

**CITY OF SAINT PAUL
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT**

FILE NAME: St. Andrew's Church

HISTORIC NAME(S): The Church of St. Andrew of Saint Paul

CURRENT NAME: Twin Cities German Immersion School

INVENTORY #: RA-SPC-0709

OWNER: Twin Cities German Immersion School Bldg and Educational Properties TCGIS LLC

LOCATION/ADDRESS: 1031 Como Avenue West

HISTORIC ADDRESS: 1051 Cross Street (renamed Como Avenue)

ARCHITECT: Charles A. Hausler

BUILDER: McGough Brothers

DATE OF CONSTRUCTION: 1927

BUILDING PERMIT#: 24765

DATE OF HPC PUBLIC HEARING: November 5, 2018

LEGAL DESCRIPTION: Lot 10 Block 4 of Warrendale

SUBJ TO ESMT, VAC ALLEY ACCRUING AND FOL, BEG AT THE NW COR OF LOT 19 THENCE SELY ON THE NELY LOT LINE 60 FT THENCE S 78 FT TO PT 48.5 FT E AT RA FROM W LINE OF SD LOT THENCE SWLY 41.4 FT TO PT ON S LINE 25 FT E AT RA FROM W LINE THENCE WLY ON SD LINE 28 FT TO SW COR THENCE N 130.7 FT TO POB BEING PT OF LOT 19 ALSO ALL OF LOTS 10 THRU LOT 15 & LOTS 20 THRU LOT 23 BLK 4

PIN(S): 26 29 23 22 0038, 26 29 23 22 0172, 26 29 23 22 0172

WARD: 5

PLANNING DISTRICT: 10

STAFF INVESTIGATION AND REPORT: Christine Boulware

DATE OF REPORT: October 30, 2018

A. PURPOSE: To consider local designation of the St. Andrew's Church as a Saint Paul Heritage Preservation Site.

B. CODE CITATIONS:

1. Section 73.05 (a) of the City's Legislative Code states, in considering the designation of any area, place, building, structure or similar object in the City of Saint Paul as a heritage preservation site; the commission shall apply the following criteria with respect to such designation:
 - (1) **Its character, interest or value as part of the development, heritage or cultural characteristics of the City of Saint Paul, State of Minnesota, or the United States.**
 - (2) Its location as a site of a significant historic event.
 - (3) Its identification with a person or persons who significantly contributed to the culture and development of the City of Saint Paul.
 - (4) **Its embodiment of distinguishing characteristics of an architectural or engineering type or specimen.**
 - (5) **Its identification as the work of an architect, engineer, or master builder whose individual work has influenced the development of the City of Saint Paul.**
 - (6) Its embodiment of elements of architectural or engineering design, detail, materials or craftsmanship which represent a significant architectural or engineering innovation.
 - (7) **Its unique location or singular physical characteristic representing an established and familiar visual feature of a neighborhood, community or the City of Saint Paul.**
2. Section 73.05 states for *Planning commission review*. The heritage preservation commission shall advise the city planning commission of the proposed designation of a

heritage preservation site, including boundaries, and a program for the preservation of a heritage preservation site, and secure from the city planning commission its recommendation with respect to the relationship of the proposed heritage preservation designation to the comprehensive plan of the City of Saint Paul, its opinion as to the effect of the proposed designation upon the surrounding neighborhood, and its opinion and recommendation as to any other planning consideration which may be relevant to the proposed designation, together with its recommendation of approval, rejection or modification of the proposed designation. Said recommendation shall become part of the official record concerning the proposed designation and shall be submitted by the heritage preservation commission along with its recommendation concerning the proposed designation to the city council. The heritage preservation commission may make such modifications, changes and alterations concerning the proposed designations as it deems necessary in consideration of the recommendations of the city planning commission.

3. Section 73.05 states for *Communication with state historical society*. A copy of the heritage preservation commission's proposed designation of a heritage preservation site, including boundaries, and a program for the preservation of a heritage preservation site, shall be sent to the state historical society in accordance with Minnesota Statutes, Section 471.193, Subdivision 6. Section 73.05 states for *Hearings*. Prior to the heritage preservation commission recommending to the city council any building, district or object for designation as a heritage preservation site the commission shall hold a public hearing and seek the recommendation of all concerned citizens
4. Section 73.05 states for *Finding and recommendations*. The heritage preservation commission shall determine if the proposed heritage preservation site(s) is eligible for designation as determined by the criteria specified in paragraph (a) of this section, and if the heritage preservation commission recommends to the city council that the site(s) be designated as a heritage preservation site, the commission shall transmit to the city council with its recommendation its proposed program for the preservation of the site.

C. BACKGROUND:

1. The Historic Sites Survey of St. Paul and Ramsey County was the first comprehensive inventory of historic buildings in St. Paul. The project began in December of 1980 and was completed in May of 1983. While Saint Andrew's is now located in District 10, at the time of the 1983 survey it was in District 6. St. Andrew's Church was inventoried during the survey (RA-SPC-0707) and identified as a Site of Major Significance and the Warrendale neighborhood was identified as a potential historic district. The 1983 survey was the start in developing neighborhood contexts by district council boundaries.
2. In 2001, the HPC commissioned six context studies including *Residential Real Estate Development: 1880-1950* which concluded that the original plat of Warrendale is a strong first candidate for further study as a local historic district and its significance is based on the planning ideas of the original plat, the strength of the developer's original marketing efforts, and the resulting architectural and community character. The context study noted that further study of the architecture and landscape of the area would result in a potential historic district both compact and representative of key ideas of its period of urban and architectural development.

Churches, Synagogues, and Religious Buildings: 1849-1950 notes that at the time of the context study, there are "over seventy surviving churches from this period [1900-1930]"

that have been inventoried. It is not known the number that have been demolished since the context study was completed in 2001. The study describes, "Catholic church construction after 1900 included ... Several still extant twin-towered churches were built during this period, including the Church of St. Casimir at 937 Jessamine Ave. E (1904) and the 1,000-seat Church of St. Bernard (1907) by John Jager. The three-towered Church of St. Andrew at 1051 Como Avenue was completed in 1927."

D. FINDINGS:

1. **Legislative Code Sec. 73.05(b)** - The Planning Commission has not yet weighed in on the designation of St. Andrew's Church.
 - a. **Comprehensive Plan** - The designation is generally consistent with the goals and objectives of the Comprehensive Plan. Specifically, the Historic Preservation Chapter strategies call for designation and protection of historic resources:
 - HP 3.11** - Make the designation of significant historic resources as heritage preservation sites a priority for the City Council.
 - HP 3.12** - Designate historic resources, such as buildings, structures, objects, archaeological sites, historic districts, and landscapes as Saint Paul heritage preservation sites or historic districts; and
 - HP 4.3** - Protect undesignated historic resources.
 - Protect any undesignated property that is eligible for local designation or listing on the NRHP from destruction or a substantial loss of historic character until the HPC has an opportunity to consider alternatives to adverse effects, or pursue historic designation of the property, and/or find parties interested in acquiring and preserving it (see Strategy HP-1);
 - b. The ***District 10 Como Community Plan: An Addendum to the Saint Paul Comprehensive Plan (2010)***, specifically states:
 - HLU 4.1.8 "Support the designation of historic resources such as buildings, structures, objects, archaeological sites, historic districts, and landscapes as Saint Paul heritage preservation sites or historic districts."
2. **Legislative Code Sec. 73.05(c)** and **Minnesota Statutes §471.193, subd. 6**, staff will submit the nomination form and draft preservation program to the State Historic Preservation Office if the HPC recommends St. Andrew's Church for designation as a local heritage preservation site.
3. The general integrity is assessed by evaluating seven aspects or qualities as defined by the National Park Service. St. Andrew's Church has integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling and association. The **exterior historic integrity** of St. Andrew's Church is good to very good.
4. The **period of significance** for St. Andrew's Church is from **1927** when the church was constructed, to **1949** when over 400 families transferred from St. Andrew's Church to the newly established Maternity of Mary and Church of the Holy Childhood.
5. To understand the significance of individual properties or a group of properties, "**historic contexts**" are developed and informally refer to both a document and an understanding of circumstances surrounding an event or property. The National Park Service defines historic contexts as "those patterns or trends in history by which a specific occurrence, property, or site is understood and its meaning (and ultimately its significance) within history or prehistory is made clear." Contexts are based on a theme, geographic limits, and a chronological period to provide a framework for identifying, evaluating and treating the full range of properties that represent each historic context. Already established Saint Paul context studies that are applicable to St. Andrew's Church are *Residential*

Real Estate Development: 1880-1950 and Churches, Synagogues, and Religious Buildings: 1849-1950.

6. The **architectural significance** of St. Andrew's Church is noted in the nomination. The nomination highlights the primary Romanesque Revival Style architecture of the church with detail/design inspiration of northern Italy and southern France. The church also retains Byzantine influences in design elements and its Greek-cross layout. Larry Millett, local architectural historian notes in the *AIA Guide to the Architecture of the Twin Cities* that St. Andrew's Church is, "One of St. Paul's best period revival churches" and "by virtue of the quality of design and its beautiful detailing, [it] certainly deserves a high rank."
7. **Criteria (1)** St. Andrew's Church contributes to and is part of the character, interest and value as part of the development and heritage of the City of Saint Paul. The architectural style of the church along with its architectural and social value to the to the Warrendale neighborhood, former parishioners, along with its place in the development of the neighborhood between the two world wars demonstrates
8. **Criteria (4)** St. Andrew's Church is the retains the distinguishing characteristics of a Romanesque Revival Style Church in a northern Italy/southern France vocabulary with colorful Byzantine ornament and complex design.
9. **Criteria (5)** St. Andrew's Church was designed by architect, Charles A. Hausler who was the first city architect for Saint Paul. Hauslers architectural designs, including the Minnesota Building, the Minnesota Milk Company building, the St. Anthony Park, Riverview and Arlington Hills Carnegie Libraries, Riverview Commercial Club (razed), among dozens of other building in the city. His work has influenced the development of and in the City of Saint Paul.
10. **Criteria (7)** The Warrendale neighborhood has a unique layout designed by H.W.S. Cleveland, as it is not a grid, but a curvilinear plan and St. Andrew's Church is sited in a unique location within the plat. St. Andrew's Church is a singular physical characteristic and an established and familiar visual feature of the Warrendale neighborhood.
11. Saint Andrew's Church is significant under criteria (1), (4), (5) and (7) of Section 73.05 (a) of the Legislative Code.

E. STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Based on the above findings, staff recommends that the nomination be accepted by the HPC and the HPC recommend Saint Andrew's Church for designation as a Saint Paul Heritage Preservation Site for City Council consideration.

F. ATTACHMENTS:

1. Nomination Form
 - a. Part I: Introduction and Significance
 - b. Part 2: Limestone Context
 - c. Part 3: Description of Individual Properties
 - d. Part 4: Draft Preservation Program - forthcoming
2. Letters of testimony
3. Previous inventory form and 1903 Sanborn Insurance Map