

CITY OF SAINT PAUL

HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION RESOLUTION

ADDRESS 156 Dale Street North

DATE: October 19, 2020

Memorializing the Saint Paul Heritage Preservation Commission's March 9, 2020 decision denying the demolition of 156 Dale Street North which is in the Historic Hill Heritage Preservation District.

1. On April 2, 1991, the Hill Heritage Preservation District was expanded under Ordinance No. 17815, § 3(II). The Heritage Preservation Commission shall protect the architectural character of heritage preservation sites through review and approval or denial of applications for city permits for exterior work within designated heritage preservation sites §73.04 (4).
2. The Period of Significance for the Historic Hill Heritage Preservation District is 1858-1930. The building was constructed in 1915 with an alteration to the front façade occurring in 1926.
3. The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation states that "The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided." The demolition of the structure does not comply with the guideline.
4. The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation states that "New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired." The demolition of the historic structure would allow the applicant to expand the footprint of new construction at the site and does not comply with the guideline.
5. Leg. Code §74.67 states that "When reviewing proposals for demolition of structures within the district, the heritage preservation commission refers to Section 73.06(i)(2) of this Code, which states the following: 'In the case of the proposed demolition of a building, prior to approval of said demolition, the commission shall make written findings on the following: the architectural and historical merit of the building, the effect of the demolition on surrounding buildings, the effect of any proposed new construction on the remainder of the building (in case of partial demolition) and on surrounding buildings, and the economic value or usefulness of the buildings as it now exists or if altered or modified in comparison with the value or usefulness of any proposed structures designated to replace the present building or buildings' (Ord. No. 17815, § 3(V), 4-2-91)'. While alterations have occurred to the building over time, the structure still architecturally reads as an auto garage. The historic openings are blocked, but could be reopened. The original front façade was replaced and set back to its current location in 1926 which is within the Period of Significance for the Historic Hill Heritage Preservation District. Demolition of the structure would not directly impact the surrounding buildings. The applicant has included renderings of a potential new construction project on the site that would be a 4-story residential building built up to the sidewalk to continue the rhythm set by the neighboring historic storefronts. If nothing is built in its place, the demolition would have an indirect impact by creating a void in the rhythm and continuity of the block. The proposed new construction would be one story taller than the historic building at the corner. The proposed building is two stories taller than the existing auto garage and would not have the same setback. The applicant submitted a letter from Mel Urlacher, an engineer, that provided observations of the building, but no testing was conducted. The observations include brick issues, water damage to roof joist members, and a deteriorated concrete slab. The applicant also notes concerns about contaminated soil throughout the property that will require mitigation and will require shoring up the rear garage foundation. Soil mitigation will need to be conducted on the site regardless.
6. The proposal to demolish 156 Dale Street North will adversely affect the Program for the Preservation and architectural control of the Historic Hill Heritage Preservation Site (Leg. Code

§73.06 (e)).

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, the Heritage Preservation Commission denies the demolition of 156 Dale Street North.

MOVED BY: Bezat

SECONDED BY: George

IN FAVOR: 6

AGAINST: 2

ABSTAIN: 0

Decisions of the Heritage Preservation Commission are final, subject to appeal to the City Council within 14 days by anyone affected by the decision. This resolution does not obviate the need for meeting applicable building and zoning code requirements, and does not constitute approval for tax credits.