| From: | Erika Ronnow |
| :--- | :--- |
| To: | Sonia Romero |
| Subject: | Re: 549-1 Dayton Appeal of Erika Ronnow |
| Date: | Monday, July 10, 2023 5:59:18 PM |

## Think Before You Click: This email originated outside our organization.

Hi Sonia,<br>Thank you for your quick reply. I'm glad I asked!<br>Peace, Erika

```
On Jul 10, 2023, at 4:05 PM, Sonia Romero <Sonia.Romero@ci.stpaul.mn.us>
wrote:
HI Erika,
Its best not. We will have time for that discussion on the hearing date.
Thank you,
Sonia
```

From: Erika Ronnow [eronnow@yahoo.com](mailto:eronnow@yahoo.com)
Sent: Friday, July 7, 2023 7:59 PM
To: Christine Carragee [christine@carragee.com](mailto:christine@carragee.com)
Cc: *CI-StPaul_RentAppeals [RentAppeals@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:RentAppeals@ci.stpaul.mn.us); Demetrius Sass
[Demetrius.Sass@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:Demetrius.Sass@ci.stpaul.mn.us); Lynne Ferkinhoff
[Lynne.Ferkinhoff@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:Lynne.Ferkinhoff@ci.stpaul.mn.us); Angie Wiese [angie.wiese@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:angie.wiese@ci.stpaul.mn.us); Mai
Vang [mai.vang@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:mai.vang@ci.stpaul.mn.us)
Subject: Re: 549-1 Dayton Appeal of Erika Ronnow

Hello Sonia. I have a protocol question. Is this the appropriate time/platform to use to respond to the context and items referenced in this email from Christine?

Also, is there a deadline or preferred timing for me to provide feedback on the summary provided?

Please let me know.

Peace, Erika

On Jul 6, 2023, at 10:47 AM, Christine Carragee
[christine@carragee.com](mailto:christine@carragee.com) wrote:

Ms. Romero,

Is there any means of changing the amount of rent increase I am
requesting through the appeals process to be equal to the full amount calculated in the MNOI? The only reason I submitted an increase for $8 \%$ instead of $15.86 \%$ was to minimize the administrative burden of compliance with the process by staying under the self-certification limit. Now that I'm being required to produce extensive documentation I would like to seek the maximum allowable rent increase of $\$ 293.41 /$ month.

Attached is the MNOI form I submitted at the time of the rent increase request. Its quite difficult to type anything meaningful into that format so below is a fuller account of the major change in finances associated with 549 Dayton- 1.

In the summer of 2020 I bought 549 Dayton Ave and lived in the $2^{\text {nd }}$ and $3^{\text {rd }}$ floors. As an owner occupant we had lower insurance and maintenance costs and I performed all of the bookkeeping, lawncare and snow removal and many of the repairs and all of the management without pay. When my daughter's dad took a job in California I initially asked a friend to move into the $3^{\text {rd }}$ floor as a roommate agreement, and then eventually moved to California myself with the intention of keeping access to housing in the St Paul for maintenance trips and our eventual move home.

In Jan 2022 I hired Starmax property management to take over many of the responsibilies I had been doing prior to the move. This management company charged $7 \%$ of gross rents plus additional fees for any services beyond rent collection and bookkeeping. In Oct 2022 I fired Starmax for mismanagement and resumed that responsibility.

Erika Ronnow moved into 549-1 Dayton Ave in June of 2021 and originally rented just the first floor apartment. When I moved out she began also renting the large garage for $\$ 100 /$ month. Since the time Ms. Ronnow moved into the house increases in to cost utilities and property taxes have been much higher than historical averages accounted for when the lease was signed. Additionally, the following major expenses and upgrades have occurred in direct benefit to the tenant:

- Capital Expenses \& Major Repairs
- Tree damages (A tree limb fell on the electrical lines attached to the house and damaged parts of the garage Emergency electrician restored power to the property, the limb was removed and then subsequently the tree on the property line with the neighbor was removed and the electrical service was upgraded to 100 amp to meet the current code requirements)
- Flatroof and skylight replacement due to water damage
- Boiler system repaired - Boehm \& McQuillan both hired to
repair, supplemental heaters provided for Unit 1 and $\$ 150$ payment for increased electrical costs while repairs were ongoing. There is a strong possibility this system will need to be entirely replaced in the next year.
- Replacement of all fire extinguishers \& smoke alarms
- Common Area Improvements
- Second Washer and Dryer installed in basement for tenant use - including gas line and dryer venting
- Basement wash basin/sink replaced
- Basement waterproofing treatment (~\$8000k)
- Foundation tuckpoint
- Snow removal \& lawn services hired
- \$1000 quarterly waterbill for an unreported leak (normally ~\$300)
- Unit 1 Improvements
- Curtain rods hung (tenant request)
- Side Porch foundation repairs - (in response to tenant complaint about rodents)
- Kitchen renovation in Unit 1
- New countertops
- New microwave
- New sink and faucet (tenant request)
- Tile backsplash installed
- Under the counter dishwasher installed to replace the portable dishwasher (tenant request)
- New refrigerator (tenant request)
- Cabinets painted and trim installed
- Bathroom
- New blinds installed - (tenant request)
- sink and vanity installed - (tenant request)
- Front and side porch painted and repaired
- Window AC unit

Please note that Ms. Ronnow would "simply prefer" to pay a lesser rent increase percentage, but that she is not contesting the fact that the cost of ownership has dramatically increased and that she has directly benefitted from the diligent maintenance and upgrades of her unit and the property as whole.

The administrative burden of complying with this process as well as the mortgage interest which is an undeniable cost of ownership but is explicitly EXCLUDED from the city template should be accounted for in the definition of "fair return on investment".

Christine Carragee
JMC Properties LLC

From: *CI-StPaul_RentAppeals
Sent: Friday, June 30, 2023 12:43 PM
To: christine@carragee.com
Cc: eronnow@yahoo.com; Demetrius Sass; Lynne Ferkinhoff; Angie Wiese; Mai Vang
Subject: Appeal of Erika Rannow

Good Afternoon Ms. Carragee ,
Attached is the notification of a Legislative Hearing to consider the appeal of Erika Ronnow rent increase at 549 Dayton Ave, Unit 1.

As indicated in my letter, the hearing is scheduled for July 27, 2023 at 10 am . Also, we would like a copy of the MNOI sent to us by the end of the day July $17^{\text {th }}$.

For your reference, I have also attached Ms. Ronnow's appeal form.
Please reach out to me with any questions.
Best,

| <image001.png> | Sonia Romero <br> Executive Assistant <br>  <br> Pronouns: she/her |
| :--- | :--- |
|  | Saint Paul City Council |
|  | 320 City Hall, 15 W.Kellogg Blvd. |
|  | Saint Paall, MN 55102 |
|  | P651-266-8568 |
|  | Sonia.romero@ci.stpaul.mn.us |
|  | www.StPaul.gov |

<Rent Increase 549 Dayton Ave 1 July 2023.pdf><image001.png>

| From: | Sonia Romero |
| :--- | :--- |
| To: | Christine Carragee |
| Subject: | RE: 549-1 Dayton Appeal of Erika Ronnow |
| Date: | Monday, July 10, 2023 4:07:00 PM |
| Attachments: | imaqe001.png |

Hi Ms. Carragee,
Thank you for your email. If you would like to do that you would have to contact the DSI Rent Stabilization department.
Email: rent-stabilization@ci.stpaul.mn.us
Phone: 651-266-8553

Best,
Sonia Romero

From: Christine Carragee [christine@carragee.com](mailto:christine@carragee.com)
Sent: Thursday, July 6, 2023 10:48 AM
To: *CI-StPaul_RentAppeals [RentAppeals@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:RentAppeals@ci.stpaul.mn.us)
Cc: eronnow@yahoo.com; Demetrius Sass [Demetrius.Sass@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:Demetrius.Sass@ci.stpaul.mn.us); Lynne Ferkinhoff [Lynne.Ferkinhoff@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:Lynne.Ferkinhoff@ci.stpaul.mn.us); Angie Wiese [angie.wiese@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:angie.wiese@ci.stpaul.mn.us); Mai Vang [mai.vang@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:mai.vang@ci.stpaul.mn.us)
Subject: RE: 549-1 Dayton Appeal of Erika Ronnow

Ms. Romero,

Is there any means of changing the amount of rent increase I am requesting through the appeals process to be equal to the full amount calculated in the MNOI? The only reason I submitted an increase for $8 \%$ instead of $15.86 \%$ was to minimize the administrative burden of compliance with the process by staying under the self-certification limit. Now that I'm being required to produce extensive documentation I would like to seek the maximum allowable rent increase of \$293.41/month.

Attached is the MNOI form I submitted at the time of the rent increase request. Its quite difficult to type anything meaningful into that format so below is a fuller account of the major change in finances associated with 549 Dayton- 1.

In the summer of 2020 I bought 549 Dayton Ave and lived in the $2^{\text {nd }}$ and $3^{\text {rd }}$ floors. As an owner occupant we had lower insurance and maintenance costs and I performed all of the bookkeeping, lawncare and snow removal and many of the repairs and all of the management without pay. When my daughter's dad took a job in California I initially asked a friend to move into the $3^{\text {rd }}$ floor as a roommate agreement, and then eventually moved to California myself with the intention of keeping access to housing in the St Paul for maintenance trips and our eventual move home.

In Jan 2022 I hired Starmax property management to take over many of the responsibilies I had been doing prior to the move. This management company charged $7 \%$ of gross rents plus additional fees for any services beyond rent collection and bookkeeping. In Oct 2022 I fired Starmax for
mismanagement and resumed that responsibility.

Erika Ronnow moved into 549-1 Dayton Ave in June of 2021 and originally rented just the first floor apartment. When I moved out she began also renting the large garage for $\$ 100 /$ month. Since the time Ms. Ronnow moved into the house increases in to cost utilities and property taxes have been much higher than historical averages accounted for when the lease was signed. Additionally, the following major expenses and upgrades have occurred in direct benefit to the tenant:

- Capital Expenses \& Major Repairs
- Tree damages (A tree limb fell on the electrical lines attached to the house and damaged parts of the garage - Emergency electrician restored power to the property, the limb was removed and then subsequently the tree on the property line with the neighbor was removed and the electrical service was upgraded to 100 amp to meet the current code requirements)
- Flatroof and skylight replacement due to water damage
- Boiler system repaired - Boehm \& McQuillan both hired to repair, supplemental heaters provided for Unit 1 and $\$ 150$ payment for increased electrical costs while repairs were ongoing. There is a strong possibility this system will need to be entirely replaced in the next year.
- Replacement of all fire extinguishers \& smoke alarms
- Common Area Improvements
- Second Washer and Dryer installed in basement for tenant use - including gas line and dryer venting
- Basement wash basin/sink replaced
- Basement waterproofing treatment ( $\sim \$ 8000 \mathrm{k}$ )
- Foundation tuckpoint
- Snow removal \& lawn services hired
- \$1000 quarterly waterbill for an unreported leak (normally ~\$300)
- Unit 1 Improvements
- Curtain rods hung (tenant request)
- Side Porch foundation repairs - (in response to tenant complaint about rodents)
- Kitchen renovation in Unit 1
- New countertops
- New microwave
- New sink and faucet (tenant request)
- Tile backsplash installed
- Under the counter dishwasher installed to replace the portable dishwasher (tenant request)
- New refrigerator (tenant request)
- Cabinets painted and trim installed
- Bathroom
- New blinds installed - (tenant request)
- sink and vanity installed - (tenant request)
- Front and side porch painted and repaired
- Window AC unit

Please note that Ms. Ronnow would "simply prefer" to pay a lesser rent increase percentage, but that she is not contesting the fact that the cost of ownership has dramatically increased and that she has directly benefitted from the diligent maintenance and upgrades of her unit and the property as whole.

The administrative burden of complying with this process as well as the mortgage interest which is an undeniable cost of ownership but is explicitly EXCLUDED from the city template should be accounted for in the definition of "fair return on investment".

Christine Carragee
JMC Properties LLC

From: *Cl-StPaul_RentAppeals
Sent: Friday, June 30, 2023 12:43 PM
To: christine@carragee.com
Cc: eronnow@yahoo.com; Demetrius Sass; Lynne Ferkinhoff; Angie Wiese; Mai Vang
Subject: Appeal of Erika Rannow

Good Afternoon Ms. Carragee ,
Attached is the notification of a Legislative Hearing to consider the appeal of Erika Ronnow rent increase at 549 Dayton Ave, Unit 1.

As indicated in my letter, the hearing is scheduled for July 27, 2023 at 10am. Also, we would like a copy of the MNOI sent to us by the end of the day July $17^{\text {th }}$.

For your reference, I have also attached Ms. Ronnow's appeal form.
Please reach out to me with any questions.
Best,


Sonia Romero<br>Executive Assistant<br>Pronouns: she/her<br>Saint Paul City Council<br>320 City Hall, 15 W.Kellogg Blvd.<br>Saint Paul, MN 55102<br>P 651-266-8568<br>sonia.romero@ci.stpaul.mn.us<br>www.StPaul.gov

