

Saint Paul, MN "Organized" Trash Collection for 1- to 4-Unit Residential Buildings

2022 Comparison

Fees as Proposed by City vs. Suggested Reallocation

For Public Hearing 11/10/2021

OVERVIEW

| | | 5,074 | 17,584 | 29,147 | 20,079 |
|---|---|--------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| | Number of Households by Cart Size | | | | |
| | Cart Size | 35 gal, EOW | 35 gal, Weekly | 64 gal, Weekly | 96 gal, Weekly |
| | Annual Collection Capacity per Cart | 910 gal/yr | 1820 gal/yr | 3328 gal/yr | 4992 gal/yr |
| Proposed 2022 \$25,952,973 Citywide total collected by Haulers including taxes | CITYWIDE \$ per Year | \$1,203,756 | \$4,910,156 | \$11,258,903 | \$8,580,158 |
| | Sec 220.05(a) Base Level Fees , per Cart | 14.35 | 16.89 | 23.37 | 25.85 |
| | HOUSEHOLD \$ per Year | 237.24 | 279.24 | 386.28 | 427.32 |
| | per Quarter | 59.31 | 69.81 | 96.57 | 106.83 |
| | per Month | 19.77 | 23.27 | 32.19 | 35.61 |
| | Monthly Collection/Disposal: per 1,000 Gal of Collection Capacity | ★ 12.13 | 7.46 | 5.83 | 4.38 |
| Reallocated 2022 \$25,952,978 Citywide total collected by Haulers including taxes | CITYWIDE \$ per Year | \$702,200 | \$3,901,603 | \$10,824,294 | \$10,524,881 |
| | Sec 220.05(a) Base Level Fees , per Cart | 8.37 | 13.42 | 22.47 | 31.71 |
| | HOUSEHOLD \$ per Year | 138.39 | 221.88 | 371.37 | 524.17 |
| | per Quarter | 34.60 | 55.47 | 92.84 | 131.04 |
| | per Month | 11.53 | 18.49 | 30.95 | 43.68 |
| | Monthly Collection/Disposal: per 1,000 Gal of Collection Capacity | ★ 5.56 | 5.56 | 5.56 | 5.56 |
| Annual Fees Change Proposed-to-Reallocated \$5 | CITYWIDE \$ per Year | (\$501,556) | (\$1,008,553) | (\$434,610) | \$1,944,723 |
| | HOUSEHOLD \$ per Year | (98.85) | (57.36) | (14.91) | 96.85 |
| | per Quarter | (24.71) | (14.34) | (3.73) | 24.21 |
| | per Month | (8.24) | (4.78) | (1.24) | 8.07 |

As currently proposed for 2022: High-trash-volume users are subsidized by excessive fees charged to lower-waste and zero-waste users.

- Households that produce **MORE trash** are rewarded with **LOW per-gallon fees**.
- Households that produce **LESS trash** are penalized with **HIGH per-gallon fees**.

★ **Reallocation** aims to equalize the **per-1,000-gallon collection/disposal fees** (this number does not include billing, bulkies, taxes).

Reallocation calculations use "Annual Disposal Capacity" (thousands of gallons) to reallocate fees for "Collection & Disposal." **Examples:**

- 35-gallon cart (small) collected every other week
35 gal x 26 weeks = 910 gal/yr x 5,074 households = 4,617,340 gallons per year, citywide
Proposed Fees } **LOW WASTE pays: \$12.13 per Month per 1,000 gal capacity**
- 96-gallon cart (large) collected every week
96 gal x 52 weeks = 4,992 gal/yr x 20,079 households = 100,234,368 gallons per year, citywide
Proposed Fees } **HIGH WASTE pays: \$4.38 per Month per 1,000 gal capacity**

CALCULATION DETAILS

2022 PROPOSED Costs by Category (PUBLIC HEARING 11/10/2021)

2022 REALLOCATED Costs by Category

-- Proposed --

| Collection Frequency | Every Week (26 weeks) | Other Weekly (52 weeks) | Weekly (52 weeks) | Weekly (52 weeks) |
|---|-----------------------|-------------------------|-------------------|-------------------|
| Cart Size (gallons) | 35 EOW | 35 W | 64 W | 96 W |
| Non-Fuel | 8.43 | 10.12 | 11.04 | 11.04 |
| Fuel | 0.92 | 1.11 | 1.21 | 1.21 |
| Disposal | 1.67 | 2.16 | 6.72 | 8.26 |
| Subtotal Collection & Disposal Fees (Monthly, per cart) | 11.04 | 13.58 | 19.39 | 21.87 |
| Billing | 1.99 | 1.99 | 1.99 | 1.99 |
| Bulkies | 1.32 | 1.32 | 1.99 | 1.99 |
| Subtotal Fees before taxes Sec 220.05(a) Base Level Fees | 14.35 | 16.89 | 23.37 | 25.85 |
| County Tax (28%) | 4.02 | 4.73 | 6.54 | 7.24 |
| State Tax (9.75%) | 1.40 | 1.65 | 2.28 | 2.52 |
| Grand Total Fees (Monthly, per cart) | 19.77 | 23.27 | 32.19 | 35.61 |
| Quarterly | 59.31 | 69.81 | 96.57 | 106.83 |
| Annual collection capacity | 910 gal/yr | 1820 gal/yr | 3328 gal/yr | 4992 gal/yr |
| Collection & Disposal Fees per 1,000 gallons of annual collection capacity (Monthly, per cart) | 12.13 | 7.46 | 5.83 | 4.38 |

★ Reallocation aims to equalize the collection/disposal fees per 1,000 gallons of annual collection capacity.

-- Reallocated -- by percent of disposal capacity

| | 5.06 | 10.11 | 18.49 | 27.73 |
|---|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|
| Billing | 1.99 | 1.99 | 1.99 | 1.99 |
| Bulkies | 1.32 | 1.32 | 1.99 | 1.99 |
| Subtotal Fees before taxes | 8.37 | 13.42 | 22.47 | 31.71 |
| County Tax (28%) | 2.34 | 3.76 | 6.29 | 8.88 |
| State Tax (9.75%) | 0.82 | 1.31 | 2.19 | 3.09 |
| Grand Total Fees | 11.53 | 18.49 | 30.95 | 43.68 |
| Quarterly | 34.60 | 55.47 | 92.84 | 131.04 |
| Annual collection capacity | 910 gal/yr | 1820 gal/yr | 3328 gal/yr | 4992 gal/yr |
| Collection & Disposal Fees per 1,000 gallons of annual collection capacity (Monthly, per cart) | 5.56 | 5.56 | 5.56 | 5.56 |

SUMMARY - Cost Comparison Adopted vs. Reallocated

2022 Annual Costs As Proposed by City vs. Hypothetical Reallocation

| # of Households by cart size | 5,074 | 17,584 | 29,147 | 20,079 |
|---|--------------------|----------------------|--------------------|--------------------|
| Cart Size | 35 gal, EOW | 35 gal, Weekly | 64 gal, Weekly | 96 gal, Weekly |
| Proposed | \$1,203,756 | \$4,910,156 | \$11,258,903 | \$8,580,158 |
| Reallocated | \$702,200 | \$3,901,603 | \$10,824,294 | \$10,524,881 |
| Annual Cost Change Proposed-to-Reallocated | \$501,556 | \$1,008,553 | \$434,610 | \$1,944,723 |
| CITYWIDE CHANGE per Year | (\$501,556) | (\$1,008,553) | (\$434,610) | \$1,944,723 |
| HOUSEHOLD CHANGE per Year | (\$98.85) | (\$57.36) | (\$14.91) | \$96.85 |
| per Quarter | (\$24.71) | (\$14.34) | (\$3.73) | \$24.21 |
| per Month | (\$8.24) | (\$4.78) | (\$1.24) | \$8.07 |

| | 5,074 | 17,584 | 29,147 | 20,079 |
|----------|-------------|----------------|----------------|----------------|
| | 35 gal, EOW | 35 gal, Weekly | 64 gal, Weekly | 96 gal, Weekly |
| 1 | \$702,200 | \$3,901,603 | \$10,824,294 | \$10,524,881 |
| 2 | \$702,200 | \$3,901,603 | \$10,824,294 | \$10,524,881 |

For REALLOCATION calculations, Monthly Costs for Collection & Disposal exclude costs for billing and bulky items (i.e., billing & bulkies do NOT vary by cart volume).

-- Proposed --

| | | | | |
|--|------------------|--------------------|--------------------|--------------------|
| Collection & Disposal Fees (Monthly, per cart) | \$11.04 | \$13.58 | \$19.39 | \$21.87 |
| Cart Size (gallons) | 35 EOW | 35 Weekly | 64 Weekly | 96 Weekly |
| Households by cart size | 5,074 | 17,584 | 29,147 | 20,079 |
| 71,884 | | | | |
| Collection/Disposal Fees (Citywide Annual) | \$672,204 | \$2,865,489 | \$6,781,924 | \$5,269,533 |
| \$15,589,149 | | | | |
| Collection/Disposal Capacity (1,000s of gallons; Citywide Annual) | 4,617 | 32,003 | 97,001 | 100,234 |
| 233,856 | | | | |
| Percent of Citywide Collection/Disposal | 2.0% | 13.7% | 41.5% | 42.9% |
| Percent of Citywide Collection/Disposal Fees | 4.3% | 18.4% | 43.5% | 33.8% |
| Fees OVERcharge or UNDERcharge | OVER | OVER | OVER | UNDER |

THESE CALCULATIONS ASSUME:

- No opt-outs
- No sharing of carts
- No temporary service holds
- Number of carts is the same as last year

REALLOCATION RESULTS:

- Haulers collect the SAME total annual dollars with or without Reallocation.
- All households pay the SAME per-gallon price for Collection/Disposal fees.
 - 1 Total charges go DOWN for households with small & medium carts.
 - 2 Total charges go UP for households with large carts.
- When paying an equalized rate per gallon of cart capacity, households are rewarded for conserving natural resources.

-- Reallocated -- Total citywide annual Fees x Percent of disposal capacity

| | | | | |
|---|------------------|--------------------|--------------------|--------------------|
| Collection/Disposal Fees (Citywide Annual) | \$307,798 | \$2,133,356 | \$6,466,234 | \$6,681,761 |
| \$15,589,149 | | | | |
| Households by cart size | 5,074 | 17,584 | 29,147 | 20,079 |
| 71,884 | | | | |
| Collection/Disposal Fees (Monthly, per Cart) | \$5.06 | \$10.11 | \$18.49 | \$27.73 |