



DEPARTMENT OF
ADMINISTRATION

STATE HISTORIC PRESERVATION OFFICE

May 29, 2018

Samantha Langer
City of St. Paul – PED
1400 City Hall Annex
25 W 4th Street
Saint Paul, MN 55102

RE: Demolition of 235 Mackubin Street
St. Paul, Ramsey County
SHPO Number: 2018-1835

Dear Ms. Langer:

Thank you for the opportunity to comment on the above project. Information received in our office on 30 April 2018 has been reviewed pursuant to the responsibilities given the State Historic Preservation Officer by the National Historic Preservation Act of 1966, as amended, and implementing federal regulations at 36 CFR Part 800.

We have completed a review of your submittal dated April 23, 2018, which included the Saint Paul Department of Planning and Economic Development Historic Review Form and attachments regarding the proposed demolition of the A. E. Heidemann House, located at 235 Mackubin Street. This recent submittal to our office also included a copy of the August 21, 2017 resolution by the City of St. Paul Heritage Preservation Commission (HPC) conditionally approving the demolition of this property, which is located within the Historic Hill Heritage Preservation District, a designated local landmark.

Although your submittal does not acknowledge this designation, our records indicate that the property located at **235 Mackubin Street** is a historic property located within the **Woodland Park Historic District** which is listed in the National Register of Historic Places (NRHP). As such, the City's proposed undertaking, the use of federal funding to demolish this historic property, constitutes an **adverse effect** pursuant to 36 CFR Part 800.5(a)(2).

If your agency formally determines that the proposed demolition of 235 Mackubin Street constitutes an adverse effect, then, in accordance with 36 CFR Part 800.6, your agency will need to continue consultation with our office and other consulting parties in an effort to resolve the adverse effect through avoidance, minimization, or mitigation. You will also need to notify the Advisory Council on Historic Preservation of the adverse effect determination and invite them into consultation.

It is likely that the St. Paul HPC will participate in Section 106 consultation to resolve this adverse effect. Your agency will need to notify the HPC as such, and will also need to determine if there are any other consulting parties interested in participating, as well as plan to involve the public, in the Section 106 review process.

We look forward to working with you on ways to avoid, minimize or mitigate for the adverse effects of this project. Please feel free to contact me at (651) 201-3290 or sarah.belmers@state.mn.us if you wish to discuss this comment letter or next steps in the Section 106 consultation process.

Sincerely,

Sarah J. Belmers
Environmental Review Program Manager

cc via email only:

George Gause, City of St. Paul
Mike Justin, Chair, St. Paul HPC

MINNESOTA STATE HISTORIC PRESERVATION OFFICE

50 Sherburne Avenue ■ Administration Building 203 ■ Saint Paul, Minnesota 55155 ■ 651-201-3287

mn.gov/admin/shpo/ ■ mnshpo@state.mn.us

AN EQUAL OPPORTUNITY AND SERVICE PROVIDER

ST. PAUL, MINNESOTA HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION

INVENTORY OF INDIVIDUAL CITY STRUCTURES
AND HISTORIC SITES

HISTORIC NAME:	COMMON NAME:
ADDRESS: 233-235 Mackubin	Woodland Park Add. ex. S 40' and Ex N 46.2 pt a
HPC DISTRICT: H111	LEGAL ex. W w1.7' and with esmt. Lots 1 and 2, blk 1
ORIGINAL OWNER: A. E. Weidemann	HPC CATEGORY: Pivotal <i>Supportive</i>
ORIGINAL USE: apartments	PRESENT OWNER: Delmar L. Giebart & Gregory
	PRESENT USE:
	PRESENT ZONING: RM-2

DESCRIPTION

CONSTRUCTION DATE: 1907	DATE SOURCE:
ARCHITECT:	BUILDER: Fitzpatrick and sons
ALTERATIONS:	
Date:	Work Completed: Architect/Builder:

STYLE: Spanish Colonial Revival	PLAN: Rectangular
	NUMBER OF STORIES: 2

TYPE/MATERIAL: stucco

Foundation: brick

Exterior Wall: stucco

Roof: asphalt shingle hip roof

Roof Trim/Cornice: rafters exposed

Chimneys: not visible

Doorways: doors on left and right of symmetrical facade

Porches: open porch on first and second stories

Fenestration: 20/1 double hung sash

Dormers: none

OUTBUILDINGS:

SIGNIFICANT ARCHITECTURAL DETAILS

CONDITION: Excellent [] Good [x] Fair [] Poor []

ENVIRONMENT

Urban [] Residential [x] Industrial [] Commercial []

Other []

Landscaping:

COMMENTS

REFERENCES

Recorded By: Susan Ebner

Organization:

Date: 7/21/1981

Slide Number:

CITY OF SAINT PAUL

HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION RESOLUTION

FILE NUMBER 17-020

DATE: August 21, 2017

Memorializing the Saint Paul Heritage Preservation Commission's August 21, 2017 decision to conditionally approve application #17-020 for a demolition permit for 235 Mackubin Street, located within the Historic Hill Heritage Preservation District.

WHEREAS, the Saint Paul Heritage Preservation Commission (HPC) is authorized by Chapter 73 of the Saint Paul Legislative Code to review permit applications for exterior alterations, new construction or demolition on or within designated Heritage Preservation Sites or Heritage Preservation Districts; and

WHEREAS, the A.E. Heidemann House was constructed by Fitzpatrick and Sons in 1907 as a two-story Spanish Colonial Revival style house with a full width two-story porch and has a brick foundation, stucco walls, and asphalt shingle roof. The Windows are one-over one double hungs. There are casement windows on the rear of the house; and

WHEREAS, the house caught fire on March 25, 2017. The Saint Paul Fire Department responded and extinguished the fire. The fire is reported to be accidental and begun in the attic and the fire report estimates the damage to be \$300,000. The building has been categorized as a Vacant Building Category II; and

WHEREAS, The applicant proposes to demolish the building and assess if the frame of the building is still usable in order to inform the new construction plan; and

WHEREAS, on August 10, 2017, the Heritage Preservation Commission, having provided notice to affected property owners, duly conducted a public hearing on said application, where all interested parties were given an opportunity to be heard; and

WHEREAS, at the close of the public hearing, the HPC, based upon all the testimony and records, moved to approve the application with conditions based upon the following findings of fact and incorporated herein by reference as follows:

1. On April 2, 1991, the most recent expansion of the Historic Hill Heritage Preservation District was established under Ordinance No. 17815, § 3(II), reflecting today's boundaries. The Heritage Preservation Commission shall protect the architectural character of heritage preservation sites through review and approval or denial of applications for city permits for exterior work within designated heritage preservation sites §73.04.(4).
2. The A.E. Heidemann House is classified as contributing to the Historic Hill Heritage Preservation District.
3. Sec. 74.67. Demolition. The guidelines state that the commission shall make written findings on the following:
 - a. *The architectural and historical merit of the building:* The building is categorized as contributing to the Historic Hill Heritage Preservation District.
 - b. *The effect of the demolition on surrounding buildings:* The demolition of the house would not effect the surrounding buildings, but would alter the consistency of Spanish Colonial Revival style present on that corner of the block.

- c. *The effect of any proposed new construction on surrounding buildings:* New construction has not yet been proposed because there needs to be further assessment of the site.
 - d. *The economic value or usefulness of the buildings as it now exists or if altered or modified in comparison with the value or usefulness of any proposed structures designated to replace the present building or buildings:* The damage is reported to be \$300,000 with an estimated home value of \$400,000 as reported in the St. Paul Fire Department report. In its current condition, the house is categorized as a Vacant Building Category II with extensive fire and water damage.
4. While the proposal to demolish the existing fire damaged house at 235 Mackubin Street will have an adverse effect on the Program for the Preservation and architectural control of the Historic Hill Heritage Preservation District, staff finds the building to be beyond repair based upon the submitted St. Paul Fire Report (Leg. Code §73.06 (e)).;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, the Heritage Preservation Commission conditionally approves application #17-020 for the demolition of 235 Mackubin Street, located within the Historic Hill Heritage Preservation District with the following conditions:

1. An HPC application and the new construction plans shall be submitted for Heritage Preservation Commission Review.
2. The site shall be cleared and secured after demolition.

MOVED BY: Dana
SECONDED BY: George

IN FAVOR 8
AGAINST 0
ABSTAIN 1 (Peroutka)

Decisions of the Heritage Preservation Commission are final, subject to appeal to the City Council within 14 days by anyone affected by the decision. This resolution does not obviate the need for meeting applicable building and zoning code requirements, and does not constitute approval for tax credits.