

PARTIAL - NOT
ADOPTED

PARTIAL SUMMARY MINUTES OF THE HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION
CITY OF SAINT PAUL, MINNESOTA
Lower Level – Room 41, City Hall/Court House, 15 West Kellogg Boulevard
April 25, 2013

Present: Richard Dana, Robert Ferguson, Matt Hill, Michael Justin, Rich Laffin, Matt Mazanec, David Wagner, Steve Trimble, Diane Trout-Oertel

Absent: Renee Hutter Barnes (unexcused), David Riehle (unexcused)

Staff Present: Christine Boulware, Amy Spong (partial), Bill Dermody

BUSINESS MEETING

- I. **Call to Order:** 5:03
- II. **Approval of the Agenda:** Commissioner Dana moved to approve the agenda; Commissioner Wagner seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.
- III. **Approval of the meeting minutes:** Minutes were not submitted for review or approval
 - A. ~~March 14, 2013 Business Meeting~~
 - B. ~~March 28, 2013 Public Hearing/ Permit Review~~
- IV. **Chair's Announcements:** There were none stated.
- V. **Staff Announcements:** There were none stated.
- VI. **Old Business**
 - A. **Adopt resolution supporting lighting of the Civil War Monument at Kellogg and John Ireland Boulevards. Monument is not locally designated and does not require design review by the HPC as stated under Legislative Code 73.06. City Council action for acceptance of the donation will follow. This item was laid over for the final resolution (Spong, 266-6714).**
- VII. **New Business:**
 - A. **484 Ashland Avenue - Ashland Hotel, Hill Historic District**, by John Harriss, Harriss Architects, Inc., for permits to rehabilitate the existing hotel building, demolish the adjacent 3-story additions, and construct a new 3-story addition. **File #13-019** (Spong, 266-6714)
 - B. **613- 619 Selby Avenue, Hill Historic District**, by Chauncey Peterson, DeMars Signs, Inc., for a permit to install eight new signs on three elevations of the building. **File #13-020** (Boulware, 266-6715)
 - C. **513 Portland Avenue, Hill Historic District**, by owner Brett Turner, for a permit to construct a 3+ stall garage in the rear of the property. **File #13-021** (Boulware, 266-6715)
 - D. **214 East 4th Street, Lowertown Historic District**, by Guillermo Arriondo, HGA Design, LLC, for a permit to install signage including: mounted banners, monument

signs, wall mounted signs, and dimensional letters on all elevations. **File #13-022**
(Dermody, 266-6617)

E. 255 6th Street East and 266 7th Street East, Lowertown Historic District, by Dave Brooks, 9 & 19 Properties, LLC, for a permit to construct a skyway level exit bridge at the rear of both buildings for egress purposes. **File #13-023** (Boulware, 266-6715)

F. 255 6th Street East, Lowertown Historic District, by Dave Brooks, 9 & 19 Properties, LLC, for a permit to install a 4-ft x19-ft illuminated sign on the upper east elevation of the building. **File #13-024** (Dermody, 266-6617)

Mr. Dermody summarized the report recommending denial of the application. He noted that staff could have recommended approval of a scaled-down sign located lower on the building, but not as presented.

Commissioner Dana asked about staff's interpretation in Finding #4: Is that no signage *above* the uppermost portion of the façade wall or *in* the uppermost portion?

Mr. Dermody said the actual language is "there should be no sign above the cornice line or uppermost portion of a façade wall." He stated that staff was not looking at a particular word in this phrase, but rather the intent. They found that the intent was to avoid large signage in the top portion of buildings.

Commissioner Wagner asked if this building, with its 4-floor parking garage and two (2) stories above, changes staff's sensibility as to what is the "upper portion" of a building. He noted that it feels like two distinct sections. He added that it feels as though the façade does not start until you get to the top portion.

Ms. Boulware responded that we would look at the building as a whole. She noted that zoning already forbids signs on top of the buildings. She stated that the intent is for more of a pedestrian scale.

Dan Gleeson, applicant's representative, interjected that the 1st Bank sign has been declared a monument. Ms. Boulware noted that it could not be done today.

Mr. Gleeson and Mr. Brooks corrected the staff report is incorrect with regard to the sign size. They said that it is only 26 inches wide.

Ms. Boulware asked about the method of attachment and advised that more information about this would likely be needed in order to get a permit.

Mr. Brooks said that the sign looks better in its proposed vertical form up high, rather than on the girders on the parking garage levels lower down. He showed some pictures of other signs nearby that he feels are less attractive. He asked that this be considered a "double building" as Commissioner Wagner suggested.

Chair Laffin suggested that signage be allowed down low, as it was for the Union Depot case, but not up high.

Commissioner Dana moved to deny the request as recommended by staff. Commissioner Trimble seconded the motion. Commissioner Trimble stated that this should be considered one building, not a different building at the top.

Commissioner Ferguson stated that it is difficult to apply the guidelines to a modern building like this that does not reflect the character of the district. He added that he found staff's explanation helpful about the intent of the guideline language. The motion passed 8-0.

VIII. Committee Reports:

A. Awards Committee (Trout-Oertel, Laffin, Dana)

IX. Motion to Adjourn: 9:00 p.m.

Submitted by: R. Cohn, B. Dermody