires 3/16/2021

↩ Reply

↩ Reply All

➔ Forward



Thu 9/17/2020 9:15 AM

This is the most recent version, but you made changes to another copy. Click here to see the other versions.

Gar

I received your message. We have postponed the application from the 9/21 meeting to 10/5. We can't postpone any further or the application would be approved automatically due to our 60 day action rule in Ordinance (§73.06f Limitations).

The HPC agenda was posted in the Legal Ledger on September 10, 2020. Agendas are also sent out via Early Notification System (ENS) on September 10, 2020. We have no other notice obligations, but have been looking at other notice programs. Notice costs money and it will likely bring up the old argument of having a fee for HPC applications.

I recommend neighbors signing up for City ENS at www.stpaul.gov. It is the only way to be sure to have the latest, accurate information about what is happening.

I still have several people to hear for the meeting. As soon as I know I will send out the meeting invite.

542 Portland Avenue concerns



cathy maes <timcathymaes@gmail.com>

To Gause, George (CI-StPaul)

Retention Policy Inbox and Inbox sub-folders (6 months)

Expires 3/16/2021



9/17/2020

You replied to this message on 9/17/2020 9:29 AM.

Think Before You Click: This email originated outside our organization.

Good morning George,

I hope that this email finds you well. I know that you are aware of the concerns about 542 Portland Ave as it pertains to the process, protocols, timeline and last minute letter informing the neighborhood of the pending hearing.

Could we have a conversation today? I propose that we dial back, reconvene the HPC and give the neighbors their ability to weigh in on a site that affects them. I would also appreciate you sharing the history of the site and timeline since the February 10 HPC pre-application meeting to today.

Thank you for your consideration.

--

Cathy Maes, Ramsey Hill Association President

952-992-0000 (cell)

RE: 542 Portland Avenue concerns



Gause, George (CI-StPaul)

To 'tcmaes@comcast.net'

Retention Policy Inbox and Inbox sub-folders (6 months)

Expires 3/16/2021



Thu 9/17/2020 9:29 AM

Hi Cathy,

We have postponed the application from the 9/21 meeting to 10/5. We can't postpone any further or the application would be approved automatically due to our 60 day action rule in Ordinance (§73.06f Limitations).

The HPC agenda was posted in the Legal Ledger on September 10, 2020. Agendas are also sent out via Early Notification System (ENS) on September 10, 2020. We have no other notice obligations, but have been looking at other notice programs. Notice costs money and it will likely bring up the old argument of having a fee for HPC applications.

I recommend neighbors signing up for City ENS at www.stpaul.gov. It is the only way to be sure to have the latest, accurate information about what is happening.

540 Portland meeting



Gause, George (CI-StPaul)

To carlos@sketchesllc.com

Retention Policy | Inbox and Inbox sub-folders (6 months)

Expires 3/16/2021

Reply Reply All Forward

Thu 9/17/2020 2:55 PM

Hi Carlos,

Looks like the most people can make 6:00pm on Tuesday September 22nd. Does that work for you?

RE: 540 Portland meeting



carlos@sketchesllc.com

To Gause, George (CI-StPaul)

Cc olov@swedishcraftsman.com

Retention Policy | Inbox and Inbox sub-folders (6 months)

Expires 3/16/2021

Reply Reply All Forward

Thu 9/17/2020 3:33 PM

Think Before You Click: This email originated outside our organization.

Hi George – That will work great. I am copying Olov Strole the contractor. He'll be attending as well.

Thank you for organizing and helping put this together.

[Sketches LLC](#)

Carlos R. Pérez | Architect | NCARB

Neighborhood Meeting about new Carriage House at 540 Portland



Gause, George (CI-StPaul)

Required Gause, George (CI-StPaul); Gar Hargens; WENDY SURPRISE; Simon Jette-Nantel;

Missy Thompson; Daniel Chouinard; Ann Schroder And Nick Marcucci; **+ 14 others**

Optional Suhan Eggers, Allison (CI-StPaul)

Retention Policy | Inbox and Inbox sub-folders (6 months)

Expires 3/17/2021

No Response Required

Fri 9/18/2020 9:59 AM

As the meeting organizer, you do not need to respond to the meeting.

Tuesday, September 22, 2020 6:00 PM-7:00 PM Skype Meeting

← From Sep 19		Allison Vacation; Yellowstone National Park; Allison Suhan	To Sep 29 →
6 ^{PM}	Neighborhood Meeting about new Carriage House at 540 Portland Skype Meeting Gause, George (CI-StPaul)		
7			

This is a meeting concerning the HPC application for the new carriage house behind 542 Portland, addressed as 540 Portland. This meeting uses the program *Skype for Business* which is a free application available for download or you may use the call-in numbers on your phone.

This is a chance for neighbors to ask questions and present comments to the architect and builder of the project.

City of Saint Paul HP staff are sponsoring the meeting. No commissioners will be in attendance.

The application is scheduled to be heard at the October 5th HPC meeting.

Meeting tonight



Gause, George (CI-StPaul)

To timcathymaes@gmail.com

Retention Policy [Inbox and Inbox sub-folders \(6 months\)](#)

Expires 3/21/2021

[↩ Reply](#)

[↩ Reply All](#)

[→ Forward](#)

Tue 9/22/2020 8:48

Hi Cathy,

Here are the parameters for tonight's meeting:

Meeting with Architect and Contractor concerning application to build carriage house at 540 (542) Portland Avenue.

- This meeting is in relation to the HPC application, not the BZA application
- This meeting is for residents to learn more about the application
- None of the discussion will be forwarded on to the HPC or BZA
- Send an email with comments you want to give the HPC to george.gause@stpaul.gov by Friday, October 2nd.

- This meeting is for questions about design, materials and placement the proposed project
- Residents can relate concerns about the design, materials and placement the proposed project
- Residents can relate suggestions about the design, materials and placement the proposed project
- NOT discussing the Use or number of units or zoning variances (that is a BZA issue)
- NOT discussing other issues
- Speakers have 2-3 minutes (please do not repeat comments)

Not sure if that may clear up any confusion. Give me a call if you would like to discuss.

RE: Neighborhood Meeting about new Carriage House at 540 Portland



Gause, George (CI-StPaul)

To [Gar Hargens](#); [WENDY SURPRISE](#); [Simon Jette-Nantel](#); [Missy Thompson](#); [Daniel Chouinard](#); [Ann Schroder And Nick Marcucci](#); [Emilia Mettenbrink](#); [Laura Kindseth](#); [Daniel Lupton](#); **+ 10 others**
Cc [Suhan Eggers, Allison \(CI-StPaul\)](#)

Retention Policy [Inbox and Inbox sub-folders \(6 months\)](#)

Expires 3/21/2021

[↩ Reply](#)

[↩ Reply All](#)

[→ Forward](#)

Tue 9/22/2020 8:48

Here are the parameters for tonight's meeting:

Meeting with Architect and Contractor concerning application to build carriage house at 540 (542) Portland Avenue. 6:00pm

- This meeting is in relation to the HPC application, not the BZA application
- This meeting is for residents to learn more about the application
- None of the discussion will be forwarded on to the HPC or BZA
- Send an email with comments you want to give the HPC to george.gause@stpaul.gov by Friday, October 2nd.

- This meeting is for questions about design, materials and placement the proposed project
- Residents can relate concerns about the design, materials and placement the proposed project
- Residents can relate suggestions about the design, materials and placement the proposed project
- NOT discussing the Use or number of units or zoning variances (that is a BZA issue)
- NOT discussing other issues
- Speakers have 2-3 minutes (please do not repeat comments)

Please contact me if there are questions

RE: Neighborhood Meeting about new Carriage House at 540 Portland

 carlos@sketchesllc.com Reply Reply All Forward ... Tue 9/22/2020 9:36 PM

To ['Gar Hargens'](#); ['WENDY SURPRISE'](#); ['Simon Jette-Nantel'](#); ['Missy Thompson'](#); ['Daniel Chouinard'](#);
['Ann Schroder And Nick Marcucci'](#); ['Emilia Mettenbrink'](#); ['Laura Kindseth'](#); ['Daniel Lupton'](#); + 10 others

Cc [olov@swedishcraftsman.com](#); [Graybar, Matthew \(CI-StPaul\)](#); [Gause, George \(CI-StPaul\)](#);
[Suhan Eggers, Allison \(CI-StPaul\)](#)

Retention Policy [Inbox and Inbox sub-folders \(6 months\)](#) Expires 3/21/2021

 2020-09-14 HPC Neighbors Package.pdf.pdf 7 MB

To all,

Thank you again for your participation and input during our Neighborhood Meeting today. We took note of all the comments so we can review them one by one. Making point of Missy's observation, it would have been ideal having this discussion in the earlier stages of the project, as probably we could have avoided some frustration. We have received very positive feedback during the application process and we weren't expecting a negative response from the neighbors. We have followed up all the necessary jurisdiction pre-requisites, including meeting with the Summit-University District, but additional engagement with the neighbors would have been also our preference.

Although we tried to address most comments as they were being posted during tonight's meeting, some comments will require follow up. We would be glad to sponsor another "un-official" meeting with the neighbors to address some of the open items, and also any other concerns that were not brought up during tonight's discussion (just to be clear, this would be an off the record meeting, and any comments you may have for the jurisdiction will need to be forwarded to the City through the proper channels). We would recommend using Teams platform for the follow up meeting, taking in consideration this is a large group and the current health safety concerns due to Covid19. We would like to tentatively propose a meeting time for this coming Saturday, September 26, in the afternoon or evening. With a large group like this is always hard to get a date and time that works for everybody, but I hope this works for most of you. It would be great if one of the neighbors could take charge to coordinate a specific time, so we can send the Teams invite no later than Thursday.

Per Anne's request, I have included a pdf version (reduced: code compliance and construction detailing have been removed) of the HPC package, including the site plan, floor plans, elevations and perspectives.

Thank you again for your time and consideration. Should you have any comments or questions, please let me know.

Notes from 540 meeting

 Gause, George (CI-StPaul) Reply Reply All Forward ... Wed 9/23/2020 9:25 AM

To [carlos@sketchesllc.com](#); [olov@swedishcraftsman.com](#)

Cc [Suhan Eggers, Allison \(CI-StPaul\)](#)

Retention Policy [Inbox and Inbox sub-folders \(6 months\)](#) Expires 3/22/2021

 You forwarded this message on 9/23/2020 9:26 AM.

Here are my notes from the September 22 meeting with neighbors concerning the carriage house at 540 Portland.

Design concerns

There's too much structure on too little of a lot, volume is too much.
Carriage houses are typically much smaller.
Front door is unwelcoming.
Dormer alignment is an issue, it should be set in from the side walls.

Other concerns

Neighborhood didn't know the application had been submitted.
It is a Portland address, but Portland is the backside.
Structure is a carriage house that pretends to be a house.
What happens in front of the property on Summit Ave?
There's no parking, area between buildings is just hardscape-no green space.

It is up to you how many follow up sessions you wish to have with the neighbors, but staff does need to post the staff report and documentation this Monday (September 28). If you are going to make drawing changes we would need them by then or you could withdraw the application and resubmit after some of this is worked out. If you withdraw and resubmit, it would show the commission that you made an attempt to listen to the neighborhood.

Re: Neighborhood Meeting about new Carriage House at 540 Portland



Ann Schroder/Nick Marcucci <alsnjm@gmail.com>

To Gause, George (CI-StPaul)

Cc Gar Hargens; Missy Thompson; carlos@sketchesllc.com; timcathymaes@gmail.com;

Suhan Eggers, Allison (CI-StPaul)

Retention Policy [Inbox and Inbox sub-folders \(6 months\)](#)

Expires [3/22/2021](#)

Reply

Reply All

Forward

Wed 9/23/2020 10:4

You replied to this message on 9/23/2020 11:30 AM.



September 23.pdf
283 KB

Think Before You Click: This email originated outside our organization.

George - attached is my thoughts on the proposed triplex. thanks Nick Marcucci

RE: Neighborhood Meeting about new Carriage House at 540 Portland



Gause, George (CI-StPaul)

To Ann Schroder/Nick Marcucci

Cc Gar Hargens; Missy Thompson; carlos@sketchesllc.com; timcathymaes@gmail.com;

Suhan Eggers, Allison (CI-StPaul)

Retention Policy [Inbox and Inbox sub-folders \(6 months\)](#)

Expires [3/22/2021](#)

Reply

Reply All

Forward



Wed 9/23/2020 11:31 AM

Hi Nick got your email. Thank you, staff will forward this on to the HPC when the hearing occurs.

I did want to address the issue of notice.

The HPC has no formal ordinance requirement for neighborhood notice other than posting the agenda in the Legal Ledger ten days prior to a public hearing and sending the agenda out via the Saint Paul Early Notification System (ENS). Staff also post the staff report and documentation one week prior to a meeting on our website.

Staff does encourage applicants to speak with neighbors, but we can't enforce this as a requirement.

Staff is considering two forms of general notice (yard signs and letters), but who pays for the cost is a factor.

Re: Neighborhood Meeting about new Carriage House at 540 Portland



Gar Hargens <gar@closearchitects.com>

To carlos@sketchesllc.com

Cc WENDY SURPRISE; Simon Jette-Nantel; Missy Thompson; Daniel Chouinard; Ann Schroder And Nick Marcucci; Emilia Mettenbrink; Laura Kindseth; Daniel Lupton; Claire Wahmanholm; Mary Wiley; Patty Voje; +11 others

Retention Policy Inbox and Inbox sub-folders (6 months)

Expires 3/23/2021

Reply	Reply All	Forward	...
-------	-----------	---------	-----

Thu 9/24/2020 10:29 AM

Think Before You Click: This email originated outside our organization.

Hello Carlos,

Thank you for hearing us out on the call the other evening, and for your offer to facilitate further discussion. It is hard to gather all those interested. This weekend, Missy and I will be in a location with poor internet and cel coverage. If that is the preferred time, we will be glad to try to join you.

If we have trouble connecting over the weekend, here are a few more comments:

1. Missy and I walked the Summit side of the site this morning. I hope you will continue to reach out to the absent Summit owner on the East. Regardless, the idea of a false address on Summit is still unacceptable and adds additional construction cost for your client.
2. Secondly, the project is just too large for the site - witness all the requested variances.
3. I have some other thoughts but they should first be shared in discussion with you and our neighbors.

Thanks,

Gar

Re: Neighborhood Meeting about new Carriage House at 540 Portland



Ann Schroder/Nick Marcucci <alsnjm@gmail.com>

To Gause, George (CI-StPaul)

Cc Claire Wahmanholm; Dan Roth; Daniel Chouinard; Daniel Lupton; Elena Esters; Emilia Mettenbrink; Gar Hargens; John Sularz; Laura Kindseth; Mary Wiley; Mason Riddle (masonriddle@mac.com); +9 others

Retention Policy Inbox and Inbox sub-folders (6 months)

Expires 3/26/2021

Reply	Reply All	Forward	...
-------	-----------	---------	-----

Sun 9/27/2020 4:14 PM

Think Before You Click: This email originated outside our organization.

For everyone's information, within a block at the corner of Portland and Mackubin a new 90% solid wood fence (6' but reading the zoning 7' is allowed) has been added along the street property line to a historic house. So, I would think if the people on Summit could do anything they want regarding a fence after these units are built. (During Saturday's online meeting, the developer mentioned that there would no way the Summit Ave. owners could add a wood fence.)

Nick Marcucci

RE: Neighborhood Meeting about new Carriage House at 540 Portland



carlos@sketchesllc.com



To 'Ann Schroder/Nick Marcucci'; Gause, George (Cl-StPaul)

9/27/2020

Cc 'Claire Wahmanholm'; 'Dan Roth'; 'Daniel Chouinard'; 'Daniel Lupton';
 'Elena Esters'; 'Emilia Mettenbrink'; 'Gar Hargens'; 'John Sularz'; + 12 others

Retention Policy Inbox and Inbox sub-folders (6 months)

Expires 3/26/2021

Think Before You Click: This email originated outside our organization.

Hi Nick – Good afternoon and thank you for your note; It was me who made that comment.

Just want to clarify where I was coming from with my comment. Since cedar fences are not a common feature along Summit Avenue front yards (I am not aware of any along the five miles), I would think that type of screening wouldn't be allowed by the HPC as it doesn't match the standard fencing along Summit. Picket fences and planning are the common screening. I don't want to make this into an argument, but I just want to make sure it was clear where I was coming from. Excuse me if my comment was misleading.

We are providing a picket fence a long the front of our project to delineate the property line on the south side, as shown on the image below.



Summit Avenue Elevation

540 Portland Avenue - Revisions from Neighbors



carlos@sketchesllc.com

To Gause, George (CI-StPaul); Suhan Eggers, Allison (CI-StPaul)
Cc olov@swedishcraftsman.com; Graybar, Matthew (CI-StPaul)

Reply Reply All Forward

Mon 9/28/2020 1:56 AM

Retention Policy [Inbox and Inbox sub-folders \(6 months\)](#)

Expires 3/27/2021

2020-09-28 540 Portland Narrative FINAL with Neighbors Comments.pdf
3 MB

Hi George, Allison – Good morning;

What a week – It feels now as we are passing the baton to you. We wanted to make sure we put the revised package in your hands early in the morning so you can have as much as time as possible to complete your report. We have **highlighted in color** the changes to make it easy for you to identify any changes.

This is a brief summary of the changes included:

- Revisions to the narrative (see attached pdf):
 - Revisions to the lot width variance per Matt request. The variance was reduced to 60 ft, in lieu of 73.92 ft., because the existing triplex is non-conforming.
 - Revisions to the narrative for lot area variance to include increased density comment.
 - New section added to summarize comments from neighbors being implemented, including drawings of those changes.
 - The changes are pretty minor and if approved by the HPC they will be easy to implement in the construction package.
 - In my opinion, they are good comments and improve the project. They include:
 - **Revise garage overhead doors to white color in lieu of black.**
 - **Delete glass panel from garage man doors, located on both sides on the new building. New side garage doors to be a solid panel to better differentiate them from side entries into the units.**
 - **Add metal canopy above side entries into units A and C.**
 - **Slide side dormers (approx. twelve inches) on both front and rear elevations of the house to not be aligned with side walls of the house.**
 - Not all comments received from the neighbors were implemented, since some of them completely deviated from the design concept and also from the HPC guidance and recommendations during the preliminary hearing.
 - Letters of support from the neighbors have been added to the report.
- Revisions to the Drawing Package (to follow up on a second email):
 - Includes revisions to the lot width variance noted above.

And that is it 😊. We are really excited about the project, and we are looking towards the HPC hearing on the 5th. Please use this email as official notification of our intent to be included in the agenda for that day. I noticed Barbara Bezat won't be attending. Hopefully she has an opportunity to vote via email.

Thank you so much for all the help!!!

Re: Comments on Requested Variance for 540 Portland Avenue



Mason Riddle <masonriddle@mac.com>

To Dan Roth; Peter Carlsen

Cc Patty Voje; tmaes@comcast.net; Jason Patalonis; Graybar, Matthew (CI-StPaul); Ann Schroder & Nick Marcucci; Gar Hargens; Martin Lacey; Claire Wahmanholm; Daniel Lupton; Elena Esters; John Sularz; **+9 others**

Retention Policy [Inbox and Inbox sub-folders \(6 months\)](#)

Expires [4/3/2021](#)



Mon 10/5/2020 12:41 PM

Hello All-

I am the Heritage Preservation Chair of the Ramsey Hill Association. I have listened with great interest to everyone's thoughts, ideas, opinions and recommendations for and about the proposed 540 Portland triplex. I participated in the last Zoom session on the project, and decided to simply listen. I agree with most of what was said.

With regard to parking, the design for 540 Portland does include 3 incorporated parking spaces for the 3 units, and perhaps I am unclear on others' positions, but there seems to be the notion that there is no parking.

I attended the HPC meeting on Monday 2.10.20, at great length, when this project was presented. As I recall, I was one of a few, if not the only person in the room other than those related to the project (and other projects on the agenda). There was discussion, and attention paid to the Summit facing facade. I think less so to the Portland facing facade, as it is largely obscured by the current standing structure.

I addressed 540 Portland three days later on 2.13.20 at the RHA board meeting, but no discussion took place.

Then, we were all mired in our tracks by 3.15.20. HPC could not address projects at meetings, as we all know.

Again, I agree with what has been stated about this project. Its size and massing do indeed visually and physically overwhelm the site; the footprint is too large, and the variances are an issue. Peter Carlson has done a thorough job, as always, ferreting out the issues and details (and who I added to this email thread). As have others. Thank you.

I would encourage everyone to sign on to the HPC mailing list, if you are not already. Needless to say, the 540 project has been in the works for many months, and many issues are being brought to the table, all warranted, but far into the design process. The HPC meeting was 8 months ago. I also understand that the SUC approved the 540 project at their September meeting.

This is a controversial project. Consequently, I believe it is important to be civil and respectful to each other in these stressful times, particularly on such heated topics, when we can't meet in person. I found respect lacking in a few comments made to Carlos, which made me wince. He was polite and listening to all comments. And answering questions respectfully.

I think with collaboration and respect, a solution will be found and, hopefully, the 540 Portland project will not be built as currently designed.

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Mason Riddle