From: <u>James Benzie</u>

To: *CI-StPaul Contact-Council

Cc: <u>IglehartBlockClub@gmail.com</u>; <u>Privratsky, Matt (CI-StPaul)</u>

Subject: Regarding Rezoning 2069 Marshall Ave **Date:** Monday, March 1, 2021 9:23:09 PM

Members of the St. City Council:

My name is James Benzie and I have lived at 2109 Carroll Avenue for 14 years with my wife. We chose to move to this area because of the historic homes, the quiet neighborhood, and easy accessibility to the two downtowns.

As a member of the Merriam Park community, I am writing to oppose the proposed rezoning of 2069 Marshall Ave from T2 to T3, allowing for a 5-story building. I urge you to reject the rezoning application and strike a balance between the City's plan for density and the interests of the current longtime neighborhood residents. Call it a compromise.

The neighborhood has been very vocal already about this issue. When the rezoning of 2069 Marshall came before the St. Paul Zoning Committee on January 15, 28 residents of Merriam Park sent e-mails opposing the project. Only one e-mail was received in support – from a person living in Frogtown. When it came to oral testimony, there were eight speakers opposed, only one in favor – a lobbyist from Sustain St. Paul. Clearly the neighbors have thoughts, and have made them heard. Please consider the neighborhood's concerns when making your decision.

Here are some of our concerns as to how this rezoning would have a negative impact on the neighborhood:

•The property at 2069 Marshall Ave. was already rezoned in 2018 to T2, a conscious and deliberate decision that involved many months of discussions. At that same time, the neighboring property of 2063 Marshall was rezoned to T3 because it is part of the neighborhood node. Those decisions provide for sufficient density consistent with the Comprehensive 2040 Plan. We do not feel the proximity of 2069 Marshall to 2063 is sufficient reason to warrant another rezoning. Please stick with what was already carefully decided in 2018.

•Allowing for extra height at 2069 Marshall will adversely affect the

neighborhood. Our neighbors on Iglehart have informed us that a shadow study presented by the developer Robert Page revealed that the three homes directly north of the development would be negatively impacted by the shadow of the building and would be completely in shadows during the entire winter season and would be partially shaded in the spring, summer and fall (negatively impacting several established gardens). These longtime homeowners did not invest in this wonderful neighborhood 20-some years ago thinking an oversized apartment would be built behind them, leaving them in the dark.

- •After discussing the topic at three consecutive meetings, the Union Park District Council's Committee on Land Use and Economic Development (CLUED) voted down a proposal to support the rezoning of 2069 Marshall to T3. Several committee members said they wanted to hear more information. They asked for proposals for a 3-story or 4-story apartment building and how such a project would impact the shadows and other issues in the neighborhood. The developers have yet to create and present these options. The community weighed in and lots of comments were given in opposition of this rezoning, none were in favor. The community and CLUED have not received enough information to support a zoning change.
- •All of the benefits that have been presented about this development (density, affordable housing, commercial space, alignment with the City's 2040 plan, etc.) do not require a zoning change. This rezoning request is purely selfish on the part of the developer to maximize profits and receive spot-zoning from the City with no regard to the surrounding neighbors.

The rezoning of 2069 Marshall Avenue is a big ask that will impact our neighborhood for many decades to come. While the neighborhood acknowledges and supports the development of the neighborhood node at 2063 Marshall, we cannot support the zoning change to 2069 Marshall. We ask you to deny the application of 2069 Marshall Ave LLC to rezone the property at 2069 Marshall Ave and leave the zoning as T2 Traditional Neighborhood.

Sincerely,

James Benzie

2109 Carroll Avenue