

From: Sally Brewer [<mailto:s-brew@comcast.net>]

Sent: Monday, February 05, 2018 1:21 PM

To: #CI-StPaul\_Ward1

Cc: Xiong, Mai Chong (CI-StPaul); Zimny, Joanna (CI-StPaul)

Subject: Opposed to the Marshall & Moore Apartments – Resident at 1990 Iglehart

Dear Councilmember Dai Thao:

I am writing to express my opposition to the 5-story, proposed Marshall and Moore apartment building to be reviewed and voted on at the February 7 Council meeting. Please consider a reversal, or at least, a hold, on the Planning Commission's decision--until independent studies can be made to address the negative impacts this project will create in the neighborhood for years to come:

1. How can such large land-moving equipment and cranes fit in the small space. Even if they close a public street for them, there are power lines for the entire neighborhood just feet from the equipment--and the two house on either side of this proposed plan will be almost unlivable for the better part of a year.

2. The traffic created by the construction is going to be a big safety hazard. There are both median strips and a traffic circle that channel traffic in one direction. No one talks about how the dump trucks will be competing with nearly 20 school buses morning and afternoon for the 4-Seasons A+ Elementary school only one block north. In addition, the students that walk to St. Mark's School located one block south will be in danger, as well as the students who wait at the corners for their buses to other schools.

3. The houses in this neighborhood are over 120 years old. How much intense, constant vibration can nearby houses withstand before there is damage? And if there is damage, how can we afford to stand up to the battery of lawyers working for the developer that will prevent compensation?

3. The building will be the highest one in any residential neighborhood in St. Paul for many miles and it has a planned outdoor party/recreation space on the roof. The noise will travel unobstructed for blocks. There are no planned noise buffers and with the building aimed for college students, that noise level will be often and late into the night.

4. The number of available on-street parking spaces will easily overwhelmed by the 30+ students and their friends on weekends making it closer to 50-60 additional cars. There aren't nearly that many open spaces.

5. If you truly want to create welcome additional housing to the area, make it 1 and 2 bedrooms per unit. Even though the developer had many graduated students speak at the Jan. 4 hearing, none of those young people would be occupants now that they have graduated. This building is not providing affordable housing for young people starting their lives and families after graduation. It is cramming as many students as legally possible for maximum financial gain into a tight lot space.

6. Everyone is conveniently ignoring the dynamics of 61 unsupervised students living under one roof. If there are any problems or illegal incidents, both St. Thomas and the developer/owner will both deny any responsibility--when in fact it will be both of these parties that created the problem.

Thank you for your time and consideration.

Sincerely,

Sally Brewer  
1990 Iglehart Ave

**From:** Lori Brostrom [<mailto:lbrostrom@comcast.net>]

**Sent:** Monday, February 05, 2018 1:19 PM

**To:** \*CI-StPaul\_Contact-Council; Thao, Dai (CI-StPaul); Noecker, Rebecca (CI-StPaul); #CI-StPaul\_Ward3; #CI-StPaul\_Ward4; #CI-StPaul\_Ward5; #CI-StPaul\_Ward6; Prince, Jane (CI-StPaul); Xiong, Mai Chong (CI-StPaul); Maki, Taina (CI-StPaul); McMahon, Melanie (CI-StPaul); Henningson, Samantha (CI-StPaul); OBrien, Kim (CI-StPaul); Renstrom, Scott (CI-StPaul); Harr, Stephanie (CI-StPaul)

**Cc:** Julie Reiter

**Subject:** Please grant Historic Merriam Park Neighborhoods Appeal APC-1

Dear City Council President Brendmoen and Councilmembers Thao, Noecker, Tolbert, Prince and Bostrom;

I am writing to ask that you grant the appeal of the Historic Merriam Park Neighborhoods with regard to the Planning Commission's approval of the site plan for the proposed development at 1973/1977 Marshall Avenue at Wednesday's City Council meeting.

A one-year development moratorium was passed this fall by the City Council that encompasses this site. The intent was specifically to evaluate the impact of destruction of the type of historic housing that would be destroyed should this type of development proceed. In order to get in under the deadline ahead of the moratorium, the developer submitted a poorly thought-out plan which, among other things:

- Far exceeds the allowed density for this site based upon the current zoning
- Exceeds the allowed height for the current zoning
- Offers grossly insufficient parking, putting an onerous burden on a neighborhood that already struggles with parking and traffic
- Would, due to its density, height and mass, negatively impact surrounding homes due to noise, vehicle traffic, impairment of light and air, potential for storm water runoff, loss of privacy
- Add more student housing to a neighborhood which already struggles with high levels and the attendant behaviors which the University of St. Thomas cannot control, nor ameliorate by supplying more student housing itself

If built, this development would permanently and adversely impact this neighborhood's character at a time when it is vulnerable, as acknowledged by the moratorium. The structures that would be torn down at the site are very likely historically contributing, and their loss would significantly diminish the historic character and significance of this neighborhood.

Moreover, this development is counter to the Union Park 10-Year Comprehensive Plan, which calls for preserving the traditional/historic feel of the neighborhood and the single-family homes which contribute to its character. Further, my understanding is that work is underway to conduct a historic survey of this area of Merriam Park, recognizing the importance of protecting this part of the City and preserving its unique character.

Please do not allow this development to proceed and erode an important historic resource that is critical to protecting the fabric of a city which values its heritage.

Thank you,

Lori Brostrom  
710 Summit Avenue Apt. 1  
St. Paul, MN 55105

**From:** Susan Nagel (Eduweb) [<mailto:susan@eduweb.com>]  
**Sent:** Monday, February 05, 2018 1:48 PM  
**To:** #CI-StPaul\_Ward4; Henningson, Samantha (CI-StPaul); Bauer, Kelly (CI-StPaul)  
**Subject:** Opposed to the Marshall & Moore Apartments – Resident at 1776 Iglehart Ave.

Dear Councilmember Stark,

I am writing to express my **strong opposition to the proposed Marshall & Moore Apartments site plan approval and respectfully request that you reverse the Planning Commission's decision.**

I understand that the proposal has been approved because the developer is complying with current regulations and asking for no variances. However, I believe the developer squeaked in under the wire before important discussions, debates and decisions have been able to take place about the Marshall Ave corridor. Allowing this development to go through would damage the character of our neighborhood and set unfortunate precedents.

**Please re-evaluate the Marshall and Moore project and ensure that is in accordance with the Union Park District Council's ten-year plan: "new residential construction shall be consistent with the character of the surrounding homes, while minimizing impact on the neighborhood."**

My objections to the project are many, including:

-The **extreme height** of this building which is not in keeping with neighboring homes and this massive structure will devalue neighboring properties and block light to neighbors properties, interfering with their gardens, solar power possibilities, and general quality of life.

-**The floorplans of the units make it single purpose for student housing.** Families or young professionals would never choose dorm floor plans at \$800+ per tiny bedroom (not to mention 4 bathrooms for 4 bedrooms). If this was a smaller apartment building designed for a mix students, single tenants, and families of mixed income, I would be supportive.

- **The density of 64 tenants and the new parking demands is unacceptable.** The sheer number of additional cars that these unrelated adults (and their visitors!) will bring to this block is untenable. The required 32 parking spaces is woefully inadequate.

- The proposed driveway through the property to access underground parking will **devalue the next door neighbor's property and severely impact her quality of life.**

I have lived with my family at 1776 Iglehart Ave for 20+ years. My husband and I also work from our home, which we own. We chose this neighborhood because of the urban neighborliness, fabulous older homes, and walkability. We love Merriam Park because it is an eclectic mix of houses and people (owners and renters). I am not against student housing! We do have a few student houses on our block and they live peaceably with the rest of the neighbors, for the most part. Iglehart Ave. is one street off of Marshall and so are very aware of development and traffic/parking of this busy street. We love the variety of businesses, the library, churches, and schools that all make our neighborhood vibrant. We greatly appreciate efforts like the new medians and traffic calming measures that keep it livable. But as it gets busier, we feel it acutely.

This project will set the precedent for future development along this corridor. I am looking out my back window at the row of houses along Marshall Ave, mostly rental and a little shabby. Ripe picking for developers. Are these also going to be torn down to make way for 5-story private dorms? How long will my family choose to stay if the neighborhood character is destroyed? I love St. Paul. But if I was next door to that proposed apartment at Marshall and Moore, there would be a For Sale sign in my yard.

Thank you.

Susan Nagel

---

Susan A. Nagel  
1776 Iglehart Ave., Saint Paul, MN 55104

From: Tammy Meister [<mailto:tmeister51@gmail.com>]  
Sent: Monday, February 5, 2018 1:57 PM  
To: #CI-StPaul\_Ward7 <[Ward7@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:Ward7@ci.stpaul.mn.us)>  
Subject: Development

I want to voice my concerns over large buildings taking over or in neighborhoods in St. Paul. I think it is destroying the small town residential feel and there is already traffic congestion. I both live and work within 1-2 blocks of Snelling and Grand and have done this for over 20 years Please let me know your thoughts.

Sincerely

Tammy Meister

**From:** catherine hunt [<mailto:katemhunt@outlook.com>]  
**Sent:** Monday, February 05, 2018 2:36 PM  
**To:** #CI-StPaul\_Ward3

**Subject:** Reject 5 Story Apt at Marshall/Moore

Dear St. Paul City Council Member Tolbert:

I am contacting you to express concern about approving a five-story high density apartment at the corner of Marshall and Moore Streets. Neighbors in the area are concerned that this building is designed for student housing. The proposed building is adjacent to single family homes and is across the alley from single family homes. Furthermore, light studies show that neighboring houses will be deprived of significant sunlight and it is likely that their privacy will be affected.

This is a story told over and over in St. Paul. Developers care more about cashing in on high density projects and flagrantly disregarding homeowners' significant property concerns-all to the detriment of the livability of the neighborhood. Remarkably this scenario didn't take place for neighbors on Grand Avenue. The developer for the Dixie's apartment project, Peter Kenefick, reversed his decision to develop this property because, according to Mr. Kenefick, "it did not coincide with the desires of many of the nearby residents." This is truly a rare decision.

Developers will not protect our neighborhoods. I call on you and your fellow council members to represent the welfare and wishes of the citizens of St. Paul. Please reject this harmful project when it comes before the City Council on Wednesday, 2/7.

I look forward to a response to this email. Thank you, Kate Hunt, XXX Highland Parkway

**From:** Scott Fried [<mailto:info@actionnetwork.org>]  
**Sent:** Saturday, February 3, 2018 3:07 AM  
**To:** #CI-StPaul\_Ward7 <[Ward7@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:Ward7@ci.stpaul.mn.us)>  
**Subject:** I support the Margaret St project

Jane Prince,

I have lived on Margaret street for over 14 years and I fully support the plans to close the medians that run along Johnson Parkway at Margaret Street. When the test closure was in place I noticed a reduction in traffic and this made walking my dogs more pleasant and safe. I believe this is a positive enhancement to our neighborhood. Since the upgrades coming to the Johnson Parkway section of the Grand Rounds have been funded for FY 2020 this makes sense to complete the Margaret Street enhancements at this time. The Eastside has waited far too long to get the amenities that the rest of the city has had for years or even decades.

Scott Fried  
[scott.f.freed@gmail.com](mailto:scott.f.freed@gmail.com)  
1160 Margaret St  
Saint Paul, Minnesota 55106

Dear Jane,

I am writing to express my strong opposition to the approval of the proposed Marshall/Moore apartments site plan.

The future of the neighborhood surrounding this Marshall-Moore development is at stake. Yes, the city wants density, especially on corridors with mass transit. But this particular type of density -- 16 units housing a total of 64 undergraduate college students -- will choke the neighboring streets with vehicles. That will adversely affect nearby businesses, homeowning residents, and Saint Mark's church and school. The streets surrounding this proposed Marshall/Moore apartment are at capacity.

College students bring a particular set of parking challenges, given their tendency to congregate often and host large numbers of visitors. St. Thomas students -- the likely occupants of this building -- also tend to own cars at a higher rate than students from nearby Macalester College. If the Marshall-Moore developer is planning to charge extra for the parking spaces he is providing, student-tenants will be even more likely to park on the street.

Over the past several years I have observed firsthand the negative impact that the Grand-Finn apartments have brought to the neighborhood homeowners south of those buildings. The original Grand-Finn building, like Marshall-Moore, is five stories tall, shading the nearby houses. But, the

Grand-Finn owner agreed to remove any balconies from his buildings. That is not the case at Marshall-Moore, where noise from balconies is a significant concern to residents west of this structure.

I respectfully request that you reverse the decision of the Planning Commission and vote to oppose this Marshall-Moore apartment plan. Let's give the developer time to sharpen his pencil and bring forward a proposal that serves students without sacrificing numerous other neighbors.

Thank you for your consideration.

Respectfully,

Rachel M. Westermeyer  
1935 Summit Avenue  
St. Paul, MN 55105  
WSNAC co-chair

**From:** The Morrows [<mailto:mcemorrow@comcast.net>]

**Sent:** Monday, February 05, 2018 2:14 PM

**To:** #CI-StPaul\_Ward1; #CI-StPaul\_Ward2; #CI-StPaul\_Ward3; #CI-StPaul\_Ward4; #CI-StPaul\_Ward5; #CI-StPaul\_Ward6; #CI-StPaul\_Ward7

**Cc:** Xiong, Mai Chong (CI-StPaul); Zimny, Joanna (CI-StPaul); Maki, Taina (CI-StPaul); #CI-StPaul\_Ward2; McMahon, Melanie (CI-StPaul); Kelley, Pattie (CI-StPaul); Henningson, Samantha (CI-StPaul); Bauer, Kelly (CI-StPaul); OBrien, Kim (CI-StPaul); Sanders, Donna (CI-StPaul); Harr, Stephanie (CI-StPaul); Heintz, Polly (CI-StPaul)

**Subject:** Opposed to the Marshall & Moore Apartments - Residents at 1984 Carroll Avenue

To:  
Members of the Saint Paul City Council

From:  
Mark and Cecilia Morrow  
1984 Carroll Avenue  
Saint Paul, MN  
55104

Re: Proposed project at Marshall and Moore  
For 25 years we have owned a home 2 blocks north of the proposed project at Marshall and Moore. We oppose the scale of the project - height, width, and depth. We respectfully ask you to consider the questions raised in our attached Word document.

Thank you for your thoughtful consideration of this matter.

**From:** Charlotte Berres [<mailto:crberres@icloud.com>]

**Sent:** Monday, February 05, 2018 2:13 PM

**To:** #CI-StPaul\_Ward4

**Cc:** #CI-StPaul\_Ward1; #CI-StPaul\_Ward2; #CI-StPaul\_Ward3; #CI-StPaul\_Ward5; #CI-StPaul\_Ward6; #CI-StPaul\_Ward7

**Subject:** Opposed to Marshall/Moore Apartments

I am Charlotte Berres, a Merriam Park Resident at 1919 Iglehart Avenue (NW corner of Howell and Iglehart).

I am OPPOSED to the proposed apartment building. I REQUEST that you reverse the Planning Commissions decision.

Dear Mr. Russ Stark and Council Members:

I appreciate that each of you take the time to represent your section of the city on the City Council. Thank you for giving everyone consideration in your deliberations and decisions. Enclosed are my thoughts and concerns about the proposed apartment building at the corner of Moore and Marshall.

I appreciate you giving consideration and reading a life long resident's view of Merriam Park. I am very, very concerned about what is happening at 1973 and 1977 Marshall. I hope that another two Victorian, historical homes are NOT destroyed. They are St. Paul's historical treasures.

thank you for your service and thank you for taking time to read my thoughts.

May God bless your work,

Charlotte Berres

**From:** Scott Vanwert [<mailto:scottavanwert@gmail.com>]

**Sent:** Monday, February 05, 2018 10:18 PM

**To:** #CI-StPaul\_Ward1; Xiong, Mai Chong (CI-StPaul); Zimny, Joanna (CI-StPaul)

**Subject:** Letter of Opposition Word Document --Marshall-Moore Apartments

Dear Councilmember Thao,

I am writing you in opposition to the Marshall Moore Project as a nearby neighbor who will be significantly impacted by the project. In the attached word document I have provided an analysis of several important technical issues with the project that if it were to be approved will greatly affect neighborhood livability for many residents and likely bring more such flawed site plans forward elsewhere in Saint Paul. The issues raised are technical issues because they require the City Council to study and understand the facts and Zoning Code issues raised by the proposed plan, analyze the plain and ordinary wording present in pertinent sections of the Zoning Code and finally determine whether the Developer has wrongly stretched or distorted code meaning in pushing forward this controversial site plan.

So I urge you and your staff to carefully read the word Document attached, as well as other thoughtful analysis submitted by residents and advocates and then prepare tough questions for the developer regarding these alleged serious Zoning Code deficiencies in the project. Also I hope you will question and challenge City Staff appropriately if it appears they have strayed from interpreting the specific Zoning Ordinances based on their plain and ordinary meaning. And finally I hope the factual arguments and analysis presented will convinces you there is a reasonable and sound basis to deny approval of this site plan.

And lastly thanks for all your service and dedication to making Saint Paul a more livable place over many years.

Sincerely,

Scott Van Wert

1985 Marshall Ave



Marshall Moore Site  
Plan Analysis SVW v5