



City of Saint Paul

City Hall and Court House
15 West Kellogg Boulevard
Council Chambers - 3rd
Floor
651-266-8560

Minutes - Final

City Council

Council President Amy Brendmoen
Councilmember Dan Bostrom
Councilmember Mitra Jalali Nelson
Councilmember Rebecca Noecker
Councilmember Jane L. Prince
Councilmember Dai Thao
Councilmember Chris Tolbert

Wednesday, September 12, 2018

3:30 PM

Council Chambers - 3rd Floor

Public Hearing on the Citizen's League Independent Minimum Wage Study at 5:30 p.m.

ROLL CALL

The meeting was called to order by Council President Brendmoen at 3:30 p.m.

Councilmember Thao excused

- Present** 5 - Councilmember Dan Bostrom, Councilmember Amy Brendmoen, Councilmember Chris Tolbert, Councilmember Rebecca Noecker and Councilmember Jane L. Prince
- Absent** 2 - Councilmember Dai Thao and Councilmember Mitra Jalali

COMMUNICATIONS & RECEIVE/FILE

- 1 [CO 18-46](#) Letters from the Department of Safety and Inspections declaring 2059 Idaho Avenue East and 667 Ohio Street as nuisance properties. (For notification purposes only; public hearings will be scheduled at a later date if necessary.)
Received and filed

- 2 [CO 18-48](#) Letters from the Department of Safety and Inspections declaring 1368 Alaska Avenue and 636 Hall Avenue as nuisance properties. (For notification purposes only; public hearings will be scheduled at a later date if necessary.)
Received and filed

CONSENT AGENDA

Items listed under the Consent Agenda will be enacted by one motion with no separate discussion. If discussion on an item is desired, the item will be removed from the Consent Agenda for separate consideration.

Approval of the Consent Agenda (Items 3 - 15)

*Items 4 and 11 were removed from the Consent Agenda for separate consideration.
Items 13 and 14 were withdrawn.*

Councilmember Bostrom moved approval of the Consent Agenda as amended.

Consent Agenda adopted as amended

Yea: 5 - Councilmember Bostrom, Councilmember Brendmoen, Councilmember Tolbert, Councilmember Noecker and Councilmember Prince

Nay: 0

Absent: 2 - Councilmember Thao and Councilmember Jalali

- 3** [RES 18-1489](#) Approving the Settlement Agreement and Release between the City of Saint Paul and Robin Kirkland Neal and his attorney, Oliver E. Nelson.
Adopted
- 5** [RES 18-1464](#) Acknowledging receipt of District Energy St. Paul, Inc. notice of rate increase as of October 1, 2018, and directing the Office of Financial Services to review and analyze the rate changes.
Adopted
- 6** [RES 18-1415](#) Establishing the rate of pay for the new classification of Library Technology Manager in Grade 020, EG 09, SPSO.
Adopted
- 7** [RES 18-1485](#) Accepting the gift of the partial costs of travel expenses from Minnesota Philanthropy Partners for Danette Parr, Taina Maki, and Russ Stark to attend a Nordic Cities Master Class in Copenhagen, Denmark, September 16-22, 2018.
Adopted
- 8** [RES 18-1526](#) Accepting the gift of airfare, transportation, and food expenses from the Heartland Alliance, for Kaohly Her and Ikram Koliso to attend the Upper Midwest College Savings Account (CSA) Consortium convening with nationwide CSA program administrators and national asset building organizations.
Adopted

- 9 [RES 18-1506](#) Approving adverse action against the Auto Repair Garage and Auto Body Repair/Painting Shop licenses held by Cha Sur Vang, d/b/a Solange Auto Service at 291 Fillmore Avenue East.
Adopted
- 10 [RES 18-1507](#) Approving adverse action against the Massage Practitioner license application submitted by Tamara Jean Hillis for the premises located at 762 Cleveland Avenue South.
Adopted
- 12 [RES 18-1500](#) Approving adverse action against the Taxicab Driver license held by Edwin Allen Praiseworthy.
Adopted
- 13 [RES 18-1501](#) Approving adverse action against the Solid Waste Hauler & Vehicle and Solid Waste Hauler (Each Additional Vehicle) licenses held by Garbage Man of Highland Park, LLC, d/b/a Garbage Man. (To be withdrawn)
Withdrawn
- 14 [RES 18-1505](#) Approving adverse action against the City Contractor-General Installation license held by Selby Ornamental Iron Co. at 1160-7th Street East. (To be withdrawn)
Withdrawn
- 15 [RES 18-1510](#) Requesting that the City Council reconsider the license issuance for Black Hart of Saint Paul LLC (License ID # 21080001270), d/b/a The Black Hart of Saint Paul, referencing RES 18-1161.
Adopted

FOR DISCUSSION**Councilmember Jalali Nelson joined the meeting**

- Present** 6 - Councilmember Dan Bostrom, Councilmember Amy Brendmoen, Councilmember Chris Tolbert, Councilmember Rebecca Noecker, Councilmember Jane L. Prince and Councilmember Mitra Jalali
- Absent** 1 - Councilmember Dai Thao

- 4** [RES 18-1518](#) Proclaiming September 12, 2018 as Mark A. Hicks Day in the City of Saint Paul.
- Council President Brendmoen invited Mark A. Hicks and his guests to the podium, and she read the resolution.*
- Mr. Hicks made brief comments.*
- Councilmember Bostrom moved approval of the resolution.*
- Adopted**
- Yea:** 6 - Councilmember Bostrom, Councilmember Brendmoen, Councilmember Tolbert, Councilmember Noecker, Councilmember Prince and Councilmember Jalali
- Nay:** 0
- Absent:** 1 - Councilmember Thao
-
- 11** [RES 18-1498](#) Approving adverse action against the Taxicab Vehicle licenses for #1391, #1392, #1395 and #3634 held by Waleed Ahmed Sonbol, d/b/a Blue & White Service Corporation (License ID# 20090001909, #20090001911, #20090003037 and #20110000728).
- Councilmember Jalali Nelson moved a two-week layover.*
- Laid over to September 26**
- Yea:** 6 - Councilmember Bostrom, Councilmember Brendmoen, Councilmember Tolbert, Councilmember Noecker, Councilmember Prince and Councilmember Jalali
- Nay:** 0
- Absent:** 1 - Councilmember Thao
-
- 16** [RES 18-1348](#) Recognizing Change to Chill Week.
- Councilmember Prince invited representatives from Allina Health and Harding High School to the podium. She spoke about the program and partnership, and she read the resolution. A representative from Allina Health made brief comments. Councilmember Prince moved approval of the resolution.*
- Adopted**
- Yea:** 6 - Councilmember Bostrom, Councilmember Brendmoen, Councilmember Tolbert, Councilmember Noecker, Councilmember Prince and Councilmember Jalali
- Nay:** 0
- Absent:** 1 - Councilmember Thao

- 17 [RES PH 18-246](#) Granting the application of Summit Center for Arts and Innovation for a historic use variance at 1524 Summit Avenue. (Public hearing held September 5)

*Councilmember Tolbert said he laid the matter over for a week to clarify the hours of operation. He moved a version 2 of the resolution with clarified language. Yeas - 6
Nays - 0*

Councilmember Tolbert moved approval of the resolution as amended.

Adopted as amended

Yea: 5 - Councilmember Bostrom, Councilmember Brendmoen, Councilmember Tolbert, Councilmember Noecker and Councilmember Jalali

Nay: 0

Absent: 2 - Councilmember Thao and Councilmember Prince

ORDINANCES

An ordinance is a city law enacted by the City Council. It is read at four separate council meetings and becomes effective after passage by the Council and 30 days after publication in the Saint Paul Legal Ledger. Public hearings on ordinances are held at the third reading.

Final Adoption

- 18 [Ord 18-28](#) Amending Chapters 65 and 66 of the Legislative Code pertaining to Accessory Dwelling Units.

Councilmember Prince moved a two-week layover to get more information about the zoning in the critical area. She said she believed there were some other questions related to short term rentals. Councilmember Noecker asked for clarification of the additional questions Councilmember Prince wanted resolved. Councilmember Prince said issues were raised about ADUs in the critical area, and she believed Councilmember Tolbert had been trying to connect with the City Attorney on questions he had.

Councilmember Tolbert said he was working with Peter Warner on the ownership requirement and issues related to enforcement, and how this interplayed with short term rentals.

Councilmember Bostrom said it was also important to clarify what happened when that property was sold, so these things didn't wind up becoming totally rental property.

Laid over to September 26

Yea: 5 - Councilmember Bostrom, Councilmember Brendmoen, Councilmember Tolbert, Councilmember Prince and Councilmember Jalali

Nay: 1 - Councilmember Noecker

Absent: 1 - Councilmember Thao

- 19 [Ord 18-43](#) Granting the application of The Salvation Army to rezone the property at 618-626 Lawson Avenue East from RT1 Two-Family Residential to B2 Community Business, and amending Chapter 60 of the Legislative Code pertaining to the zoning map.

Councilmember Bostrom moved final adoption of the ordinance.

Adopted

Yea: 5 - Councilmember Bostrom, Councilmember Brendmoen, Councilmember Tolbert, Councilmember Noecker and Councilmember Jalali

Nay: 0

Absent: 2 - Councilmember Thao and Councilmember Prince

- 20 [Ord 18-45](#) Granting the application of City of Saint Paul to rezone property at 2239 Como Avenue from T1 Traditional Neighborhood to RT2 Townhouse Residential, and amending Chapter 60 of the Saint Paul Legislative Code pertaining to the Saint Paul zoning map.

Councilmember Jalali Nelson moved final adoption of the ordinance.

Adopted

Yea: 5 - Councilmember Bostrom, Councilmember Brendmoen, Councilmember Tolbert, Councilmember Noecker and Councilmember Jalali

Nay: 0

Absent: 2 - Councilmember Thao and Councilmember Prince

Second Reading

- 21 [Ord 18-47](#) Granting the application of the Housing and Redevelopment Authority to rezone the property at 623 and 629 Whittall Street from RT2 Townhouse to T2 Traditional Neighborhood, and amending Chapter 60 of the Legislative Code pertaining to the zoning map.

Laid over to September 19 for third reading/public hearing

- 22 [Ord 18-48](#) Granting the application of KBD Investments to rezone property at 877 White Bear Avenue North from OS Office Service to B2 Community Business, and amending Chapter 60 of the Legislative Code pertaining to the zoning map.

Laid over to September 19 for third reading/public hearing

- 23 [Ord 18-49](#) Amending the zoning map as recommended in the West Marshall Avenue Zoning Study.

Laid over to September 19 for third reading/public hearing

BUDGET AMENDMENT PUBLIC HEARINGS

- 24 [RES PH 18-244](#) Authorizing the Parks and Recreation Department to enter into a grant agreement with and provide indemnification for the State of Minnesota, Department of Transportation, to accept a \$6,432,978.92 FHWA High Priority grant for the Robert Piram Regional Trail, and to amend the budget to include additional monies.

No one was present to testify. Councilmember Noecker moved to close the public hearing and approve the resolution.

Adopted

Yea: 6 - Councilmember Bostrom, Councilmember Brendmoen, Councilmember Tolbert, Councilmember Noecker, Councilmember Prince and Councilmember Jalali

Nay: 0

Absent: 1 - Councilmember Thao

LEGISLATIVE HEARING ITEMS FOR DISCUSSION

- 29 [RLH VO 18-43](#) Appeal of Mark Schuch to a Notice of Condemnation as Unfit for Human Habitation & Order to Vacate, Summary Abatement Order and 2 Vehicle Abatement Orders at 1004 EDMUND AVENUE.

Legislative Hearing Officer Marcia Moermond said she had met with the appellant in the hallway outside of the chambers. She said the principle violations had been corrected and the condemnation lifted. There were additional orders to be addressed and deadlines were imbedded in the resolution. Ms. Moermond and the appellant had agreed on a November 15 deadline to complete the repair work for the siding.

No one was present to testify. Councilmember Bostrom moved to close the public hearing and adopt Ms. Moermond's recommendations.

Adopted as amended (extension granted for compliance)

Yea: 6 - Councilmember Bostrom, Councilmember Brendmoen, Councilmember Tolbert, Councilmember Noecker, Councilmember Prince and Councilmember Jalali

Nay: 0

Absent: 1 - Councilmember Thao

LEGISLATIVE HEARING CONSENT AGENDA

Items listed under the Consent Agenda will receive a combined public hearing and be enacted by one motion with no separate discussion. Items may be removed from the Consent Agenda for a separate public hearing and discussion if desired.

Approval of the Consent Agenda (Items 25 - 51)

No one was present to testify. Councilmember Jalali Nelson moved approval of the Legislative Hearing Consent Agenda as amended.

Legislative Hearing Consent Agenda adopted as amended

Yea: 6 - Councilmember Bostrom, Councilmember Brendmoen, Councilmember Tolbert, Councilmember Noecker, Councilmember Prince and Councilmember Jalali

Nay: 0

Absent: 1 - Councilmember Thao

- 25** [RLH TA 18-423](#) Ratifying the Appealed Special Tax Assessment for property at 1047 BREEN STREET. (File No. J1812A, Assessment No. 188532)
Adopted
- 26** [RLH TA 18-410](#) Ratifying the Appealed Special Tax Assessment for property at 452 CARROLL AVENUE. (File No. J1812A, Assessment No. 188532)
Adopted
- 27** [RLH TA 18-432](#) Ratifying the Appealed Special Tax Assessment for property at 801 CHARLES AVENUE. (File No. J1812A, Assessment No. 188532)
Adopted
- 28** [RLH TA 18-417](#) Ratifying the Appealed Special Tax Assessment for property at 120 CONGRESS STREET. (File No. J1812A, Assessment No. 188532; amended to File No. J1812A2, Assessment No. 188560) (Public hearing continued from September 12)
Public hearing continued to October 17
- 30** [RLH TA 18-350](#) Ratifying the Appealed Special Tax Assessment for property at 1604 EUCLID STREET. (File No. J1811A, Assessment No. 188525; Amended to File No. J1811A2, Assessment No. 188559)
Adopted as amended (assessment number updated; assessment ratified)
- 31** [RLH TA 18-409](#) Deleting the Appealed Special Tax Assessment for property at 100 GEORGE STEET EAST (File No. J1813A, Assessment No. 188533)
Adopted
- 32** [RLH TA 18-422](#) Ratifying the Appealed Special Tax Assessment for property at 1006 IGLEHART AVENUE. (File No. J1812A, Assessment No. 188532)
Adopted

- 33 [RLH TA 18-427](#) Ratifying the Appealed Special Tax Assessment for property at 1074 JESSIE STREET. (File No. J1812A, Assessment No. 188532)
Adopted
- 34 [RLH TA 18-435](#) Deleting the Appealed Special Tax Assessment for property at 991 KILBURN AVENUE. (File No. J1812A, Assessment No. 188532)
Adopted
- 35 [RLH TA 18-425](#) Ratifying the Appealed Special Tax Assessment for property at 623 LAUREL AVENUE. (File No. J1812A, Assessment No. 188532; amend to File No. J1812A2, Assessment No. 188560) (Public hearing continued from September 12)
Public hearing continued to October 17
- 36 [RLH TA 18-468](#) Ratifying the Appealed Special Tax Assessment for property at 45 LAWSON AVENUE WEST. (File No. J1813A, Assessment No. 188533)
Adopted
- 37 [RLH CO 18-33](#) Appeal of Lori Schilling to a Correction Order at 2056 MAGNOLIA AVENUE EAST.
Adopted
- 38 [RLH TA 18-421](#) Deleting the Appealed Special Tax Assessment for property at 1295 MARION STREET. (File No. J1812A, Assessment No. 188532)
Adopted
- 39 [RLH FCO
18-137](#) Appeal of Elinor Daleiden to a Correction Notice-Complaint Inspection at 69 MILTON STREET NORTH.
Adopted
- 40 [RLH SAO 18-60](#) Appeal of Jose Flores to a Summary Abatement Order at 802 MOUND STREET.
Adopted
- 41 [RLH TA 18-436](#) Ratifying the Appealed Special Tax Assessment for property at 861 PAYNE AVENUE. (File No. J1812A, Assessment No. 188532; amend to File No. J1812A2, Assessment No. 188560) (Public hearing continued from September 12)
Public hearing continued to October 17

- 42 [RLH RR 18-41](#) Making finding on the appealed nuisance abatement ordered for 2096 REANEY AVENUE in Council File Nos. RLH RR 17-52 and RLH RR 17-28. (Public hearing continued from November 28)
Public hearing continued to October 24
- 43 [RLH TA 18-426](#) Ratifying the Appealed Special Tax Assessment for property at 1314 RICE STREET. (File No. J1812A, Assessment No. 188532)
Adopted
- 44 [RLH TA 18-424](#) Ratifying the Appealed Special Tax Assessment for property at 1772 SCHEFFER AVENUE. (File No. J1812A, Assessment No. 188532)
Adopted
- 46 [RLH TA 18-418](#) Ratifying the Appealed Special Tax Assessment for property at 981 VICTORIA STREET NORTH. (File No. J1812A, Assessment No. 188532; amend to File No. J1812A2, Assessment No. 188560) (Public hearing continued from September 12)
Public hearing continued to October 17
- 45 [RLH TA 18-429](#) Ratifying the Appealed Special Tax Assessment for property at 1738 SHERWOOD AVENUE. (File No. J1813A, Assessment No. 188533)
Adopted
- 47 [RLH VBR 18-57](#) Appeal of Louis and Gina Yanez to a Vacant Building Registration Notice at 740 WASECA STREET.
Adopted
- 48 [RLH RR 18-40](#) Making finding on the appealed nuisance abatement ordered for 670 WESTERN AVENUE NORTH in Council File Nos. RLH RR 18-5 and RLH RR 17-22.
Adopted
- 49 [RLH TA 18-517](#) Ratifying the Appealed Special Tax Assessment for property at 663 YORK AVENUE. (File No. J1812A, Assessment No. 188532)
Adopted
- 50 [RLH AR 18-56](#) Ratifying the assessments for Property Clean Up services during April 2 to 13, 2018. (File No. J1812A, Assessment No. 188532)
Adopted as amended (796 Van Buren Avenue removed from the assessment roll for separate consideration)

- 51 [RLH AR 18-57](#) Ratifying the assessments for Property Clean Up services during April 18 to 30, 2018. (File No. J1813A, Assessment No. 188533)

Adopted

Council members shared news from the wards.

The Council recessed at 4:05 p.m.

PUBLIC HEARING (5:30 p.m.)

The Council reconvened for Public Hearings at 5:31 p.m.

52 [PH 18-3](#)**Presentation and public hearing on the Citizen's League Independent Minimum Wage Study Report recommendations.**

Council President Brendmoen welcomed those present, and provided some background on the process to date. She thanked Councilmember Tolbert for his leadership. She introduced Pahoua Yang Hoffman, Executive Director, and Angelica Klebsch of the Citizens League.

Pahoua Yang Hoffman, Citizens League Executive Director, made introductory comments.

Angelica Klebsch, Citizens League Policy Director, and B Kyle and Rick Varco, study group co-chairs, reviewed the process and study results, and answered Council members' questions.

Council President Brendmoen: There are 47 people who would like to speak tonight which is wonderful. My job is to ensure #47 gets the same care and concern as #1, 2, and 3. To do that, I'm going to rely on the speakers to be respectful of the time limits that we have set for speaking. We will continue to collect information on this, so this is not your one and only time to speak. Two minutes is not enough time to speak, we know that, but it is enough time to hit your high notes. You can drop a "ditto" on us if someone else shares your view and say the other things you care about. Tell us your full name and your neighborhood before you testify. You will have up to two minutes to speak. Correction, there are 50 people who would like to speak.

Public testimony:

Tom Dimond, Highwood: The law says that no employer can directly or indirectly use tips as payment toward minimum wage. It also says that any tips received by an employer for an employee is the sole property of the employee. It is written this way because when an employer can take tips away, it puts employees in a very vulnerable position. The state didn't want that to happen anymore. I strongly encourage you to retain that provision and protect the workers as you move ahead.

Jennifer Schellenberg, President of Restaurant Workers of America: I represent more than 8000 service industry workers in Minneapolis and St Paul. I've been a service industry worker for 18 years, both in Minneapolis and St Paul from catering to dive bars, music venues and neighborhood pubs. My position is not paid; my work is volunteer work, unlike many of our opposition. During the Citizen's League process we heard two important aspects, from both the opponents and the proponents of the tip credit, that I don't want the Council to forget. Both sides agree that full-service workers will lose 20% of their income by the time we get to \$15/hour. They also agree that full-service workers in the tipped community are already at \$28/hour on average. The people who need equity are the back of house and support positions. The reason I am speaking to you is because the overwhelming majority of the restaurant community support tip credit. While I appreciate the SCIU contribution to the overall labor force, they do not represent anyone in our community. I hope that you will listen to the people who will be most adversely affected by the \$15 without a tip credit. Our goal, as supporters of the tip credit, is not to silence those who are opposed, but to try to bring nuance that addresses their concerns. What we have asked for is to redefine a tipped worker, which will change who this is going to affect. We have asked for income averages per shift, rather than per pay period, as Boston and DC are considering. I hope that you will take the opportunity to have the highest tip-tiered wage in the entire country and protect our incomes.

Matt Gray, Inver Grove Heights: I work at W.A. Frost. I served on the task force of full-service restaurant workers who want a tip credit, including in our city's minimum wage ordinance. The number one concern of tipped workers of a wage increase without a tip credit is a reduction in our incomes. Our concern is not that patrons will stop tipping or undertip, but rather that restaurant's labor costs will increase by 55% and the only viable way for restauranteurs to stay open is to abandon tipping and shift to service charges. The impact of service charges was incorporated into the committee's charge. Two restauranteurs presented business models with potential impacts. One model reduced tipped workers incomes from \$31 to \$23. Another from \$32 to \$26. Both resulted in a 20-25% reduction in tipped workers' incomes. Please consider the negative impacts of a wage increase without a tip credit will have on tipped workers in St Paul.

Isaac Hoehn, student at Macalester College: No one is paying me to be here today. I am making \$10.75/hour. In many other countries, minimum wage is higher than here. Once I graduate, I plan to leave this country so I can make enough money to pay off my student loans which are through the roof right now. An increase in minimum wage to at least \$15/hour would make a huge difference in the lives of me and many of my friends, many of my fellow workers. Honestly, \$15 isn't enough. I know the idea of \$20 was brought up during the Citizen's League meetings. That is what we really need in this City, in this state, in this country.

Wyatt Feten, St Anthony Park neighborhood: I am an unpaid volunteer. Tip penalties have been illegal in Minnesota for decades for a reason. They are notoriously hard to enforce and they lead to opening the door for all sorts of wage theft for tipped workers in restaurants. I've worked for \$3.75/hour in South Dakota before. I have to say I make just as much in tips here while I make \$9.65/hour, if not more. Not all tipped workers make as much as fancy table side workers or bartenders. There again, there's a disparity where not all full-service restaurants have the same sort of reliable tip income as the poshest establishments with the cushiest incomes. I've heard, usually from people who are more worried about how much profit they will have to cough up to pay workers and taxes, than they are worried about whether they will be able to make the rent this month. Saying that this tip credit will save us and if we get \$15 plus tips we will make less money overall. Forgive me if I'm a little cynical about whether or not they have workers' best interests at heart. I think they are trying to get their foot in the door so they don't have to raise the minimum wage again; they can just say their tips will go up and that will be worth it. \$15/hour with no tip carve-outs, no penalties, is like the minimum you can do for all the workers here in the City. It'll make a reliable income that is not dependent on scheduling whims for good shifts, bad shifts, weeknights, weekends that are at the whims of your boss. And it'll free you from sucking up to get a good tip from those that want to harass you and power trip all over you. A gratuity is a gratuity and not an excuse to pay your workers less.

Danny Epstein: I'm 25, been a tip worker for 10 years. I'm also an unpaid volunteer. Right now I live in Minneapolis but I work in the St Paul Midway neighborhood, making coffee. I am here today to demand a \$15 minimum wage. One fair wage, no exceptions. I'm tired of waiting on my fluctuating tips to barely get by in the City. I make \$11.50 but I actually make a good deal more with tips, so it may make me an outlier on this side of the argument. Too often, I make significantly less. About a third of my income comes from tips, but a week or so of heavy snow, a month of construction that blocks parking, maybe training a new barista that creates an "off" customer experience, can create a huge dip in my income. That instability creates a low quality of life. It leads to higher levels of risk-taking behaviors among restaurant workers. Please pass the \$15 wage, no tip exception.

Sharmaine Wright, Minneapolis: I'm 20 and I think \$15/hour would be better for the community and me because I'm planning to get a car. I make \$11/hour at Dellwood Gardens but the opportunity for me is to build more things in my life and I want better opportunities to have a good life. I think the \$15 should be higher because I think people deserve better pay than what they get. Some people don't have what they need.

Shalantra Taylor: I am 22 years old. I live in St Paul and work in St Paul. I've worked at five McDonald's and they all pay the same amount. I'm tired of how they treat their employees but pay only \$10/hour. They sit on whole lumps of cash; I want to sit on whole lumps of cash, too. Just like the commercial: "it's my money and I need it now" because I am working hard and paying bills. I want to be in you guys' shoes. I don't want my kid to struggle the way I do.

Andrea Kieppe, Minneapolis: I am not paid to be here. I work in St Paul, so this ordinance, if it passes, will benefit my co-workers as well as the people I serve in my job. I urge you to pass the \$15 wage with no carve-outs and with the most progressive approach to the youth and disability exemptions that have been proposed. I urge you to do this without further delay. I was an active volunteer on the Minneapolis \$15 wage because I wanted to see the benefits it would bring to my community, you are in the "catbird seat." You have the benefit of all the research we did and the years of process we did in the public as well as your own process that you spent 10 months and \$100,000 on. Our study was crystal clear that there would be huge benefits to workers, especially workers of color. That there would be huge benefits to the local economy and that any price increases would be negligible. That study was great and it said go ahead with \$15 and this study is great and it says go ahead with \$15. There's no need for more study. Mayor Carter was elected running strongly on \$15. The public will on this is very clear. Our community will benefit. I urge you to act quickly.

Paying Yang, East Side St Paul: I come from a privileged background and am here as a volunteer. I come from a middle-class family, two parent household. My parents own three small businesses on the East Side. They are Hmong refugees and I can't speak for them but I support \$15/hour and even more with inflation rates. When I was in high school, I laughed at the idea of \$15/hour. But now, seeing this and actually working at a restaurant as a bartender, server, and a barista, previously, Holy Sh...Shoes! We are treated as animals, begging for tips. I can survive without tips. I can survive with minimum wage but a lot of my peers and co-workers can't. Minnesota has one of the least amount of homes owned by people of color. From the Star Tribune, "the racial gap in home ownership is another reflection of the disparities between white and nonwhites incomes in Minnesota, a division that has grown in recent years. In 2015 white households in Minnesota reported an average income of \$67,000 compared to \$30,000 for blacks and \$43,000 for Hispanics. Also, taking into account that this year, 2018, has the lowest unemployment rate in 18 years, since 2000, yet poverty statistics have increased."

Meriem Chebli, Macalester/Groveland: If my poor life doesn't convince you that we need \$15 minimum wage, I don't know what else can convince you. I woke up with \$30 in my bank account. I ran from the bus to another and still made it to school late, again. I met my friend after she drove to school after she watched 'Keeping Up with the Kardashians.' As she was talking, I asked myself what if I had the chance to choose myself my color, my last name, or my parents. I took an Uber that cost me \$20, equal to two hours hard work standing up in Walgreen's pharmacy. Today, I am 22, physically spent and emotionally exhausted. I am almost due to leave my transitional housing facility. My state healthcare will be terminated next month, so no more

anti-depressants. I barely afforded three classes at my community college. Hanging out with friends has become a financial struggle. Finding someone who won't judge me for my social class is even a bigger struggle. For how long can I do this on my own? I know I can't give up because within surrender lies the options of suicide and prostitution. I shed tears everyday thinking, if this is me with \$10/hour, then how are those with less than me doing right now? How do you think they are feeling? Only God knows what happened to the American dream. I urge you today to do something about it. \$15, \$20, anything you want. I just can't do this anymore.

Celeste Robinson: I live in Minneapolis and I worked in St Paul on the campaign to raise the minimum wage. I've spent the last year talking to your constituents. I have here a box with about 2000 petitions signed by the people who live in your wards, work in your wards, people who are your neighbors. They are going to go in the public record. I show you this to let you know, visually, that there is a public mandate for a \$15 minimum wage with no tip penalty or exemptions. That was evident last November in the election of Mayor Carter, that was evident just a few weeks ago in the outcome of the Ward 4 race. Now, after 10 months and \$100,000, it also evident in the fact that 77% of your committee of experts, who went as deep into the data, all the research support, support a \$15 minimum wage with no tip penalty, much like the policy that passed in Minneapolis. If you trust and believe in the process, you must trust and believe in the outcomes, which was 77% support for the policy that workers have championed for more than a year.

Joe Hesla: I live in Minneapolis and I teach at Central High School. We need \$15 with no youth carve-out and no tip penalty. I've been to three public input sessions and heard dozens of testimonies and, as the Citizen's League knows, a great majority were against the youth carve-out and against the tip penalty. This ordinance will determine the fate and welfare of many of my students, and their parents, and their families of low wage workers. Students need \$15 as much as adults. After months of study and public input, the Citizen's League, with a majority of 77%, has recommended for \$15 with no tip penalty and no youth carve out. This strong recommendation came in spite of the make-up of the committee, which had an overwhelming majority of people who are not low wage workers. In spite of that, the committee recommended no youth carve-out and no tip penalty. I ask the City Council to listen to that recommendation; my students are depending on that. Finally, in states where there is a tip penalty, it results in stolen wages. And instead of a youth carve out, I think we need a corporation carve-out. McDonald's can pay \$15 right now. These are huge corporations that make a great profit off our community.

Alicia Hinze: I am the owner of the Buttered Tin in Lowertown St Paul. I am here in support of the \$15 minimum wage without tip adjustment. I care for my employees and the wages of my servers as well as the wage of everybody else in my restaurant. I believe a tip adjustment would hinder the servers rather than help them. After working in corporate America, I became a restaurant owner and realized the inequities of the industry, in particular around pay. I understand the anxiety around this issue. I really like the City's unwillingness to copy and paste from Minneapolis because we have the opportunity to educate the public as to why we need this change.

Tony Parrish: I represent the Conway community and also the African American community. At the beginning of the summer there was a listening session at Arlington Hills. I talked about Judy's Kitchen, about how the owner couldn't get the things he needed, like a freezer, so he could have what he needed to make his business work. That resulted in him being in over his head in debt. And Judy's Kitchen is no longer around. The African-American community is turning towards entrepreneurship

because of the trials and tribulations we face on the job. In August, Black Enterprise published an article about a 400% increase in black entrepreneurship. What does that tell you? 22% of those who went to entrepreneurship was because of their treatment in corporate America. Not to mention, over half of us have criminal backgrounds. Our only alternative is to turn to entrepreneurship. When you think about Judy's Kitchen and how Judy's Kitchen didn't have enough support to be able to survive, we need to think about that 400% increase that will take place in Minnesota and how we will support that community.

Thor Backus: I am a citizen of St Paul, been living here for two years. I am also an organizer for AFSME Council 65. I am here on my own time. What we are dealing with here are families, children, and, like the testimony from the young lady earlier, people are in crisis. \$10 is not enough; \$12 is not enough. I don't even think \$15 is enough. I don't think the accelerated plan is even sufficient. I would like to offer Option 4. No one in this room has created this crisis. We all play a part. It's mind-boggling to me, that in the USA, people can work for 40 hours a week and not make enough to pay rent, food, transportation and we've got school, all that stuff. Political forces, as well as global influences, are actually supporting the idea that some citizens should be poor in this country. This is wrong; this is not good for the country or the economy. I am here to ask you to take the lead and propose an immediate increase in the minimum wage for large corporations. So the CEOs will have to get a smaller yacht next year. I think they are going to be OK. Smaller businesses could go to a two-year plan. The best plan is to have the City subsidize those small businesses, which I've grown to know and love, so they can pay at least \$15, and take the money that we normally contribute to the large corporations who take those hand-outs very happily, and transfer those funds to the small businesses.

Sarah Kopp-Reddy, St Paul: I support \$15 with no tip penalty or carve outs. I was on the Citizen's League Study Committee. It was a lot of hard work. It was a great experience; the outcome was 77% support for \$15, no penalty, very minimal carve-outs. Please take that to heart.

Barry Cohen, resident of Merriam Park for 31 years. I am 71 and retired, but I am the father of two daughters who, for the last 10 years, most of the time, have worked at minimum wage or less than minimum wage. Two years ago, in this metropolitan area, a livable wage was \$15.46. If we move forward with a phase in, we'll be running behind inflation. The rent can't wait. My daughter this week told me her rent will be going up between \$100 and \$200 a month. She is now paying \$900 for a one-bedroom apartment. The inflation rate for housing exceeds the overall inflation rate because we have a housing shortage. More than half the low income people in our area spend more than half their income on rent and utilities. This can't go on. \$15, phased in will not be enough. I would support \$20. In terms of what it is like to work in these conditions, I am subsidizing these employers. What happens in those weeks when your hours are cut, how do you make the rent. Enforcement is critical. There is wage theft in this community; people are forced to work off the clock. They come in an hour early; they prepare. The store opens up and then they punch in. Business closes at midnight; they punch out and work another hour to clean. It's wrong.

Wade Luneburg: I am a 30-year member of Unite Here, Local 17, the hospitality union here in the Twin Cities. We have 5000 members in 24 union hotels, major sports venues, our convention centers, 1400 people on the field at MSP airport. We are an incredibly diverse organization with a majority of women. African-Americans, immigrants, and new Americans, and my LGBTQ community. We represent workers in all classifications, including about 1500 servers. We are pleased to see this initiative

moving forward locally. Here in Minnesota, we have waited far too long to raise our state minimum wage. While a significant increase when it passed four years ago, it simply does not address today's needs. Like others here, we would prefer a regional approach or for the state to consider another increase, but that's not likely. We cannot afford inaction. The day St Paul passes this, this it will not only raise workers up, but it will level the playing field in the region for other businesses. Industries say they understand the need for wage increase but they insist on carve-outs, exceptions, and the ability to leave a whole classification of workers behind. They are interested in passing pre-emption laws at the state capitol. By passing this ordinance, you create a new underpinning in our local economy that puts more money in the workers' pockets and puts more back on the street and in our communities that sustains our economy. Minnesota is a one fair wage state. My members are counting on St Paul, along with Minneapolis, to be a one fair wage City.

Camille Wilcox, Minneapolis: I am a 20+ veteran of the service industry. I have worked in every single kind of restaurant, from the most elite to the worst, to dive bars. I have been a busser, a server, a manager, a bartender and everything in between. I wish a long time ago, I would have fought for an equitable wage. In 1997, I started my career in Austin, Texas, in a dive bar. I ended my career last year at Morton's Steak House in San Antonio, Texas. I made \$2.13/hour in 1997 and I made \$2.13/hour in 2018. My rent increased 400% of the 1997 level. I depended on my tips and my tips only. Where there is a tip penalty, workers are more subject to exploitation. I've seen young women sexually exploited to get better sections. I have seen unintended consequences of the tip penalty because tipped workers are often asked to do things not related to their job, like clean bathrooms and mop floors. Sometimes only to do it for \$2.13/hour. We need to not rely on those tips; we need to rely on a liveable wage.

Chuekong Pheng Xiong: I am a Johnson High School student. I am here to support \$15/hour minimum wage. My supervisor asked me what would be the consequences for our non-profit organization. Even if my job doesn't exist anymore, this is something I care about more than my job. Our parents want us to live better than them and I know we can do better than they imagine. We are here to support our families, to pay for our own projects and to save up for college. We want to change the minimum wage. Change is invaluable; growth is optional.

Kip Hedge: I live in Minneapolis; I work in St Paul. I've been a laborer all my life. I got involved in the \$15 due to seeing coworkers crushed, day in and day out by poverty, by having to work two and three jobs, coming in to work falling asleep, not being able to do what they were supposed to do and then having to go to another job. And then work at a restaurant or someplace else during the weekend. I urge you to deal with facts. There's a narrative created by the beverage association, the restaurant association, the hospitality association and it's repeated over and over and over and over again, similar to saying the earth is flat enough times so that it will one day be true. The story is that businesses will shut down, they will move and the people you are trying to help will be hurt by this measure. None of this is true. There is no credible study anywhere in the United States that backs those kind of facts up. It's just not true. States without a tip penalty do not have a lower rate of tipping. They don't have a higher rate of restaurant closure. We've sent those studies to you, please read them. Minnesota raised the state minimum wage at a same rate as what is proposed now. During that time, Minnesota was doing pretty good. Wisconsin is not doing so good. Restaurants are opening; the food service is doing fine. Tips are not going down. Minneapolis and now St Paul are starting to be destination high end restaurants. I think it's a sound policy. Thank you.

Angela Marlow, Minnesota Licensed Beverage Association: At a City level, tip credit does not ever make a subservient wage; it's an exemption that says let every server and bartender in a full-service restaurant, which is not The Buttered Tin so she doesn't have to take advantage of tip credit, let them go at the same track as everybody else at the state. There is a COLA at the state; you're never going to get stuck at \$2.13. They're never going to go below \$9.65 or \$9.72 or whatever the minimum wage is because there is state laws and we have to abide by those. Nobody is asking for a subservient wage. We aren't asking for baristas, coffee shops, cafeteria-style restaurants, to be part of that program. Our business owners are willing to have the exemption, apply for it, follow the labor laws in order to get that exception. They are willing to pay an application fee, which will help pay for enforcement. We would love everybody in the world to make \$100/hour. Unfortunately, the money has to come from somewhere. There is evidence that full-service restaurants and bars sit between a 2 and 10% profit. That's a fact. While big corporations need to be addressed, we need to make a separation between what is a small, local business and what is a large corporation. Coming from an immigrant background myself, I know that when an immigrant doesn't speak the language, the easiest way for them to build generational wealth is to do it through entrepreneurship. So, if we are concerned about empowering people of color, we really need to have these carve-outs.

Douglas Swalboski, business owner, Culvers on 2605 Hudson Rd: I have operated my restaurant for 16 years. I currently have 40 employees. I love being part of the East Side because I have the freedom and the ability to give back to the community, not only hiring workers directly from the community and teaching them hospitality and many basic job skills, but also I've been able to help many organizations over the years with cash and food donations. I am also a member of the Minnesota Restaurant Association and they have submitted a letter that I would appreciate that you consider. My wife and I are the property owners and my son and I operate the business, so we truly are a small, family-run business even though it's a franchise with other locations. Many other Culver locations are exactly that; they are run by the family. My son and I, my wife, we make all the decisions related to the restaurant, maintenance, marketing, human resources, including pay and benefits for the team members. Currently, I have five team members with disabilities, 22 members who are 18 years and under, for many of them it's their first job and I am teaching them job basics. I only have 10 team members that are 18 and older. As you can see, 75% of my workforce is disabled and young adults. That is the generation I am concerned about. I am not opposed to a minimum wage increase, but it will affect that segment of the population because restaurants like himself will be forced to hire more experienced help instead of hiring people with disabilities and under the age of 18. Please protect them and keep them in mind as you go to vote. I know you will do the right thing.

Bob Brick, President of Allied People Solutions: I represent a private non-profit corporation that has been doing business in the City for 53 years. Allied provides life skills training skills to people who have intellectual disabilities and mental health disabilities. Allied ensures that all of its program participants who work earn minimum to prevailing wages, rather than a Department of Labor sanctioned minimum wage. I had the honor to be a member of the Study Committee and was very impressed with the process, the League staff leaders, the co-chairs, along with the other committee members. One of the recommendations was to provide an exception to a small number of people with disabilities who receive licensed employment services to obtain and to keep their jobs while earning the state minimum to prevailing wage. Without that exception, we are concerned that the unintended consequence is that people with disabilities will be among the first to lose jobs or have hours reduced as the ordinance is implemented. Our program participants have experienced that as minimum wage has

increased. The City of Minneapolis has such an exception, but our analysis is that it needs to be tweaked to include this group of people. We offer our expertise and technical knowledge in crafting the language to ensure that the exception is limited and targeted to the appropriate people.

Jamie Thompson, St Paul West Side: I work at W.A. Frost. I am in support of tip credit. I've worked in small restaurants, medium sized, and now have worked my way up to this level with hard work. I also work a full time \$15/hr job and it's not enough. I am a single mom; I have a three-year-old. I get no child support, no support from that system but we are not here to talk about that. It's important to remember with the tip credit, there is a default, that, if you have a bad night and you're not making the tips you need, you are still going to make your \$15/hour. We can't lose sight of the fact that that is in place and will support all of us. We have to remember the study has shown there will be a decrease, without the tip credit, in wages. I can't afford to lose 20%; I am barely covering my bills right now. I need to continue to maintain, if not continue to keep this as a part-time job. I'm not going to be able to find another job that's going to pay me \$30/hour, busting my butt on the weekends, and find someone to watch her. I'm lucky; on weekends, I have that help. But I miss the time with her. \$15 clearly isn't enough because I'm working two jobs. I need the community to understand this: single moms are the majority of the people who are in these jobs. We need this money to maintain our households and they've got the variants of times, shifts. There's no other part-time jobs where you can make this much money.

Luke Janssen, Minneapolis: I work in the St Paul Public Schools for less than \$15/hour. I believe all employers have a responsibility to pay a living wage, at least \$15. I think it's particularly wrong that schools, with their commitment to strengthening community, are not delivering and paying their employees a living wage at this time. I've also been a tipped worker in Minneapolis and St Paul. Tips are not something you can count on. Some days, you might get no tips. That's why I support one fair wage because workers in St Paul need a living wage they can count on, not the precarious relying on tips.

Gertrude Googs Mingo, Macalester/Groveland: My husband and I have lived in St Paul for 60 years and voted in all elections except one. We attended all the meetings as observers because we represent thousands and thousands of people just like us who have had a good life in St Paul and try to be good citizens and we all support the \$15 wage with people getting their credit. These people take care of the elderly, they are in our schools, they are in our day cares, they are in our hospitals. The people we love the most are being cared for by people for whom we are asking \$15/hour. Is that too big a deal? Thank you.

Rita [does not want to provide last name]: I work at a local hotel/restaurant downtown. I am a daytime server at a union house, which means that we have a full-time staff day, a full time staff night. There are union contract rules that we need to follow with that. The majority of day workers, like myself, supplement their income with picking up more hours or having second jobs. I'm against the tip penalty, otherwise known as a credit, that other states have. The Twin Cities food scene has begun to rival that of bigger cities such as New York and Chicago in recent years, despite not having a tip penalty which is otherwise referred to as a credit. Wage theft is very prevalent in the restaurant industry. Many front-of-the-house hourly employees being required to work off the clock in order to adequately complete all side work. Servers are historically the punching bag of the industry and this current \$15 minimum wage debate is no different. In a majority of restaurants, servers are required to share their tips even though employers are not supposed to force this process. No server would be able to

hold a job anywhere if they didn't supplement other employees' incomes such as bussers and bartenders. In a union house, like where I work, bussers and bartenders receive annual raises per the union contract. We, as servers, do not. Side by side with someone who has worked there 10 years, as I have, I continue to tip them out while they receive annual increases while I do not and my other servers do not. That is part of the union contract, I know that's not something the Council can vote on. Higher earning servers, cocktail servers and evening servers, which are separate staff, can afford to tip out cooks, washers, and others, which can garnish special favors and enhanced customer experience. Leaving daytime earners without the same type of financial leverage. The fear mongering by the deceptively named Restaurant Workers of America who don't disclose their donors, threatening to take away tipping altogether is reminiscent of how Poppa Johns threatened massive job losses if their employees dared to vote for then candidate Barack Obama.

Valentina McKenzie, fast food worker organizer in St Paul: The American dream is simply not true. I talk to workers every day who work two or three jobs; they work harder than a lot of other people and simply are not being successful. They cannot provide daily essentials for their family and for themselves. Enforcement is being overlooked. The majority of workers I talk to don't know about earned sick and safe time. Simply passing a law is not enough. You have to give people support and fund people to go out there and get that news across. Employers are not letting workers know about their new rights. As you can see, some people don't want to share where they work or their last name. Retaliation is real. Some people can't be here to speak and give their words tonight because of that. Please pass this as soon as possible, people cannot wait. Single parents are working two or three jobs to provide for their kids and who is raising the kids while they are doing that and doing the things that parents should be doing. Carving out youth wages, carving out people with disabilities, seniors, I mean if you are working when you are a senior, it's not because you want to work. You are working because you simply have to work. It's not fun; nobody wants to work the rest of their life.

Alexander Borne, Ward 6 resident: That we are here having conversations about a minimum wage is quite disturbing; we should be talking about a livable wage. \$15 isn't enough. I drive a pickup and \$15 gets me less than a quarter tank of gas. Councilmember Prince stated she needed additional time to seek public input from micro-business owners. Frankly, how much time do we need? We gotta get after this. I ask the Council to move this forward so we are back in the future asking for a liveable wage. Residents in my district and in your districts have been struggling for a really long time and quite frankly we feel abandoned. I feel the Council is doubling down and perpetuating a lot of the things that we know exist by arguing whether we are going to pay these people a higher wage. I think it's right that people receive a fair rate of pay.

Aleydis Valdonnos, formerly resident of Lilydale and now in Minneapolis: I work every day in St Paul and the same as my co-worker, Valentina, I hear from people that suffer from retaliation, suffer from poverty, and live under the stresses of trying to survive and it's hard. Before, I was a paid organizer, I cleaned ceilings for eight years. It's difficult to live under sexual harassment everyday just trying to make a living. Youth are experiencing that at a younger age. Corporations are making them feed us, clean us, take care of us, and we are not taking care of them. I am asking you, as a City, to take care of your workers. Leaving school to go to work, then back to school, then back to work. It's stressful and super painful to see. Kids don't even know their representative, not the process of what this law is. We hope the work we have done in St Paul is reflected in your actions.

John Rupp, Cathedral Hill: As restaurant owner in business for 43 years, I've served somewhere between 7 and 10 million people, hired thousands of employees; I presently have almost 450 employees. I worry that what's being discussed tonight will create an environment that's going to decrease the full service tipped segment of the industry which pays between two and three times the minimum wage. That portion is already declining. Many of our new businesses are food halls or counter service restaurants as restaurateurs operate under extremely thin margins. The percentage of full-service restaurants in the industry is declining. If we don't get a tip credit, we will see closing of additional full-service restaurants who are paying, in our case, at least three times the minimum wage. They are going to be replaced with counter service restaurants. We will still have the restaurant industry but it's going to be with lower wages. We had plans, my family, to open additional businesses but we will no longer be able to offer restaurants in which there are employees in which we have to pay high minimum wages who are already being compensated handsomely on tips. Preserve high paying segment by allowing full-service restaurants to have a tip credit.

Abben Zackerman, West 7th: I work in Midway. I completely support \$15 wage for all workers in St Paul with no exemptions. It is the only option for workers in St Paul. For me, it would mean a more financially stable life. I could afford the increasing costs of living and begin paying off my student loans. It's up to restaurant owners to account for the cost of living in their costs, just as they would account for the rise of rents and ingredients. Those in favor of a tip penalty will say the industry won't survive. But as wages have gone up in the last few years, our industry has boomed. They will say they represent workers, but they don't. They represent the greed of lobbyists and the fear of misinformation. These are the same people who were against sick leave and who have fought worker's empowerment at every turn. Studies by the Department of Labor show that the restaurant industry has the most wage theft and the most reports of sexual harassment out of any labor in the US. While some servers claim they make \$26/hour, good for you, we need to protect the average and the lower earning servers who don't make as much. I work at a small business where I don't make that much in tips. I choose to continue working there because I know my manager and co-workers will protect me. A tip penalty is notoriously hard to enforce. It would disempower workers by making them rely on their tips just as depending on our tips disempowers us now. While \$15/hour will not solve all our problems, especially the ones female servers like me face, depending on tips reinforces sexual harassment by customers as they know we depend on tipping and may put us in a compromising situation. At least it's a start. I am an unpaid person; I am here because I care, in between the two jobs that I work.

María Vasquez (via a Spanish interpreter): I am here as a member of a Hispanic group that represents people who have suffered wage theft. It doesn't matter the race, the nationality of the person; we come together to support each other. I am a single grandmother. I have three grandkids, one of them is in college. My son was departed. The mother of the children live with us. I've been working as a PCA for 40 years; I think I have some experience in this. In that time, I have never received a sick day, bonus, or annual increase, or extra that comes and we are not allowed to receive anything from our clients. I have two jobs, day and night and I make \$9.65. \$15 would be better, but it is not enough either. It's not sufficient to live with dignity. We are asking and demanding the right to be able to live with dignity. It's not enough to be able to rent an apartment; we have to share an apartment. Just thinking about when you are able to go to the store, what you are able to buy. When I go to the store, I pay the same amount as you all and my wages are like this [hold fingers close together] and my bills are like this [stretches arms wide apart]. It's hard for people to understand that are not living that. We need this money, this raise, so we can have happier families, less separated families, time with the youth. Youth are being abandoned and

are filling emptiness with violence. We can do better than that.

Steven Sufferage: I work at 210 E Lake St McDonalds. I am a member of CTUL here in support of St. Paul workers. I have seen \$15/hour do wonders. I've seen the lights come on in some single parent families, encouraged to start work again, not relying on the welfare system but being able to rely on working for a living. to have the pride, to be a woman, to step up and do the job that some of these men can't do, incarcerated men. \$15/hour, that's nothing. I am struck by the American dream that we have. Dreams don't cost a thing. We are asleep, but when we wake up and turn on the lights, all of a sudden we are having to pay for this dream. Give everybody an equal right to make a liveable wage. I don't like the word "carve-out" for the fact that you are carving something. You carve a turkey that you eat and dispose of. Humans aren't disposable. I am tired of stolen wages. I am tired of these companies who don't want to get into it because maybe they will discover they are doing something wrong.

Cara Peterson, St. Paul Regional Labor Federation: I've had the pleasure of working with tens of thousands of union families for the last 10 years, working for the Labor Federation. I am here in solidarity, asking for \$15, indexed to inflation, opposing a tip penalty, and asking for adequate resources to educate workers and businesses about the ordinance so we can have enforcement and raise standards for workers across our City.

Nelsie Yang, St Paul East Side: I am a candidate for City Council in Ward 6. I am here to speak in full support of one fair minimum wage across the City of St Paul. A \$15 minimum wage, no tip penalty, no exemptions. If you really want to kick it up a notch, you should do what my union did this year when we were at the bargaining table. We were able to settle a 10% raise for workers and when we went back to ask is this going to work for you, people who were depending on public benefits said it doesn't work for us. We gave them the autonomy to opt out of the wage increase. That's what we should be doing, giving the power back to workers. Every worker behind small businesses should be able to earn the income they need to live equitably. Today, I know that money lies in the pockets of corporations. This is a step of our local government holding corporations accountable, making sure they pay a liveable wage to workers who then spend that money in small businesses. I know my family would have a different story to share today if we had equitable wages from the very start. I started working at 14 because I knew I had to work as hard as my parents to get us out of poverty. In an ideal world, my refugee parents' wages would be double what they are today. We wouldn't have lost our home in the 2013 home crisis. My parents came with dreams but corporations like the one they've been working at for 20 years choose to pay them little. Imagine if that was you. These experiences are painful. I've heard a lot of pain today. You all can be the ones to change the story across St Paul.

Eli Edleson-Stein, Minneapolis: I work in St Paul. I am an organizer with the restaurant opportunity center. I am a restaurant worker in full-service restaurants for the past eight years. Denny's is a full-service restaurant and workers are scraping by to make ends meet. W.A. Frost is also a full-service restaurant and there are tipped workers who do not get the same as bartenders and servers who are raking in over \$30/hour. Those are bussers, wait assists, hosts, getting tipped out and qualify as tipped workers. A tip credit would apply to them and make it much harder to stay in this industry. A tip penalty is bad for workers in any form. We know that by looking at places across the country that have that. We see more workers likely to live in poverty and experience sexual harassment and wage theft. A tip penalty is notoriously hard to enforce. In 2014, the Department of Labor did a national sweep of restaurants and recovered \$50 million in back wages. 10% of those were tip credit infractions. A

well-intentioned, unenforceable policy is as bad as a bad policy. We are seeing misinformation and fear tactics in our industry now. The Restaurant Workers of America appear to support a "better" tip penalty but three months ago they were at the state capitol advocating for an \$8 minimum wage across the board with no index for inflation for all tipped workers across the state. It's disingenuous, because they are talking out of both sides of their mouth. If you pass a tip penalty here, it opens the door for them to say this is what people want. It's not. It's harmful.

Eric Xiong, St Paul East Side: I worked at age 14 for \$5 an hour to pursue my dream. I am handicapped. Tragedy struck and I've never seen a wage above \$15/hour. I am college educated. I asked and asked a higher power. I have not given up, though. My family is a household of four and we don't think time is money. Time is family. Yes, I understand that in this culture, time is money. In mine, time is family. Raises are too low; bring an option, not an opportunity. Opportunity never came. Maybe someday it will. But not today. Today I am counting my blessing. So \$15 now. Wealth plays; riches divide.

John Slade, St Paul East Side: I am the East Side organizer for the Metropolitan Interfaith Council on Affordable Housing. MICAHA has supported minimum wage increases at the state level. We know that affordable housing is how much the housing is and how much you've got in your hand. This is why we support a \$15 minimum wage that is as broad as possible. The housing wage in this town is \$22/hour. That what it takes to get a two-bedroom house in this town. In Dayton's Bluff, where I live, it's \$18/hour because we have cheaper housing. My great grandma was born on a farm in Dayton's Bluff in 1876. I look back and I wonder what it's going to look like in 100 years. I am white, well-educated. I've got all of the bonuses and the silver spoon that she was born with on my side. But when we look at housing here on the East Side, people of color, poor people, new immigrants are getting absolutely the worst deals that they have. It's partially because they don't have the economic power. They have to go to substandard housing because there's no money there. To turn this around, it's important that it happen with no tip credit, no tip penalty, everybody getting \$15. With a three to five-year implementation. Because the rent won't wait. I am proud to stand with this. We are here because there is a worker's movement. There's a movement led by people of color. There's a movement of poor people. Right now you can stand with that movement. I am so proud that I think the City is going to be doing that.

Erica Boyd, West 7th: I am here in support of the \$15 minimum wage with no tip penalty and no carve-outs. Speaking as a person with a disability, I can tell you how expensive it is to have a disability. There are all of the doctor appointments you have to pay for and medications. I'm lucky it's not a physical thing. For people with physical disabilities, it's also technologies like wheelchairs, hearing aids, walkers, things like that. It's really expensive. Paying disabled people less than the set minimum wage would be really hard on them because they already have harder and more expensive lives. It's not fair nor ethical.

Bahieh Hartshorn, Ward 2 West 7th: I organize around the West Side. I have a letter of support from WestCo that I will put into the public record. When we talk about displacement, we talk about how stagnant wages and rising rents, housing costs, causes displacement. To keep our people in our incredibly diverse community, we have over 56% people of color, 53% are housing cost burdened, we need intentional practices and policies that will prevent displacement. That means we need a wage that will support families whether that means \$15/hour or more. We also need stable, safe, dignified, affordable housing. I'm asking you to be bold, I'm asking you to be

courageous here because that's what we did with earned sick and safe time. We have one of the boldest, most courageous policies here. With all the testimony you've heard, this is an opportunity for you to be bold. Systems of oppression that keep our people in poverty are intentional, not by accident. We need intentional practices and policies to repair and dismantle those systems that keep us in poverty. Collective healing can come from intentional policies, such as increasing the minimum wage to \$15 or further.

Kevin Kendrick, Macalester/Groveland: I am here on my own time because I couldn't sleep at night if my boss told me to come tell you my co-workers don't need a raise. I recently left my job at Urban Growler brewery in St Paul as a cook. I didn't want to leave because St Paul is my home; I lived there my entire life and I went to school there. But wages are higher in Minneapolis and I just had to go there. I went to school at St Paul Central and learned from a lot of fine math educators. In those classes, I would naturally draw the conclusion that higher wages, in addition to tips, would still equal higher take-home pay. I don't know about you, but that seems to make sense to me. I don't know what they teach in Inver Grove Heights. [laughter from audience] A specific example of why tipped workers can't be left behind: at Urban Growler, with increased sales and expansion in their business, they changed their format to more counter-service oriented and I saw my co-workers working the same hours, the same shifts, taking home half the amount of pay, taking on a second job to pay rent. I won't let the Minnesota Restaurant Association or any of those lobbyist groups divide back of house workers against front of house workers. We are part of the same team; we all deserve \$15 with no carve outs. We need it now and we should be leading the nation in this, not following cities like Minneapolis.

Kevin Osborne, East Side: Line cooks [motions to previous speaker], we're similar. I also work in the back of the house. I grew up in St Paul. Since I was 17, I have worked as a busser, dishwasher, prep cook, line cook, sous chef, head chef, the whole gamut. I work in Minneapolis, despite living in St Paul. I am also here to lambaste the tip penalty. I guess I took the same math class because I don't get it. I'm not going to call it an adjustment because this false sense of neutrality is a joke. It's basic math, as he pointed out. Let's call it what it really is and it is to defy the workers. That's what makes it truly offensive. On one hand, we've got 2000 signatures sitting here in a box and a room full of very pissed off people making not enough to live. On the other hand, we have the restaurant owners, not all of them, as Buttered Tin pointed out, and the Restaurant Association, RWA, the Food and Beverage Association. What are these exemptions for, what is all this for? It's to make it more palatable. Because on the one hand, you've got 2000 people railing and on the other hand, business owners that simply don't want to pay a living wage. It's propaganda! I've been the head chef; I've worked the books. If you make a 2% annual profit, you are going out of business no matter what the minimum wage is. Let's talk about basic variable food costs and labor costs. A good restaurant, fine food, is going to run between 40 and 60% variable costs. That leaves anywhere from 60 to 40% for fixed costs. If a few dollars and hour is going to make you go out of business, your whole business model is corrupt anyway. There's no hope. Let's just get over this idea that all these exemptions are here to protect the workers. The jobs are going away if you can't run a successful business. And you still need groceries, even if you work for an unsuccessful business.

Brady Bussman, Minneapolis: I live and work in Minneapolis. I spent about 10 years as a tipped employee. I feel what you guys are talking about; you rely on your tips and you can't rely on your tips all the time, either. Good points made. I am here to support \$15 for all workers, no exemptions, no tip penalty, no slow phasing. Fortune 500 companies

like EcoLab and Securian were the recent recipients of an unprecedented tax cut, some receiving up to 40% cut in their effective tax rate. This is in addition to record profits in the last few years. Since 2011, EcoLab has doubled their profits. These companies have plenty of money as evidenced by their recent annual reports. They can pay their own employees \$15 immediately and they are also able to help subsidize small businesses that are less able to absorb the costs of paying their employees \$15/hour. I think we should call on larger employers in St Paul to pay more in taxes to subsidize the wage increase for smaller businesses. Multiple studies show the average person needs more than \$15/hour to be able to cover all their bills, including things like healthcare, and still be able to handle a \$400 emergency. By not implementing a \$15 minimum wage, we would be saying we are OK with a large amount of people not having what they need to get by and live with dignity. What I really think is that we need a livable wage, but where we are at in the conversation we need to find out through studies that have been done and continue to be done, what is a liveable wage, pin our minimum wage at that and re-evaluate every three years, continuing to increase it as the economy changes.

Toa Xiong: Ever since my release from prison, November 2016, I've been a volunteer community organizer, full time. I'm from the north end of St Paul. I just want to talk about poverty. Poverty is when two black parents are working at minimum wage and then the teenager goes and steals stuff in the alley, inside somebody's car so he could buy diapers for his little sister but then he was caught on a security camera and all the white people in my neighborhood is calling him a criminal. No, I'm not snitching, officer [gestures off camera]. Poverty is when legal immigrants or refugees are working 14-hour days, seven days a week at a vegetable farm, but then when you go to Cub Foods, you see them tell you "Minnesota grown." That's poverty, man. Poverty is when you are a non-citizen and an ex-felon at the same time. And your mom uses her social security check so you can go to Chicago for community leadership training. That's poverty, man. Poverty is when you secretly borrowed money from an elected official so your family would have car insurance for this month. That's poverty, man. Poverty is when you ride your bike into the North End at 10PM and homeless kids of color are asking you for change. You tell them no because that's the truth. That's poverty, man. Poverty is when they try to make the place more beautiful but 36% of the people in my 'hood are financially struggling. That's poverty, man. Poverty is when a 17-year-old is working til 1AM then coming back into my neighborhood and getting racially targeted by the police because somebody called and believed he was a crack dealer. That's poverty, man. My name is Toa Xiong and I represent the City of St Poverty.

Jessa Manthe, Summit Hill: I work in St Paul. After working nearly a decade in the retail industry, an industry notorious for paying unlivable wages, that's brought me into the fight for \$15 in St Paul. I have experienced the oppression of trying to survive on poverty wages. I want to echo the previous statements made about enforcement and how important that is. We need to not only raise the wage but ensure that workers are actually experiencing that wage increase. Carve-outs and exemptions just make that unnecessarily challenging. I would also like to echo the point about slow phase in. \$15 is a long past number. Anyone making \$15 knows we need it right now. At this point it's clear: people earn \$15 with no carve-outs; the study supports \$15; and the facts support \$15. There really is no reason for delay. It's time to pass \$15 in St Paul now for retail workers, for tipped workers, for youth workers, for municipal workers, for all workers.

Isaac Milcke: I work two part-time jobs that both pay less than \$15. I assure you, they could both pay me more if they wanted to. It's not like they have unlimited money but they could just like, pay me more. The owners are making the money. Not me. One

thing someone said earlier that's very important. All of us in this room making less than \$15, we are doing the most important, most honorable, the noble jobs in the City. The people at 3M and Ecolab, they are doing the important jobs in the City. It's like people working in public schools and hospitals. I hope you all understand that. There's a very clear public mandate for \$15 minimum wage with no tip penalties. I have no idea why you guys are taking so long. If you want to lose your seat, you are doing a great job.

Anne Marie: I am a small business owner in St Paul. I own a full-service restaurant and we have been open just under two years. I want to ask you to please consider the effect of the \$15 minimum wage on small businesses.

Council President Brendmoen: There's no #52, right? Comments from Council members? Ms. Jalali Nelson.

Councilmember Jalali Nelson: Thanks so much everybody. I am just really feeling the length of time we've been sitting here. I am Ward 4 City Council member. I want to express my gratitude to everyone who was here tonight to give your opinion. To the staff of the Citizens League and everyone who participated in that process. I think it is clear tonight we have a wealth of data and a wealth of community passion. I am excited about crafting an ordinance that makes sense for our City. I think we have a real opportunity to take all the information that we have and all the momentum and keep moving our city forward. We have an opportunity to protect some of our workers who are facing some of the most volatility in their industries and in the housing market at the same time by raising their wages, making sure we understand the connection between this issue and the issue of trying to pay the rising rents. I am excited about the opportunity of how we can give deeper support to micro-businesses and to small businesses and some of the groups people have named. I think bringing some of those concerns to the table is an opportunity to craft an ordinance that going to include supports for them as a Council. So I think that's an exciting this to be part of. I want to speak to one element I heard over and over which is that I appreciate folks indicating whether or not they are here in a volunteer capacity. I really think that when we talk about fair wages and a dignified economy, we just need to respect organizers who are a part of the economy and who deserve fair wages, too. I was myself an organizer; I fought for thousands of dollars of public resources while being paid very little to be doing that work so I appreciate the organizers being here in addition to everyone who came and gave testimony in an unpaid capacity. I think that's an important piece to keep in mind. Part of having low wage jobs is that it leads to political exclusion. It leads to people who couldn't be here tonight because they are working the longest hours. Where they are getting punished for not having those wages is in having to use their time. I want to name that as a group that wasn't here tonight and that is symptomatic of the thing we are trying to solve. To everyone who is here, thank you. And to City staff and everyone who stayed late, thank you. This is a great process to be a part of.

Council President Brendmoen: Ms. Prince.

Councilmember Prince: I want to make a point which a few of you made, which I really appreciate, which is at the same time you're pushing us on the minimum wage which is a great development going forward, please also help us, support us, in increasing the supply of affordable housing in St Paul. We had a discussion earlier today about our housing agenda for this year. It's really critical that, at the same time that we're doing this, that we increase the supply of housing for people who are working at the \$15 minimum wage level and below because that is a supply of housing that is, as you

have stated, inadequate. There's pretty much a zero percent vacancy rate. Thank you to all for being here and thanks to those who are pushing us on the housing supply which is a core mission of our City.

Council President Brendmoen: To close, we hear: "our rent is going up but our wages aren't going up; the cost of food is going up but our wages aren't going up; our taxes are going up but our wages aren't going up." We are deep in budget season and we are working hard to contain our costs here in the City but we are here tonight because we are committed to changing the other side of the equation as well. We want to see wages go up. This is a perfect time tonight to hear from all of you with our recommendations from the Citizen's League because we are now moving forward to the policy part of this. We will have this concluded by the end of the year. My request is that you stay engaged in these final months as we conclude this process so we can all dig in together and get this thing done. Thank you so much for being here. We are going to adjourn.

Received and filed

ADJOURNMENT

Council President Brendmoen adjourned the meeting.

Meeting adjourned at 8:13 p.m.

Council Meeting Information

The City Council is paperless which saves the environment and reduces expenses. The agendas and Council files are all available on the Web (see below). Council members use iPads to review the files during the meeting. Using the iPad greatly reduces costs since most agendas, including the documents attached to files, are over 1000 pages when printed.

Web

Meetings are available on the Council's website. Email notification and web feeds (RSS) of newly released minutes, agendas, and meetings are available by subscription. Visit www.stpaul.gov/council for meeting videos and updated copies of the agendas, minutes, and supporting documents.

Cable

Meetings are live on St Paul Channel 18 and replayed on Thursdays at 5:30 p.m., Saturdays at 12:30 p.m., and Sundays at 1:00 p.m. (Subject to change)

Many people are extremely sensitive to scented products. Please refrain from wearing or using fragrances such as perfumes, lotions, aftershave, scented aerosol products, and other such products.