

Appeal for the East 7th and Bates Senior Apartments 2/18/15

The Planning Commission erred in approving the CUP for a 45' building in the following findings:

2. **Section 66.331(f)** There was an error made in the calculation of height. The height to the roof deck rather than roof surface was used. If the correct calculation is used the height of the building exceeds 45'. The applicant should seek a zoning variance.
3. **Section 61.501** The proposed project does not satisfy at least 3 of the required 5 standards .
 - a) *The extent, location, and intensity of the use will be in substantial compliance with the Saint Paul Comprehensive Plan and any applicable subarea plans which were approved by the city council.*
 - c) *The use will not be detrimental to the existing character of the development in the immediate area, nor endanger the public health, safety and General welfare.*
 - b) *The use shall, in all other respects, conform to the applicable regulations of the district in which it is located.*

Areas of non-compliance/inconsistencies marked below in blue.

Zoning Code: Sec. 66.343. - Traditional neighborhood district design standards.

(a) Applicability. The traditional neighborhood district design standards under paragraph (b) below apply to development within T1—T4 traditional neighborhood districts, as indicated in table [66.343](#),

Traditional neighborhood district design standards.

- (2) Transitions to lower-density neighborhoods. *Transitions in density or intensity shall be managed through careful attention to building height, scale, massing and solar exposure.*

District 4 Plan Summary Addendum to the Comprehensive Plan for Saint Paul

Recommended by the Planning Commission December 4, 2009

Adopted by the City Council December 23, 2009

Land Use

Urban Design

- C7. *Utilize the East 7th Street Design Guidelines during the site plan review process for proposed projects involving new and remodeled businesses.*

EAST SEVENTH STREET DESIGN GUIDELINES

Adopted by the Saint Paul City Council on December 23, 2009

Background of the East Seventh Corridor Study

The East Seventh Street Corridor Study was begun in late fall 2000 as part of discussions about how design guidelines would be useful in creating a sense of place along East Seventh Street and would provide a foundation for a redevelopment strategy to sustain and enhance the economic vitality of the Dayton's Bluff area, as well as the entire East Side of Saint Paul.

Guidelines for All Buildings and Sites

- *Buildings should be oriented to the street to support the goal of an urban and aesthetically pleasing streetscape.*
- Buildings should have direct pedestrian connections to the street.
- *Buildings should be consistent in height, scale and massing with other buildings along the street frontage and the frontage across the street. Buildings should also be generally consistent with the architecture of other buildings along the street frontage and the frontage across the street.*

- No blank walls should be permitted to face either the public street, sidewalks or other public spaces, such as plazas and green open space.

Dayton's Bluff Heritage Preservation District Design Guidelines (1992)

Sec. 74.90. - New construction and additions.

b) General guidelines:

- (1) **General character.** *New construction should reinforce the historic architectural and visual character of the area. Specifically, it should refer to the traditional two- and three-story dwelling and commercial building module and typical setbacks already established in the district and in the adjacent area.*

***HPC Finding:

*The proposed construction, to some extent, reinforces the historic architectural and visual character of the area. The design alludes to features in the District but employs them in modern interpretations. The materials and siting of the building generally support the historic character. **The massing is not found elsewhere in the district and does not comply with the district's guidelines.** The location and design of the parking conforms to the guidelines.*

(c) Principal buildings; additions:

- (1) **Massing and scale.** *New construction should conform to the massing, volume, height, facade proportions and scale of surrounding structures and also comply with existing zoning regulations. The gross volume of any new structure should be visually compatible with the buildings and elements within the surrounding area. New dwellings and commercial buildings should be compatible with the height of existing adjacent buildings.*

**** HPC Finding:** The footprint of the building is approximately 32,000 sq. ft. and the height ranges from 4-5 stories above grade. The massing, volume, height, and scale of the proposed senior housing is much larger than surrounding historic buildings (the Stutzman Block is 2-2 1/2 stories). The proposed project is more in scale with existing and proposed construction (Science Center and parking garage) on the adjacent Metropolitan State campus, which is not in the Historic District. **The massing and the footprint of the proposed construction do not comply with the guideline.**

The Near East Side Roadmap

Addendum to the Saint Paul Comprehensive Plan

Recommended by the Saint Paul Planning Commission on August 10, 2012

Adopted by the City Council on September 26, 2012

Overall Vision:

"A unique, walkable commercial district that is respectful of history, animated by new and ongoing investments, and composed of a strong, engaged mix of businesses, upbeat and supportive neighbors, and enthusiastic, frequent visitors."

A walkable, mixed use commercial district. Because this roadmap seeks to *capitalize on traffic to and from large neighborhood developments* and community anchors, it identifies a slightly larger walkable district that extends from Metro State University on the east (Maria) to Beacon Bluff on the west (Forest St).

Real Estate Objectives and Action Steps (RE)

RE2. *A shared community development ethic* through private investment

RE2.1. Engage the neighborhood anchors (property owners and business owners) to leverage their influence and investments in the corridor.

- Determine each anchor's role in supporting revitalization initiatives for E. 7th St.
- Work with anchors to ensure their actions are in support of an active streetscape.*

RE3. Increased resident, business, and placemaking activities within the *walkable commercial district*, especially near transit nodes

RE3.1. Focus efforts and resources on *the walkable commercial district from Maria to Forest St.* - Intensify the uses on the block between Maria and Bates, as well as at the 7th/Hope Laundry site

RE4.5. Rezone properties to *improve the transition from residential to commercial-industrial properties.*

Streets Objectives and Action Steps:

Streets that make it easy for customers to get here:

- A short and longer-term outcome of this roadmap is a safe, clean, attractive, and vibrant streetscape. To achieve this, *E. 7th Street must become more pedestrian friendly, and have a greater consistency of design along the street.*
- To achieve a critical mass of active uses and foot traffic, the walkable commercial district would benefit from a defined beginning (Maria) and end (Forest), and should engage local customers and regional traffic (car traffic, transit riders, and bicyclists). *Ensure that large redevelopment projects have high-quality pedestrian connections to the walkable commercial district.*

