

-----Original Message-----

From: A Chase Turner [<mailto:chase@stumpy.com>]

Sent: Wednesday, March 28, 2018 10:11 AM

To: #CI-StPaul_Ward4 <Ward4@ci.stpaul.mn.us>

Subject: Homeowner at 1902 Carroll Ave - approves 9 month moratorium

Councilmember Henningson,

I am in receipt of your communication concerning the proposed 9 month moratorium — see attached PDF.

Due to a previous commitment, I am unable to attend tonight's meeting at Merriam Park Library to express my direct support of the 9 month moratorium affecting my property.

My reasoning in supporting the 9 month moratorium is that these historic structures — such as my house at 1902 Carroll Ave — are unique in the St. Paul landscape and history. Indeed, in the early 1990s, my home had been slated for destruction but the City of St. Paul thankfully offered to pause that process in favor of a more novel solution to re-invest in keeping the structure — for which I am the third home owner to occupy the positive outcome of that inspired decision.

I firmly believe the City of St. Paul must be accorded the opportunity to review and assess the current and potentially additional historic homes in Merriam Park — before there are further changes to their status.

Yours truly,

A. Chase Turner
1902 Carroll Ave
St. Paul MN 55104

Dear Councilmember Henningson,

I am writing I support of the historic study of Merriam Park and the temporary moratorium on demolitions and lot splits for the 46 properties originally surveyed in 1981 in the Merriam Park neighborhood. This is important as a temporary measure until the historic value of these properties can be studied.

Let's not be short-sighted. The thing that sets St. Paul apart from Minneapolis and many other cities is its historic charm. Once a historic home is gone, that gem can never be replaced. Historic homes are important to the fabric of St. Paul.

Property values increase in historic districts (see the attached graph.)

There are still many options for historic properties after the temporary moratorium is over. Let's just give a little time for the process to work.

Thank you,
 Meg Arnosti
 1722 Princeton Avenue
 St. Paul, MN 55105

Table 1. Property Values* in Designated Historic Districts Compared to Similar Undesignated Neighborhoods in the Same Communities

| Study Area | Data Interval | Ave. Value Difference (%) | Annual Rate (%) | Reference |
|------------------|---------------|---------------------------|-----------------|-----------------------------|
| Athens, GA | 1976-1996 | +14 | +7 | Leithe and Tigue 1999 |
| Denver, CO | 1993-2000 | +3-6 | +4-1.2 | Clarion Assoc. of CO 2002 |
| Durango, CO | 1993-2000 | +7 | +1 | Clarion Assoc. of CO 2002 |
| Galveston, TX | 1975-1991 | +85-360 | +5.3-22.5 | Govt. Fin. Res. Center 1991 |
| Memphis, TN | 1998-2002 | +14-23 | +3.5-5.7 | Coulson and Lahr 2005 |
| Mesa, AZ | 1997-2004 | +26 | +3.7 | Bellavia 2007 |
| New Jersey | ? | +5 | — | New Jersey Hist. Trust 1997 |
| New York, NY | 1975-2002 | +13 | +5 | NYC Ind. Budget Office 2003 |
| Phoenix, AZ | 2005 | +31 | — | Poppen 2007 |
| Rome, GA | 1980-1996 | +10 | +6 | Leithe and Tigue 1999 |
| San Diego, CA | 2000-2005 | +16 | +3.2 | Narwold 2006 |
| Savannah, GA | 1974-1997 | +264-588 | +11.5-25.6 | Leithe and Tigue 1999 |
| Texas (9 cities) | (variable) | +5-20 | — | Leichenko et al. 2001 |
| Tifton, GA | 1983-1996 | +2 | +2 | Leithe and Tigue 1999 |
| Tucson, AZ | 1987-2007 | +15 | +7 | L'Orange 2007 |

* Phoenix and Mesa studies used sales values; all other studies used assessed values.

From: Sarah Robinson [<mailto:mrssrobinson@mac.com>]
Sent: Friday, March 30, 2018 10:29 AM
To: #CI-StPaul_Ward6
Subject: In Favor of 9-Month Moratorium

Dear Councilmember Bostrom,

I am writing in favor of the City Council's proposed 9-month interim protections to stop demolitions of the 41 historic Merriam Park structures designated as historic and special during the City's 1981 historic resource survey. I believe it is critical to keep these structures safe while the Heritage Preservation division completes a renewed and updated historic resource survey this year for **all** Merriam Park buildings.

Thank you for your time and consideration,

Sarah Robinson
1883 Iglehart Avenue
Saint Paul MN 55104

From: Stefan Plambeck [<mailto:stefplam@gmail.com>]
Sent: Friday, March 30, 2018 10:46 AM
To: #CI-StPaul_Ward6
Subject: Merriam Park Demolition Ordinance- I ask for your support

Dear Councilmember Bostrom-

I would like to thank Councilmember Samantha Henningson for sponsoring the proposed interim ordinance (moratorium) to temporarily stop Merriam Park historic home demolitions and lot splits for the next 9 months, while the renewed Heritage Preservation Commission ("HPC") survey of all historic Merriam Park properties is underway. I support this interim ordinance because:

- Historic homes in Merriam Park are actively being targeted for teardowns by developers and realtors to build new apartment buildings and poorly constructed new homes in their place, forever changing the character of historic neighborhoods. Historic neighborhoods and homes are some of Saint Paul's most important assets and are what attract many new residents to St. Paul; these historic resources are a defining characteristic of the City.
- **Not a hardship:** Interim ordinance is only a 9-month temporary limitation on 46 properties previously surveyed and deemed historically special in 1981, while the updated HPC study is underway this year for **all** MP properties, so that everyone can take a breath and see what still exists and is historically important before structures are torn down and gone forever:
 - In addition to these 46 properties, HPC will conduct an historic resource survey of **all** Merriam Park buildings this year. However, this interim ordinance will only affect the 46 properties surveyed in 1981.
 - If it occurs, historic designation of Merriam Park buildings will only guide improvements to a structure's exterior, with no limitations placed on interior refurbishments.
- I am not suggesting all things historic need to be frozen in time, but we should evaluate these important St. Paul assets very carefully and thoughtfully, before we start demolishing significant homes

that would then be gone forever. These homes have been in place for over 100 years, so it seems entirely reasonable we would take a little extra time to re-evaluate their significance.

- Redevelopment is valuable and essential for neighborhood vitality and to accommodate the City's increased housing and transit access needs and changing demographics, but let's be smart about it: it must be managed with the expertise and oversight of HPC and City planning.

- Many former single-family homes in Merriam Park have already been converted to student housing, multi-family rentals, sober housing, and other great adaptive uses, and we have welcomed these adaptive uses and increased density. These are much more environmentally friendly than tearing down existing homes and then building something new, often of inferior quality.

Thank you for your time and attention to this matter. I ask that you support this interim ordinance.

Stefan Plambeck
2006 Marshall Avenue